


Fall 2014

# Dreaming Larger Than Life: Perceptions of South African Black Wealth and Aspirations of Success Among Young Adults at Wiggins Secondary School

Mikaela Zetley

*SIT Study Abroad*, mikaelazetley2016@u.northwestern.edu

Follow this and additional works at: [http://digitalcollections.sit.edu/isp\\_collection](http://digitalcollections.sit.edu/isp_collection)

 Part of the [African Studies Commons](#), [Family, Life Course, and Society Commons](#), [Inequality and Stratification Commons](#), [Race and Ethnicity Commons](#), [Social and Cultural Anthropology Commons](#), [Social Psychology and Interaction Commons](#), and the [Sociology of Culture Commons](#)

---

## Recommended Citation

Zetley, Mikaela, "Dreaming Larger Than Life: Perceptions of South African Black Wealth and Aspirations of Success Among Young Adults at Wiggins Secondary School" (2014). *Independent Study Project (ISP) Collection*. Paper 1895.  
[http://digitalcollections.sit.edu/isp\\_collection/1895](http://digitalcollections.sit.edu/isp_collection/1895)

This Unpublished Paper is brought to you for free and open access by the SIT Study Abroad at SIT Digital Collections. It has been accepted for inclusion in Independent Study Project (ISP) Collection by an authorized administrator of SIT Digital Collections. For more information, please contact [digitalcollections@sit.edu](mailto:digitalcollections@sit.edu).

DREAMING LARGER THAN LIFE: PERCEPTIONS OF SOUTH AFRICAN BLACK  
WEALTH AND ASPIRATIONS OF SUCCESS AMONG YOUNG ADULTS AT WIGGINS  
SECONDARY SCHOOL

Mikaela Zetley  
Richard Ballard, Martha Fitzpatrick Bishai, Advisors  
School for International Training  
South Africa: Social and Political Transformation  
Fall 2014

## Table of Contents

<b>I.</b>	<b>Acknowledgements</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>II.</b>	<b>Abstract</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>III.</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>5</b>
	<i>Objectives</i>	5
	<i>Justification</i>	6
<b>IV.</b>	<b>Context</b>	<b>9</b>
<b>V.</b>	<b>Literature Review</b>	<b>11</b>
	<i>Historical Background</i>	11
	<i>The Existence and Influence of Black Wealth</i>	13
	<i>Students: Educations, Environments, and Experiences</i>	18
<b>VI.</b>	<b>Methodology</b>	<b>24</b>
	<i>Ethics</i>	26
<b>VII.</b>	<b>Limitations</b>	<b>28</b>
<b>VIII.</b>	<b>Findings and Analysis</b>	<b>30</b>
	<i>Dreaming Big</i>	31
	<i>Fancy Cars, Big Houses</i>	33
	<i>Living the Perfect Life</i>	36
	<i>Someone to Plant Ideas and Inspirations</i>	40
	<i>Moving on Up- How to Do it?</i>	42
	<i>When “Working Hard” Isn’t Enough</i>	45
<b>IX.</b>	<b>Conclusion</b>	<b>47</b>
<b>X.</b>	<b>Recommendations for Further Study</b>	<b>49</b>
<b>XI.</b>	<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>50</b>
<b>XII.</b>	<b>Appendices</b>	<b>53</b>

## Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I cannot give enough thanks to my advisors, Martha Fitzpatrick Bishai and Richard Ballard. They were both willing to help me work through every issue and roadblock and were supportive and encouraging throughout. Their advice was always on point, insightful, and helpful.

I am indebted to Richard for his insight on the academic framework for my research and sharing his extensive bibliography.

Thanks to Martha for her consistent help and support with transportation, putting perspective and thoughtfulness into my research, much moral support, and always being willing to chat and answer any pressing (or extraneous) questions.

This project would have been impossible without the help and access of the Umkhumbane Schools Project. Without Mr. Stan Carries and Mr. Nkosinathi Masondo, I would not have been able to get connected with my interviewees. All of the staff of the Umkhumbane Schools Project donated their time, help, and support without question and were absolutely integral to my research.

A special thank you goes to the Umkhumbane Schools Project Intern, Colisile, for going out of her way to show me the way to get to Wiggins School by mini-bus taxi. She saved me a lot of anxiety and money on transport.

Thank you, also, to all of my fellow SIT students. You have brought so much joy, fun, and insight on this trip. Thank you specifically to my roommates for helping me work through the process of interviewing, conceiving, and writing this paper – this last month would have been far less enjoyable, funny, and productive without you.

I cannot thank my family enough for their love and encouragement and for always finding a way to be supportive, even from so far.

I would be remiss not to thank Imraan and Thembisa for their constant support, advice, and intellect, which have helped define my research as well as my South African experience. Also, I must thank Shola Haricharan and Sdu Chiliza for their constant logistical and moral support throughout my time researching and living here.

Finally, I would like to thank the wonderful students at Wiggins Secondary School for being so open and welcoming with me. They exceeded my expectations in what they were willing to share with me of their stories, thoughts, and dreams with me. I was honored to listen to their thoughtful and smart insights on youth, wealth, and life in South Africa. Their passion and drive to succeed will continue to inspire me long after I leave.

## **Abstract**

This project seeks to understand the aspirations and understandings of success of young adults at Wiggins Secondary School and how their dreams are impacted by their perceptions of black wealth as well as their social environment and experiences. By examining the way the students interact with black wealth, it is possible to better comprehend the influence of black wealth and ideas of middle class-ness on their definitions of success. This will further inform an understanding of the means by which they hope to live out their dreams. Specifically, I also investigate the impact of role models on definitions of success and dream formation.

I conducted 13 in-depth interviews with Grade 11 students from Wiggins Secondary School about their lives, perceptions, ideas, plans, and dreams to collect information. My results show that their personal interactions with wealth impacted whether they perceived it negatively or positively. I found, for them, the ideal kind of success involved a combination of materialistic consumption and a strong notion of giving back to their families and communities. Students also felt a shortage of role models with whom they could identify. Their definitions and plans for success were also impacted by their isolation from higher education informants and disillusion with redress policies and political connections.

Through this research investigation, a better understanding of the dynamics of social mobility within a township setting, cross-class relations, and the dreams of the youngest generation of South African adults is possible.

## **Introduction**

While there are many pressing concerns for South African society today, the impossibility of social mobility for all is one that is particularly painful and frustrating in the aftermath of the fight against apartheid. The dream to achieve upward mobility is a narrative that has long been associated with developing societies and struggling families. Today, the futures and opportunities of young black South Africans will define the economic, entrepreneurial, and structural future of this country. This study is relevant to the discussion and study of the narrative, feelings, and individual experiences of underprivileged students, the national impacts of wealth and consumerism on narratives of success, the national realities of the impact of township environments and experiences on social mobility, and most broadly, the economic future of South Africa in relation to the successes of underprivileged students and their ability to realize their dreams.

There has been little research on the way that wealth and the increasing reality of an economically and socially divided South African society impacts lives and experiences of underprivileged youth. For many of my interviewees and their peers, their environments can negatively impact their realities to the point that their dreams fade away because of more demanding issues and responsibilities. Furthermore, there exists a large gap between what they want to achieve and what they alone have the resources and ability to do.

### *Objectives*

Through my descriptive case study on the dreams and perceptions of success in Wiggins Secondary School, my objective is to add to the literature on the aspirations for social mobility of students from South African townships. By moving towards understanding the perceptions and dreams of the students that I am interviewing, I believe a greater understanding of the

motivations and cross-class connections of this section of the population will be possible. Much of the current research in this field is on the existence of a black middle class and “black diamonds” and not on how they are outwardly perceived or how they are connected to the wider black community. The research on youth aspirations is most often more narrowly focused on career aspirations as conceived within a school context.

My objective is to understand how students at Wiggins Secondary School perceive wealthy black South Africans and how their dreams are connected to those perceptions. More specifically, I want to explore what students at Wiggins Secondary dream to achieve – for their jobs, homes, educations, wealth, families, and futures, and to understand their process of dream formation. Furthermore, I am seeking to understand students’ conceptualizations of dream realization and how this relates to their connections and ideas of role models. Finally, I want to understand the perceptions of and connections of these students to wealth, specifically black wealth, and whether the influences of black wealth impact their dreams and ideals. By realizing these objectives, I hope to better understand the dynamics of social mobility within a township setting, cross-class relations, and the dreams of the youngest generation of South African adults.

### *Justification*

Studying this specific population is relevant because the students I am interviewing both represent a wider reality for underprivileged South African youth and play an important role in the post-apartheid social and economic transformation processes. Generally, by understanding their visions and plans for success, I hope to be able to source these ideas and inspirations. Understanding the basis and foundations for their dreams could be used to encourage other students like them to connect with positive and productive inspirations and forge ahead with dream creation and realization.

In order to achieve these objectives, I conducted 13 individual interviews with 11<sup>th</sup> grade students from Wiggins Secondary over a two-week period. Also during this time, I spent time in the school observing, interacting, and chatting with teachers, students, administrators, and staff of the Umkhumbane Schools Project. Once my data was compiled, I conducted an informal session with some of the interviewees, which included a brief focus group on my findings, and their subsequent thoughts.

This paper begins with a description of the context for my research: the economic and home environments of students at Wiggins, information about Wiggins Secondary School and about the Umkhumbane Schools Project, the organization under which I was able to conduct my research. This is followed by a literature review, which summarizes the research that has been done on the existence of and influence of black wealth in South African society, including research on Black Economic Empowerment, the concept of “black diamonds,” and black wealth within the townships. Then, literature on the influences of underprivileged social environments and experiences as well as the impact of education is explored in relation to students’ definitions of success and their relation to the South African black middle class. This is followed by a description of the methodology of my interviews and a discussion of the limitations of this study. I will then summarize and analyze the findings of my research, which will be broken up thematically based on the topics of discussion from my interviews and time at Wiggins Secondary.

It should be noted that I will be using the “black middle class” as a generalized term to refer to both the rising and well-established black individuals in the middle and elite classes of South African society. While I do acknowledge that focusing on racial categories in relation to wealth and class can be problematic, especially in a post-Apartheid era, the reality in South



Africa is that these labels are widely used. I believe that this racial distinction is necessary for my study.

## Context

The research for this paper was undertaken at Wiggins Secondary School in Cato Manor, Durban, alongside the Umkhumbane Schools Project. Cato Manor is a township area outside of Durban which is described by the official website of the Durban Municipality as a home to some of the “poorest of the urban poor,” and “remains characterized by a high unemployment rate and social fragmentation.”<sup>1</sup> However, the community and municipality are invested in improvement and, recently, work has been done through the Cato Manor Development Programme to increase infrastructure, economic, and social development in the area. Of the people who live in Cato Manor, only 12 percent have received a high school diploma, 38 percent are unemployed, and 80 percent of homes have an income of under R1500 (USD150) per month. There are also 35,000 people living in informal settlements in the area, high crime rates, and a high incidence of HIV, which impacts the social and economic environment of the community.<sup>2</sup>

Wiggins Secondary School has been designated a Quintile 3 school by the South African government, a rating that designates it as one of the poorest schools in the townships. It received this designation because while the students in the area have access to paved roads, electricity, water, and are in proximity to urban amenities, the school itself is very under-resourced. Wiggins Secondary does not charge school-fees, which indicates, according to the Umkhumbane Schools Project, that most of the students would not be able to pay any sort of school fees.<sup>3</sup> The school serves 1,300 students in between the grades of 8 and 12, who are typically broken up into classes of 50 students. Pass rates at Wiggins are consistently low: in 2013, 46 percent of 12<sup>th</sup> grade

---

<sup>1</sup> “Cato Manor,” *The Official Page of the eThekweni Municipality*, eThekweni Municipality, 2011, Accessed November 20, 2014, Accessible at [www.durban.gov.za](http://www.durban.gov.za)

<sup>2</sup> “Cato Manor Area Based Management and Development Programme,” *Municipal Institute of Learning*, eThekweni Municipality & European Union, 2011, Accessed November 24, 2014, Accessible at [www.mile.org.co.za](http://www.mile.org.co.za)

<sup>3</sup> “About the Community,” *Umkhumbane Schools Project*, 2014, Accessed November 10, 2014. Accessible at [www.umkhumbane.org](http://www.umkhumbane.org).

learners passed Physical Science and 30 percent passed mathematics. However, the students remain motivated, upbeat, and encouraged about school.

The Umkhumbane Schools Project defines itself as a “pioneering effort to create a vibrant community of learning in and among the five secondary schools in the historic Cato Manor/uMkhumbane township area on the outskirts of Durban.”<sup>4</sup> The project has a number of initiatives it has implemented to assist and develop the children and the community. It works alongside the teachers and administrators, providing them with training, support, and encouragement. It provides mathematical reviews and classes for students, which help build the mathematical foundation for grade 10 learners. They have brought science enrichment to the schools, including science workshops and opportunities for students to participate in the Eskom Expo, a national science competition. The project works closely with teachers to improve their classroom capabilities and with students to create mentorship and life-skills development opportunities. Finally, and most importantly, the Umkhumbane Schools Project has a positive presence in the community and has built many positive personal connections with students and their families.

---

<sup>4</sup> “The Umkhumbane Schools Project- Education for South Africa’s Future,” *The Umkhumbane Schools Project*, 2014, Accessed November 10, 2014. Accessible at [www.umkhumbane.org](http://www.umkhumbane.org).

## Literature Review

The literature relating to my topic is grouped in two sections: literature on the existence, location of, and perceptions of black wealth and, separately, literature on black youth education, social environments, and experiences. Much academic focus has been placed on following those who have found success and on those who are still yearning for it, but fails to unite the two topics. Overall, this literature will aim to prove the how the influence of the black middle class and township education, social environments, and experiences change the definition of success and possibilities of social mobility for underprivileged black youth.

### *Historical Background: Economic Inequality and Black Economic Empowerment*

One of the most long lasting impacts of apartheid is the persistence of class inequality and a lack of economic mobility in South Africa. Opportunities for mobility continue to be restricted to a small sector of the population. The dissolution of apartheid job restrictions were enough for some upwardly mobile and resourced black South Africans to start their own businesses and move into the job market post-apartheid; however, this was not enough for many, whose drive to achieve was overshadowed by the remnants of an unequal society. To combat this inequality, the South African government implemented a variety of racial redress policies. Black Economic Empowerment (BEE), one of the major redress policies, has been pivotal in the restructuring of South African society. The program incentivizes practices that work towards equal participation of blacks in the economy by allocating ratings to all South African businesses through a points system. Through BEE, there has been some decrease in racial class imbalances. According to Seekings and Natrass, the rapid creation of a black elite and black middle classes has been the most incredible shift in the South African social landscape post-apartheid.<sup>5</sup> The

---

<sup>5</sup> Seekings and Natrass, *Class, Race, and Inequality in South Africa*, University of KwaZulu Natal Press, (2006) p308.

number of black South Africans who are in the top Living Standards Measure category has grown by 21 percent from 1993-2003. But, in 2003, that only meant .58% of black Africans, or 129,000 people were considered in this category.<sup>6</sup> While this program gave opportunities for success to some, it left many black South Africans behind. This policy specifically works towards opening up opportunities for blacks in high-paying occupations, a measure that only benefits those who were already educated and well resourced. BEE was not as successful at fighting to alleviate the issues of widespread unemployment -- a huge problem that fostered widespread poverty for black Africans, specifically in rural areas. The racial composition of the elite and middle classes were changed through BEE, but the prospects of mobility for the lowest classes remained negligible.<sup>7</sup>

Some argue that the expansion of the middle class is a better means of tackling poverty than directly addressing a country's problems of the poor directly.<sup>8</sup> The middle and upper classes are assigned roles that identify them as positive forces for development and specimens of good citizens who represent the best interests of the nation.<sup>9</sup> Specifically, in terms of consumption practices, the middle class is regarded for the preference for private rather than publicly provided goods and services, which is supposed to stimulate the country's economy. Richard Ballard writes a well-rounded and thorough case on the how middle class gains do not always live up to those lofty promises of citizenship and widespread development. Additionally, relying on this small group people to support an entire country's economy can be risky; privileged groups worldwide have in some cases started to disassociate from wider national responsibilities and

---

<sup>6</sup> Matthew Andrews, "Is Black Economic Empowerment a South African Growth Catalyst? (Or Could it Be...)," unpublished working paper for *Center for International Growth Panel Initiative*, Kennedy School, Harvard University, (2007), p33.

<sup>7</sup> Seeking and Natrass, *Class, Race, and Inequality in South Africa*, University of KwaZulu Natal Press, (2006) p340.

<sup>8</sup> African Development Bank, "The middle of the pyramid: Dynamics of the middle class in Africa." *Market Brief* 20 (April, 2001): in Ballard, Richard, "Geographies of development: without the poor," *Progress in Human Geography* 36: 563 (2012), 567.

<sup>9</sup> Richard Ballard, "Geographies of development: without the poor," *Progress in Human Geography* 36: 563 (2012), 566-567.

social membership.<sup>10</sup> He concludes that much of the development encouraged by the middle class is a development that excludes the poor in all ways but as a presence that either needs to be removed or exploited as a source of manual, menial labor. Furthermore, he labels middle class development as a process of “distillation, concentration, segregation, and exclusion,” which sustains and builds only the wealth of those who already have it.<sup>11</sup> Through an understanding of how ideas of the middle class are perceived and criticized worldwide, South African black wealth can better be understood and analyzed.

### *The Existence and Influence of Black Wealth*

The presence of black wealth in South African society must be understood in order to grasp its influence on popular culture and today’s youth. Through the post-1994 government redress policies, a few of the already educated and well resourced black South Africans were offered tailor-made chances to be socially mobile and economically successful. This subset of the population has been titled by some academics, “black diamonds.”<sup>12</sup> These emerging “black diamonds” were categorized in three groups by the University of Cape Town Unilever Institute of Strategic Marketing: those not highly educated, but well off by means of hard work, those prosperous because of receiving a privileged education and therefore have found well-paid jobs, and third, those who are “wealthy because they are political aligned to the ruling parts and have greater access than others to government related projects and employment opportunities.”<sup>13</sup> The term “black diamond” was originally used to identify black individuals in the middle class,

---

<sup>10</sup> Fabricant N (2009) Performative politics: The Camba countermovement in eastern Bolivia. *American Ethnologist* 36: 768–783.

in Ballard, Richard, “Geographies of development: without the poor,” 568.

<sup>11</sup> Ballard, “Geographies of development: without the poor,” 569.

<sup>12</sup> Ronnie Donaldson, Thobeka Mehlomakhulu, et al., “Relocation: to be or not to be a black diamond in a South African township,” *Habitat International* 39 (2013): 114.

<sup>13</sup> UCT Unilever Institute, 2007, [www.unileverinstitute.co.za](http://www.unileverinstitute.co.za), in Donaldson, et al., “Relocation: to be or not to be a black diamond in a South African township,” 115.

noting that they were “rare, valuable, and unusual” because their economic successes were actively revering the social hierarchy of the past. The term became popular in academia and the media, but has since fallen out of usage due to some negative connotations and the announcement that the black middle class had more spending power than white South Africans.<sup>14</sup>

The social patterns of the black middle class are best described by Ronnie Donaldson, a professor on geography and environmental studies at Stellenbosch University, in “Relocation: To be or not to be a black diamond in a South African township?” Donaldson finds that many of the well-educated and resourceful black South Africans, black diamonds, as he chooses to refer to them, are deciding to live in townships (53%) rather than moving to former all-white suburbs.<sup>15</sup> He specifically points out two young, up and coming sections of the black middle class, “the Mzansi youth” and the “start-me-ups,” as he calls them, who are happy to live in townships. The role of black diamonds in townships “transcends economics into some being seen as role models,” where they remain noticed and “sparkling.”<sup>16</sup> Donaldson moves beyond exploring just the location that black diamonds want to live, but also why they chose to live there. His research finds that many of them gain social, cultural, and economic benefits by being a “black diamond” in the township. The position of black diamonds as well-known role models in township communities indicates their ability to influence youths’ definitions of success and wealth.

While the black middle class is not united in a single identity, they have changed the nature of consumption in South Africa. The middle class is constructed in a variety of ways and is a very broad category which can individuals who have found wealth recently and those who

---

<sup>14</sup> Richard Ballard (forthcoming 2015) ‘Black diamonds (South Africa’s black middle class)’ in John Stone, Rutledge Dennis, Polly Rizova, Anthony Smith, and Xiaoshuo Hou (eds) *Encyclopedia of Race Ethnicity and Nationalism*. Wiley-Blackwell.

<sup>15</sup> *Mail and Guardian*, “Townships still home to many, but emigration beckons” (2009). Accessed 25 October 2014 in Donaldson et al, “Relocation: to be or not to be a black diamond in a South African township.”

<sup>16</sup> Ronnie Donaldson, Thobeka Mehlomakhulu, et al., “Relocation: to be or not to be a black diamond in a South African township,” *Habitat International* 39 (2013): 114.

have been prosperous since before the end of apartheid, the young and old, those in rural and urban areas, in suburbs and townships, and in all political parties; because of this diversity, it is difficult to define concretely their actions and impact. Some members of the black middle class, specifically those who have recently come into wealth, have fostered a spirit of conspicuous consumerism, which encourages observable indicators of wealth and conflicts with the capability of poverty alleviation.<sup>17</sup> Academics have conflicting opinions on the economic impact of the black middle class. Some economists claim the broader middle class are the “engine of the South African economy, while others claim their patterns of spending are unsustainable because their capital has not been aimed at attaining wealth-creating assets, but rather is often instead spent on luxury items. These patterns of spending have widespread impacts because their practices of demonstrable wealth and conspicuous consumption are widely broadcast. Donaldson specifically finds that for a certain section of the middle class, “gold chains, labeled shirts, designed shoes, and fancy cars” are displayed publicly and widely admired in township setting.<sup>18</sup> Therefore, for observers, these material items have become associated with success and wealth.

It seems researchers have yet to search for the direct economic impacts of “black diamonds” or the black middle class as role models in township settings, but there is research on the impact of consumption patterns of the growing black middle class in South Africa. Specifically, Deborah Posel, a leader in the field of economic transformation and the black middle class, has done in-depth research on the relation between race and consumption patterns, and how the desire to consume became racialized. The premise for her investigation of the racial nature of consumption is the claim that the democratic South Africa of today has bred people to see liberation as an opportunity for wealth and materialism, rather than the continuation of

---

<sup>17</sup> Deborah Posel, “Races to Consume,” *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 33, no. 2 (2010), 159.

<sup>18</sup> Donaldson, Mehlomakhulu, et al., “Relocation: to be or not to be a black diamond in a South African township,” 118.



poverty transcendence.<sup>19</sup> While the ANC has officially aligned with the doctrine of poverty eradication and the reduction of inequality, Posel says it was ANC policies that encouraged and fostered the growth of the black middle class, encouraged their embrace of newfound affluence, and activated a subsequent selfish materialism. She cites Julius Malema, ANC Youth League chairperson in 2009, when he very bluntly credited the ANC for upward mobility, “The ANC has taught those who are insulting it today to use fork and knife, to taste red wine, to wear expensive suits.” Through this quote, she claims that to many, the “aspiration of wealth” and the acquisition of expensive material belongings is clearly a part of the emancipation narrative.<sup>20</sup> Through her article it is clear that the ANC plays an important role in the way success is perceived in relation to consumerism, specifically through the outward perception of its most elite members.

Posel also deeply investigates the historical implications of consumption and, through an analysis of apartheid policies, finds that the racial order was a way of controlling black aspirations through limiting their powers of consumption, and therefore, their identities. During apartheid, the aspiration of extravagance was considered a crime against the social order, so once those opportunities opened, it is not surprising that consumerism was romanticized.<sup>21</sup> Posel’s research on the connection between consumerism and identity further brings attention to the important role that black diamond consumerism plays in the aspiration and identity formation of township youth.

The philanthropic patterns of the South African black middle class, as individuals and through their companies, greatly impacts the way they are perceived in a township setting. The nature of giving and development as a means for poverty alleviation are investigated generally by Habib and Maharaj through a sample study of 3,000 South Africans’ giving behavior and

---

<sup>19</sup> Deborah Posel “Races to Consume,” *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 33, no. 2 (2010), 158-160.

<sup>20</sup> The Times, “ANC taught Sam manners,” 6 March 2009, in Posel, “Races to Consume,” 159.

<sup>21</sup> Posel, “Races to Consume,” 160, 170.

subsequent analysis. They discuss how black entrepreneurs have interacted with assisting the poor, saying that some young entrepreneurs distance themselves from demands to help the poor through the claim that “their lack of complicity in apartheid absolves them from having to pay back into the communities from which they came.”<sup>22</sup>

Friedman, Hudson, and Mackay further investigate this through an analysis of the positionality of these business owners and how that impacts their giving in a subsequent chapter.<sup>23</sup> BEE has encouraged South African companies to contribute towards Social-Economic Development, which are initiatives that enhance the opportunities for black people who are not yet participants in the South African Economy, but often, the black corporates and small businesses see themselves as beneficiaries of assistance from the government, and not yet as the distributors of help. Most often, the authors say that interviewees referenced a handful of the most wealthy entrepreneurs: Cyril Ramaphosa, Tokyo Sexwale, and Patrice Motsepe, who have created foundations to help uplift the underprivileged, to prove black involvement in giving. However, they also note that many interviewees excused the black absence from social-investment due to insufficient resources, discomfort in the mostly-white giving communities, and the need to prove relevance through donations to international organizations. The inability to spend vast amounts of money on independent social investment may also be influenced by the extensive practice of remittances, widespread within the South African black community.<sup>24</sup> While the most powerful black entrepreneurs may be visible to the underprivileged as benefactors, the visible absence of a more widespread investment from the middle class in townships inevitably impacts the way they are perceived, and therefore, the ways students

---

<sup>22</sup> Adam Habib, Brij Maharaj, *Giving & Solidarity*, HSRC Press, Cape Town (2008), 35.

<sup>23</sup> Steven Freidman, Judi Hudson, and Shaun Mackay “The colour of giving: racial identity and corporate social investment” in Habib, Maharaj, *Giving & Solidarity*, (2008).

<sup>24</sup> Dorrit Posel, “How Do Households Work? Migration, the Household and Remittance Behaviour in South Africa,” *Social Dynamics* 27(1), 2001.

identify with wealth and success. Though the analysis of giving and development patterns are thorough, further investigation could be done on the organizations and locations that wealthy black south Africans choose to donate and the subsequent social impacts of this involvement.

### *Students: Educations, Environments, and Experiences*

Research on the student educations, experiences, and environments must be investigated and understood in order to grasp their definitions of success and how they relate to the black middle class. Much has been written on the way students learn about and perceive possibilities for career choice through formal education. Research on career education for black students only began in the mid-1980s, most likely because career guidance only started in black schools in 1981.<sup>25</sup> Since then, there has been much research in regards to the success or failure of Life Orientation classes and the place of teachers to assist in students' formulation of the idea of careers and success. Carolyn Mitchell, a masters student at UKZN, utilized a structured questionnaire that surveyed one hundred and twenty pupils in Durban's Coastal region in her 2011 study; she found that students generally understood narrow, undeveloped conceptualizations of the term "career."<sup>26</sup> Furthermore, although students claimed that they found the career information they received in school useful, she argues her findings suggest a need for a more well rounded, consistent, and informal career education. Understanding the information, or lack thereof, that is presented to learners in school reveals their naiveté in regards to career development paths and the influence non-formal sources, such as popular culture or neighborhood role models on their understanding of career options.

---

<sup>25</sup> A Naicker, "The psycho-social context of career counseling in South African schools," *South African Journal of Psychology*, 24 (1994).

<sup>26</sup> Carolyn Mitchell, "Perceptions of grade 11 pupils with regards to career choice and career information," Unpublished Masters of Arts Thesis (2011), i.

More generally, there is much debate on whether the South African school system is responsible for the inability of students to be socially mobile. Problems with the school system are extensive: low pass rates, lack of resources, inadequately trained teachers, changing requirements and programs, and a curriculum which may be inapplicable to students' realities and career needs.<sup>27</sup> While arguments on whether the school system is helping or failing South African students is relevant to the topic of student experiences and prospects for mobility, the debate is much too vast to cover in this review. However, it is important to remember when analyzing the context of underprivileged students that their educational experiences may not be ideal.

Charity Sifunda and T. Buthelezi bring attention to the impact of the social environment on adolescent career challenges and opportunities for mobility. Sifunda, a master student of educational psychology at UKZN, focuses on under-resourced black learners in an under-resourced setting through in-depth focus groups. She argues that the students are marginalized and claims that her results highlight the difficulties of these students, whose circumstances greatly affect their career decisions.<sup>28</sup> Specifically, she finds that gender inequalities, restrictive cultural practices, shame regarding their background, limited exposure to an assortment of careers, and limited reliable sources to learn about career options greatly limit and negatively impact students' opportunities of mobility through career successes. The pressure to use education to uplift their entire family along with the feelings of inadequacy and inequality in comparison to students of other races left students stressed and disheartened about their futures. Sifunda's study revealed much about the contexts of under-privileged learners and, in

---

<sup>27</sup> Nicholas Spaull, "Poverty & Privilege: Primary School Inequality in South Africa," unpublished working paper for Stellenbosch University and Bureau for Economic Research, Stellenbosch University, July 2012.

<sup>28</sup> Charity Thobile Sifunda "An exploration of focus groups as a means of investigation career thinking and exploration in a sample," Unpublished thesis Master of Educational Psychology, University of Natal (2001).

combination with Buthelezi's study, allows for a good understanding of the environmental impact of underprivileged communities have on students career prospects.

Buthelezi's 2009 study of Grade 9 and 10 learners from disadvantaged backgrounds found a strong reciprocal association between "adolescents' social environment, their cognitive processes such as self efficacy beliefs, and their career development."<sup>29</sup> Specifically, he found that many learners seemed to believe they did not deserve an adequate level of education and felt a lack of positive role models. Additionally, students who had large aspirations and dreams were ostracized by their peers and families. He points to Arulmani's 2001 findings as corroborative proof that disadvantaged students experience and observe more failures than successes in respect to career directions, achievements, and lifestyles of those around them. They have minimal contact with positive career role model from within their communities and witness the unfavorable adult perceptions of leaders, who may have otherwise been role models. All of these factors leave students disillusioned.<sup>30</sup> Students who dream in unsupportive and uninspiring contexts have restricted and unimaginative thoughts for their future successes. Furthermore, without encouragement and confidence, these students will not be able to follow through successfully on their career aspirations.

Outside of specific career aspirations, research has been done on the relation between social environments and experiences and the youth perceive success and the best means to achieve it. Staeheli and Hammett argue that the South African education system is working to reconcile the inequalities remaining from apartheid and help students imagine a new, better future for themselves and their nation, but that the efforts of the education system are blocked by

---

<sup>29</sup> Buthelezi, et al, "Adolescents' Perceived Career Challenges and Needs in a Disadvantaged Context in South Africa from a Social Cognitive Career Theoretical Perspective," *South African Journal of Higher Education* 23, no. 3, (2009), 505.

<sup>30</sup> G Arulmani and M Mays De Perez, "Rethinking observation form method to context," (2001) in Buthelezi, et al, "Adolescents' Perceived Career Challenges and Needs in a Disadvantaged Context in South Africa from a Social Cognitive Career Theoretical Perspective," 514.

the lack of class restructuring within society.<sup>31</sup> The disadvantaged youth continues to be restricted by the unwanted political, economic, economic, and geographical legacies of apartheid. They note that while the schools may teach that everyone has equal opportunities, the main cohort of black and coloured employees work in schools as a part of the maintenance department, not as teachers or administrators; this uneven distribution of jobs is not unnoticed by students. Because they are surrounded by remnants of apartheid restrictions, they have trouble seeing themselves as a part of the evolving, successful South African black narrative. These youth have trouble connecting with the success stories told in school because they cannot connect these stories with their lived experiences; this limits their dreaming potential, according to Maira (2009) and Weller (2003).<sup>32</sup> Students in informal settlements and former townships were the most pessimistic about their job prospects<sup>33</sup> Nevertheless, even without significant inspiration, students still believe that employment is the only hope of moving out of poverty and as the best means to secure safety.

For poor students, whether they are from townships or rural areas, their hometowns are perceived as a place where their dreams of employment and achievement cannot be realized. Gibbs and Campbell found through their study on “Mismatches between youth aspirations and participatory HIV/AIDS programmes in South Africa” that young people see migrating to better-resourced urban areas as the best means to achieve their career and life goals.<sup>34</sup> They viewed these new locations as places to seek further education and paid work, which could encourage their upward mobility. Unlike many of the other studies I am referencing, this study was done in

---

<sup>31</sup> Lynn Staeheli, Daniel Hammett, “For the future of a nation: Citizenship, nation, and education in South Africa”, *Political Geography* 32: (2013), 32.

<sup>32</sup> Maira, “Missing: Youth, Citizenship, and empire after 9/11” (2009) and Weller, “Teach us something useful: contested spaces of teenagers’ citizenship,” (2003) in Staeheli, Hammett “For the future of the nation’: Citizenship, nation, and education in South Africa,” 33.

<sup>33</sup> Staeheli, Hammett “For the future of the nation’: Citizenship, nation, and education in South Africa,” 41-42.

<sup>34</sup> Andrew Gibbs, et al, “Mismatches between youth aspirations and participatory HIV/AIDS programmes in South Africa,” *African Journal of AIDS Research* 9, no. 2 (2010), 153.

rural Kwa-Zulu Natal, which is geographically far from the community I will be working in, but is very similar in its lack of opportunities, label as a “dead-end” for career goals, and rampant unemployment. The educations, experiences, and environments from which township students emerge inform their ideas for mobility and their realization of such plans.

### *Conclusion*

In an attempt to determine both the impact of black diamonds on students in Cato Manor and the students’ aspirations for success, this literature review has explored the social and economic influences of wealthy South African blacks and the conditions and experiences of underprivileged students that emerge as determinants for their definitions and realizations of success as well as their possibility of social mobility. It exposes the economic remnants of inequality from apartheid and the successes and failures of BEE, which informs the existence and extent of black wealth and the black middle class in South Africa. Subsequently, literature on the social and economic patterns of the black middle class and “black diamonds” are explored, which proves that their role model status in combination with their consumption and materialistic practices greatly influence the concept of “success” in the township. Finally, the exploration of underprivileged student educations, experiences, and environments reveals their impressionability on these topics due to lack of information, role models, and career support. Furthermore, it informs their ideas of achievements and approach to becoming socially mobile.

Independently, these topics have been investigated because of their importance to the ever-changing South African society, but the merging of these topics could bring to light to an unfamiliar relationship between unlikely partners. Studying the intersection between the presence and influence of black wealth and the experiences and environments of South Africa’s underprivileged black youth is an important convergence point of current research that will bring

new information to the field that will inform the best methods to help students find socially mobility.



## **Methodology**

My initial contact with Wiggins Secondary School was facilitated through my study abroad program in coordination with Martha Fitzpatrick Bishai and the Umkhumbane Schools Project. While there the first time, I spent time talking to a group of students about their dreams and aspirations for the future and about also more generally about their lives. Once deciding that I wanted to do research at the school, I got in contact with Mrs. Bishai, the director of the Umkhumbane Schools Project, who has access and connections within Wiggins Secondary. After an initial meeting with Mrs. Bishai, during which we discussed the scope of my project as well as the ethical concerns, she agreed to advise and assist me in my research. Because of time constraints, Ms. Bishai presented my research to the Wiggins Secondary Principal, who approved. Mrs. Bishai was my main contact; she gave me access to a space for interviewing, the students' class schedules, and connected me to further contact people who assisted me in finding students to interview.

Nkosinathi Masondo, one of the main teachers for the Umkhumbane School project who teaches math, and Stan Carries, Programme Officer of the Umkhumbane Schools Project, agreed to help me to find students to interview. They both are well-respected and well-known members of the school community and were very willing to help me figure out the logistics of my research. Participation in the research was voluntary, and after the project was explained to them, students could decide to participate by talking to Mr. Masondo or Mr. Carries. I originally planned to interview 12<sup>th</sup> graders to avoid talking to minors, but upon learning of the matriculant exam schedule and associated stressors, I decided to interview 11<sup>th</sup> graders instead. I intended on interviewing 7-10 students, all in 11<sup>th</sup> grade, who were not involved in the Umkhumbane Schools Project. These decisions were made in an effort to control for as many variables as possible. My

first round of interviews included three male and four female students who I interviewed over a span of four days. Then, when Mr. Masondo presented the interviews to another group of students, eight students were interested, so I expanded my interview pool to 15 in order to not exclude excited students. However, in the end, due to a variety of other factors, including exam schedules and my inability to independently contact the students, I ended up interviewing 13 students in 11<sup>th</sup> grade, half of whom were involved in Umkhumbane and half of whom were not. In between interviews, I spent time informally observing in the school and talking to teachers and students.

My interviews were conducted in the Umkhumbane Schools Project office, which is within the administrative wing of the school. This was my main research site because it is considered a safe, comfortable space within the school, but also maintains privacy and quiet for the purpose of the interviews. The interviews were conducted in English, which was, overall, not an issue. Occasionally, students would use a phrase in Zulu or stumble over certain words in English, neither of which I could understand, but I worked to clarify as often as possible.

This research project is a qualitative case study. I am using interviews as my main source of data because, according to *Research in Practice*, by Blanche and Durrheim, interviewing is a good way to obtain in-depth information. It gives respondents an opportunity to clarify or ask questions, and it ensures a high response rate. The interviews were guided based on a set of questions, not on a life-history premise, and the process involved minimal probing of sensitive topics. I conducted interviews for two purposes: to better understand the students' viewpoint and interpretation of reality as well as information on the students' narrative and "how" they converse on certain topics. I am seeking to gain subjective knowledge from the students on their personal attitudes, perceptions, and interpretations within the context of their lives. I also plan to

listen for the discourses each individual student utilizes in order to understand the way they construct perceptions and truths.

I also conducted an informal focus group with five students, three of whom I had previously interviewed, and asked them questions about the representativeness of my study and their reflections on the themes I found throughout the interviews. I quote this focus group throughout the paper because the students made profound and insightful comments, however methodologically, it should not be judged at the same caliber as the interview process.

The research was both exploratory, in that I found for “new insights into phenomena,” specifically that of the concept of “black diamond” and South African black wealth, and descriptive, in that I generated insights into the aspirations of township youth and the relationship between aspirations and their connections to success.<sup>35</sup>

### *Ethics*

In order to ensure that my study was ethical, I made sure to prevent any of my participants from incurring harm or danger from my study. Possible ways that interviewees could have been harmed from this process would be if had not consented to the study, if they felt uncomfortable with the questions and subsequently became emotionally troubled, if their names were revealed, or if the confidential data from my study is leaked. Specifically, these students were very open with me about the problems they experienced in their communities and homes, and if information was to be leaked with their names associated, potentially negative outcomes are possible.

I took many steps to protect the rights and safety of my participants. To ensure their consent to the survey, I started each interview with a casual discussion of the consent form and

---

<sup>35</sup>Martin Terre Blanche and Kevin Durrhein, Research in Practice: Applied Methods for the Social Sciences, University of Cape Town Press: (Cape Town:1999), 39.

ensured that they, and their parents if necessary, understand and consented to it. I also clearly explained before each interview that they were allowed to discontinue the study at any point or elect to skip a question if they felt uncomfortable. To protect the anonymity of the students, I very carefully have stored and kept track of my data and any form that would identify them. I will be keeping all confidential files locked up and I am the only person who has access to the information. Finally, my positioning as a part of the Umkhumbane Schools Project ensured that there was oversight for my project from people who hold the students' best interests at heart.

## **Limitations of the Study**

My qualitative case study of students at Wiggins Secondary School was limited in many ways. One of the limitations of this study was my position as a white, American student -- an identity that comes with assumed privilege. While it did not seem like my position of privilege prevented students from being open with me, it did occasionally come up as a barrier. During one interview, the interviewee was tentative to identify “white people” when discussing her opinions on the failure and manipulation of BEE by white South Africans. In this situation, she stumbled over the term “white people,” and stopped for a moment, waiting to proceed because of what I perceived as discomfort.<sup>36</sup> After I reassured the interviewee that she could say whatever she was thinking, she proceeded to give her opinion. I tried to preemptively negotiate this difference by preceding the interview with a statement about my position a student, like them, and described my lack of authority over them. My consistent and visible presence at the school during the interview periods and my connection with the Umkhumbane Schools Project also aided the students’ level of comfort and willingness to open up to me.

Additionally, I was not able to include a representative sample of the students at Wiggins Secondary, let alone the students in Cato Manor, because of personal and school time constraints. The study was also not a representative sample of the students in 11<sup>th</sup> grade. I am unsure as to whether I have a biased sample of the students in 11<sup>th</sup> grade because I had little control over the process of interviewee acquisition. I expect that my study has at least a minimal selection bias for a couple of reasons. First of all, I doubt that any students who were really significantly struggling with English would have been willing to sign up for an interview that would be conducted in English. Furthermore, as informed by the interviews and information from Martha, there are many students at Wiggins who are failing or considerably struggling in

---

<sup>36</sup> Interview 2, Interview, October 30, 2014.

school and are involved in less productive behavior during and outside of school hours. Because I was conducting interviews at the very end of the academic year and during exams, when many students were not in class, uninterested or struggling students may not have even been at school or had time to speak with me.

In Appendix A, you will see a presentation of the demographics of all of the students I interviewed, which I believe presents a more clear understanding of the demographic of students who I talked to.

## Findings and Analysis Section:

While each student's histories differ, a common narrative of struggle unites them and pushes them to aspire towards social mobility. Rather than representing one student, this account tells a story through a combined narrative.

*A girl sits before me in the Umkhumbane Schools Project office. She is dressed in her formal Wiggins uniform. She looks smart, put together. Only with a second glance do I see the few tears on the sweater at the elbows. They appear to come from wear. She is quiet at first, but pleasant and friendly in discussion.*

*The story she tells of her family situation is not without tribulations, but she speaks of it very matter-of-factly. She acknowledges her struggles, but does not let them define or limit her. Her mother is far from here and she misses the comfort, love, and support of her home village. But, her current home has access to better schools and opportunities, which she acknowledges and appreciates. She appreciates that she has reliable food and shelter here, because nights where she has gone hungry are not so far in the past. Her home here, however, does not come without troubles. She mentions, vaguely, of her subordinate status in the home where she now lives. That she is not always treated or loved equally. Here mama here in Mayville works as a cleaner, but child grants fill in the place of a second income.*

*She enjoys coming to school. She works hard to earn good marks. But, she says, not everyone works like her. Too many of the kids just want to have fun – they drink, smoke, fall pregnant – and that is not for her. Some classmates encourage her successes, but sometimes she feels that she is on her own, that her friends don't understand – they would rather jolly than study.*

*Her community encourages her to work hard, but does not raise her up for her achievements or pressure her to do so. Sometimes, discouragement fills her. Perhaps, she thinks, she is no different from those who surround her, whose experiences have forced them to settle on piece-jobs and tin shacks.*

*She knows she wants to be somewhere different, but she doesn't know what "different" is other than what she sees on TV. To her, success means having a house and a nice car. She can envision the day when she builds a home for her mother, in exchange for all of the love she had been given, and gives back to her school, in gratitude to the select teachers who dedicated their energy and time to help her pass, even when it seemed like an impossible task.*

*However, she does not view her situation as being permanent. Her dreams stretch far beyond what it seems her circumstances would allow.*

The thirteen interviews I conducted with students from Wiggins Secondary do not condense into a simple summary. Instead they present diverse and new views that inform the field on how underprivileged students from this school perceive black wealth and how this, along

with their social environment and experiences, impact their ideas of success, dreams, and possibilities of goal fulfillment. The findings can be broken up into 6 categories: what the students dream to achieve, their perceptions of black wealth, their definitions of success and middle-class-ness, the necessity of role models, how they see their own possibilities for social mobility, and the narrative that holds them back.

### *Dreaming Big*

Students at Wiggins Secondary dream of changing their lives. They each see specific futures for themselves: jobs, new homes, further education, wealth, travel, and a stable family. Each of the students elaborated on their dreams in different ways. When I asked students the initial question, “what is your biggest dream,” most answers involved vague descriptions of success: big houses, good jobs, giving back, earning money, fancy cars, and helping people. These sentiments were expressed in nearly all of the interviews, but the specifics varied between students. Some students needed to be asked many questions before they could express detailed visions of their future, while some had clear ideas of their future that they willingly expressed without prompting.

Some students were able to describe their dreams in great detail. For example, one student, wanted to be a scientist or chemical engineer. Not only did he know the career he wanted, but he articulated a greater vision for a future of advancing world causes:

*“I am going to use science to change the world...Science is everything, so I want to create...instruments, machines, anything that will make life easier, smoother...you do know that thunderstorms have 500 killawats of energy and can light up the whole town for one night, so I am planning on inventing a machine that will harvest the power of lightning to use it to light our homes....but it seems impossible, but maybe I’ll do it.”<sup>37</sup>*

---

<sup>37</sup> Interview 10, Interview, November 6, 2014.



Similar to this student, other students could articulate not only the career they wanted but also their moral reasoning behind wanting it or what they wanted to accomplish when they had that job. In Contrast, many students had less of a concrete conception of what it meant to actually work in a certain profession, and often used general terms to describe them. Many students described being an entrepreneur as someone who “own[s] things,”<sup>38</sup> and is responsible for “operating something, managing a big company.”<sup>39</sup> One explanation for this might be that students have minimal connections to individuals who actually work in these professions. Their most common referenced sources for information on careers was the Internet and, secondly, teachers in school.<sup>40</sup>

For many students, having their own families and giving back were an integral part of their dream narrative. Financial stability and subsequent purchases, such as cars, and houses, for themselves and close relatives, were very common. Also, the dream of leaving South Africa and using their careers to travel the world and share their culture was commonly referenced. The source of the dream to travel and leave South Africa is indefinite. It is possible that my position as a foreigner prompted this answer. The desire to travel and work outside South Africa could also be a continuation of the wish for upward mobility, which would financially allow for travel, but also could be related to their wish to leave their current community. Students see the realization of these dreams as the pinnacle of success.

---

<sup>38</sup> Interview 5, Interview, October 31, 2014.

<sup>39</sup> Interview 3, Interview, October 30, 2014.

<sup>40</sup> Specifically, students interested in working in math, science or teaching learned about those things from observing or asking their teachers in school.

### *Fancy Cars, Big Houses*

As discussed above, the students directly correlated their dreams with financially successful futures, an idea which is informed by their understandings of wealth in South Africa. Interestingly, conceptual themes arose when students described what they understood of wealth. Almost all of the students used material objects and signifiers of success, specifically, big, beautiful homes and fancy cars were some of the first terms they used when describing wealth. These signifiers of wealth were used when students described their future success and when they were presenting their favorable descriptions of wealthy individuals. Students do not know the term “black diamonds,” but absolutely understand and identify with the correlated materialism and narrative of “rags to riches.” Students identified that, regardless of how an individual acquired wealth—through legal careers or criminal activity—wealth is displayed through the possession and exhibition of material items: houses, cars, nice clothes, gifts, etc. Even though the term “black diamond” isn’t commonly used, some students knew individuals living around them who would be considered “black diamonds.” This is a specific situational confirmation of Donaldson’s assertion that “black diamonds” are present in the townships and enjoy a revered status. One student mentioned a young graduate of Wiggins that he knew of who had recently found success by making it onto a professional soccer team. The soccer player stays connected with the township by coming back once every month or two in his fancy car, throwing braais and inviting his friends, but for the most part, lives a “smooth” life outside of the township.<sup>41</sup>

Their subsequent descriptions of wealth correlate with their relations to wealthy individuals, inside and outside their community. One student, whose dream was to be an entrepreneur, spent much time observing and admiring the wealthy at Gateway Mall, an upscale shopping center in Umhlanga. This young man loves walking around Gateway Mall because he

---

<sup>41</sup> Interview 12, Interview, November 6, 2014.

likes to “see all of [the] beautiful things, and beautiful people, living their lives in fancy cars and fancy houses.”<sup>42</sup> He expressed his desire to get the opportunity to live like they do and to be able to provide for his family and support people in his community as he perceived that they did. The student associated the wealthy people he observed with positive qualities, saying, that they work hard and make the right decisions in life. He also narrated their materialism positively, saying, “they live their life to the public...They show case their style. They show case money...they want to be seen that they *own* something. They *have* something.”<sup>43</sup> He, unlike many students I spoke to, actually came in contact with many wealthy people, and spent time admiring them and all of their belongings – all things he fiercely desires. For this reason, in his mind, the negative kind of wealth, as experienced in the township, is overshadowed by this glamorized view of wealth that he admires first hand.

Some students have a combination of negative and positive views of the wealthy. For example, one student said that you could understand someone’s wealth by seeing if that person was involved and gave back to the community. He continued to say that many wealthy people spend their money only on themselves. This young man identified both the tavern owner in his community who he did not personally know but whom he knew was wealthy and did not give back to the community, and the owner of a local supermarket, who he knew was wealthy and gave to the community. I predict that this student’s history of being supported by other members of the community influences and strengthens his belief that wealthy people must “support the community, so that there can be an improvement.”<sup>44</sup>

Conversely, for many students, their experiences with the wealthy are in majority, negative. Students expressed unfavorable impressions of the wealthy including, “wealthy people

---

<sup>42</sup> Interview 5, Interview, October 31, 2014.

<sup>43</sup> Interview 5, Interview, October 31, 2014.

<sup>44</sup> Interview 4, Interview, October 31, 2014.

are cruel. They don't care, they don't care about other people,"<sup>45</sup> and cited wealthy people as being selfish, corrupt, and thugs. The girl who correlated wealth with cruelty in her interview also gave examples of wealthy people she knew who embodied these qualities. She told stories of corrupt politicians, whites who manipulate BEE, and most extensively, her wealthy neighbor, who cares only of herself and drives away anyone who asks for help.<sup>46</sup> Another student called wealthy people from his community "selfish, unkind, and disrespectful," and cited business and mini-bus taxi owners as examples, as well as those who make money illegally as the only wealthy people he knew in his community. He said that he knew who the wealthy people were, but that they did not spend time interacting with the community. Peripherally, another factor that could add to this student's negative perception of wealthy individuals is that this student has a disengaged mother who is wealthy. He described her as someone who has "everything she wants," is remarried in Pretoria with another son, and is not actively involved in his life.<sup>47</sup>

The negative impact of the mini-bus taxis, their owners, and the related wealth and position on the community was referenced multiple times in the interviews. One student did not initially associate the taxi industry with wealth, but mentioned it more as an afterthought in a list of the rich people in his community. He followed up on this idea by specifically identifying their negative impact on the community, "they are always there...eish no they are not actually quite good. They are always carrying guns, which is not good for the young ones...in the taxi industry, there is always war."<sup>48</sup> These quotes demonstrate the clear negative impact of the Mini-bus taxi industry, the involved financial economy, conflicts, and violence, on students' lives.

---

<sup>45</sup> Interview 2, Interview, October 30, 2014.

<sup>46</sup> Interview 2, Interview, October 30, 2014.

<sup>47</sup> Interview 3, Interview, October 30, 2014.

<sup>48</sup> Interview 12, Interview, November 6, 2014.

Students at Wiggins widely associated people working in the government or those involved in politics with wealth, but most often reflect upon them positively and singled them out as amoral and fraudulent members of their community. Four students identified their Counselors as wealthy, and two named that individual as a corrupt or uninvolved member of the community. These students accused the Counselor of bribing police and government officials, abuse of power, misuse of funds meant for RDP housing. They said, of what he did with the government money, “only god knows,” expressing their disillusion with their leader and the government in general.<sup>49</sup> Issues of government abuse of power and mistrust of political officials have been widespread in Cato Manor, especially over the past few years. The widespread local belief that government officials have not been properly serving their constituents has led protests, violence, murder, and destruction of property.<sup>50</sup> Students feel that their government leaders are disconnected from the community and that once they ascended to power, they forgot about their connections and promises to the community. Multiple times, students alluded to Jacob Zuma as corrupt, a bad representative of the country, and a criminal, and referenced Nkandla and the rape charges against him.<sup>51</sup> Many students identify negatively with the rich, perhaps, in some way, due to their lack of positive involvement in the community, selfishness, and corruption.

### *Living the Perfect Life*

To my participants, living a life in the black middle class and being successful is considered the “perfect life.” This understanding of success and what it means to be in the black middle class changes their ideal picture of the future and their strategy for accomplishing their dreams. Students generally viewed a prosperous, successful life as one that is perfect, and

---

<sup>49</sup> Interview 2, 11, Interviews, October-November 2014.

<sup>50</sup> Faith Ka-Manzi, “Murder in Cato Manor,” *Mercury (first edition)*, July 1, 2013, Accessed November 15, 2014.

<sup>51</sup> Interviews 1, 2, 7, 8, 11, Interviews, October-November, 2014.

aspired to that at the highest degree. Their dreams to be socially mobile culminate with their and their families' position in the black middle class. Their dreams are directly connected to the abstract definitions of wealth, position, and middle-class-ness that they have in their heads – the vision of houses, cars, watches, suits, and everything else they could ever want. To some extent, this vision of the ideal exists because of their lack of connection to individuals who actually live this lifestyle.

Something that was commonly referenced by the students was the importance of giving back once they found success. Students expressed a monetary obligation that they felt to multiple outlets: parents, siblings, extended family, and community members. When talking about their dreams for success, they most often mentioned both buying their family homes and cars and giving money back to their community.

The importance of giving back is ingrained in the culture of students at Wiggins because of the history of migrant labor, remittances, and extended family systems in South Africa. Apartheid restrictions, which limited the location and kind of employment available to anyone who was not white, led to the increase in migrant labor. According to Dorrit Posel, during apartheid the economic survival of many black families relied on the employment of members of the family in urban or white areas in mining, industry, or agriculture.<sup>52</sup> Because much of the family income was being made away from the home, families relied on remittance income. According to data from a national living standards survey in 1993, Michael Carter and Julian May found that in 1993, one fourth of black households relied on remittance income.<sup>53</sup> This trend of migrant labor has continued and even increased post-apartheid: in black rural homes in 2002, 38 percent of homes reported at least one migrant worker.

---

<sup>52</sup> Dorrit Posel, "How Do Households Work? Migration, the Household and Remittance Behaviour in South Africa," *Social Dynamics* 27(1), 2001.

<sup>53</sup> Michael Carter, and Julian May, "Poverty, Livelihood and Class in Rural South Africa. *World Development* 27( 1 ), 1999.

The legacy of supporting one's family from afar has persisted in South African culture to this day. Remaining financially accountable to one's family influences the way that giving back is seen in accordance with success for wealthy or up-and-coming black South Africans. In interviews, students not only expressed the responsibility that they felt to give back, but also criticized other wealthy South Africans for not giving back to the community. One student said that that wealthy people must "provide some, like, basic needs, some education, some job opportunities because they are wealthy. They must not keep that wealthy to them."<sup>54</sup>

The cultural tradition and practice of the "extended family system," a way of living in which the familial responsibilities extend beyond the nuclear family unit, is common among black South African and impacts their definitions and manifestations of success. Because close familial relationships and homes involve family members of many generations, there are more individuals who are involved in pooling incomes and receiving resources in hard times.<sup>55</sup> For young black South Africans who are either moving up socially or are beginning to thrive financially, the pressure to provide for a large number of family members and friends is pressing,<sup>56</sup>

One of the most contradictory findings of my study is the inconsistency between students' wishes to give back to their community and their simultaneous willingness to leave as soon as they can.

*"I come from this kind of background and I want to make my background to be like a better place...I want to take my family out of this place and go to the suburbs and stuff."<sup>57</sup>*

---

<sup>54</sup> Interview 1, Interview, October 29, 2014.

<sup>55</sup> Amoateng, Acheampong, "The South African Family: Continuity or Change?" HSRC ten years of democracy seminar series, 2004. Available at: [www.hsrc.ac.za/Document-53.phtml](http://www.hsrc.ac.za/Document-53.phtml).

<sup>56</sup> Focus Group, November 21, 2014.

<sup>57</sup> Interview 12, Interview, November 6, 2014.

This presents a major dilemma in the minds of young black South Africans today: is it more important for them to follow the traditional values that they grew up with, or to move on to what, to them, seems like bigger and better things which will abandon their culture and community? The students I interviewed did not seem to be currently grappling with this moral problem because in their minds, they can dream of a future where they can follow both paths simultaneously.

When I asked these questions to a group of students in an informal focus group, however, they began to argue and question one another about what they would actually do when they were rich. When one student said that he was committed to “giv[ing] back to the community every month” and will bring “money, motivation, food, soccer balls,” another student questioned whether the students who wanted to give back would, at that point, move away from his community and into the suburbs. The student said he absolutely would, but that he would come visit every month. They then moved into a discussion about whether giving back to family was more important than giving back to the community; they came to the conclusion that these answers were based on the family and cultural values which each individual had been taught through childhood. Finally, they came to the realization that if they began giving back large sums of money to many people at the beginning of their careers, they would soon be too broke to even provide for their own basic needs. Herein lies the issue: when facing the dilemma of financial stability versus social giving, young professionals struggle to find the balance and become frustrated with their inability to provide to the extent that they had hoped.<sup>58</sup>

Because the black middle class is, according to the students, only minimally connected financially and socially to the township youth, the students do not have realistic perceptions of

---

<sup>58</sup> Focus group, November 21, 2014.



wealth and success and have a more difficult time becoming motivated to achieve their dreams because they lack a narrative to connect with and replicate.

### *Someone to Plant Ideas and Inspirations*

Each participant differed in who they looked up to or who they identified as a role model. The definition of a “role model” was wide; some students identified parents, family members, and teachers alike as role models, for a variety of reasons, most often for their giving nature, support, and selflessness. One student, for example, identified Mrs. Bishai, the director of the Umkhumbane Schools Project, as a role model because of her specific support and care.

*“The way she presents herself on us, the way she cares about it, the way she loves us, the way she think of us. She make you feel that there are possibilities where there are no possibilities...she makes you think otherwise because most people think that if you are white, you don’t care about black people...that is why she is my role model...but she doesn’t know it.”*

More commonly, however, students singled out wealthy or famous people, whom they did not personally know, as their role models. Some of these famous and rich role models included: Therry Pheto, an actress, because “she was grown from a two room shack...actually her background reflects my background,”<sup>59</sup> Pearl Madiadie, an entertainer, because “she struggled before, but now she is successful just because she persevered,”<sup>60</sup> Bonang Matheba, a television personality, because she did not have a mother and is now “living her dream...she is so successful,”<sup>61</sup> and Gcina Mhlope, a poet, because her childhood was one students with which students could connect.<sup>62</sup> This exemplified my widespread finding that students choose role models whose stories relate or reflect their own background and told a “rags to riches” narrative.

---

<sup>59</sup> Interview 1, Interview, October 29, 2014.

<sup>60</sup> Interview 7, Interview, November 3, 2014.

<sup>61</sup> Interview 9, Interview, November 5, 2014.

<sup>62</sup> Interview 11, Interview, November 6, 2014.

The students identified with people who demonstrated perseverance and morality in their lives and careers, which led them to success. One student, for example, student identified with Nelson Mandela because he said Mandela “fought for us and helped us and I want to do that too.”<sup>63</sup>

Another student identified Albert Einstein, Dmitri Mendeleev, Isaac Newton as his role models because he also wants to be able to help in “changing the world, discovering things...like: peace harmony, joy, happiness, and mak[ing] life easier.”<sup>64</sup> While connecting with popular culture role models is a meaningful way to inspire students, it limits their opportunities to use a role model to learn about and understand the more practical, daily practices of being successful, because they do not have access to more personal or specific details of those peoples’ lives.

While some students were able to identify positive role models, others really struggled to pick someone and said they had no one to look up to at all. Some students said they were actively looking for role models,

*“I would be very happy to meet that person who could tell me everything about his life, how did he start from 0 to 100, how did he manage to do all these thing, even in the hard times but he still fought.”<sup>65</sup>*

In the informal focus group I conducted, the students identified the majority of the young people in their community as a “lost generation” because the others “didn’t see a future near” and “don’t know about the real world.”<sup>66</sup> The students I spoke to suggested that they succeeded because they chose to be exposed to positive things, saying, “[you] must have dreams...must know there are positive things in life.” They said that young people need exposure to positive role models to whom they can relate, someone who has a similar past and but still achieved and “rose about

---

<sup>63</sup> Interview 6, Interview, November 3, 2014.

<sup>64</sup> Interview 10, Interview, November 6, 2014.

<sup>65</sup> Interview 5, Interview, October 31, 2014.

<sup>66</sup> Focus group, November 21, 2014.

obstacles.”<sup>67</sup> They said that their connections to role models were the only reasons that they are currently on the path to success. Without someone to demonstrate that it is possible to succeed in life, some young people become disillusioned and give up hoping for more.

### *Moving on Up- How to Do It?*

All of the students were aware of the possibility of social mobility; however, they all had different ideas and understandings of the opportunities actually available to them. For most students, the achievement of success is something semi-intangible. They see possibilities for success happening in a variety of ways, but primarily, they identify “hard work” as the main way to achieve it. Their plan to succeed starts and ends in the present. They believe that if they work hard to pass with good marks at school they will be on the path to success. Connecting with the next steps, such as social policies, political allegiances, and higher education, is either not seen as a possibility or are hard to grasp onto for most of the students.

Social policies that focus on racial redress, specifically BEE which is meant to uplift underprivileged black people, is something that is understood by students, but is not something of which they consciously reap the benefits. The students who took Business Studies as a class as well as a handful of others knew what BEE was specifically, and, for the most part, saw the policy in a positive light. They said that BEE “address[es] the imbalance of the past and wealth of the country”<sup>68</sup> and that it “works to uplift them [black people].”<sup>69</sup> They identified that BEE benefitted black South Africans because “we [black South Africans] all want to achieve and we

---

<sup>67</sup> Focus group, November 21, 2014.

<sup>68</sup> Interview 3, Interview, October 30, 2014.

<sup>69</sup> Interview 6, Interview, November 3, 2014.

can't.”<sup>70</sup> BEE, to them, is the policy that gives black people tenders and businesses, that employs black men and women to build the roads, but not something that can help them find success.<sup>71</sup>

The students' views on the benefits of political allegiances are similar to their thoughts on social redress policies – the students understand how being politically involved or aligned can be beneficial but they choose not to join because they do expect to reap the benefits. In the interviews, it was evident that very few students were actively aligned with a political party. This seemed unusual considering the level of political engagement in this country. I followed up on this idea during the informal focus group by asking a few brief follow up questions about the importance of political alliances to the students. These students said that, except in one of the student's neighborhoods, in which it was a necessity to be ANC,<sup>72</sup> being an ANC member was not deemed essential, for safety or otherwise. However, they said that everyone was ANC anyway. When I asked why, they said that there are benefits to being an ANC member, such as political positions, honor, and even bursaries, such as the “Zuma Bursary,”<sup>73</sup> all things with which they had no personal connection. Nevertheless, they said that they informally aligned with the ANC because they did not see a benefit in being anything else, saying, “the ANC will rule until Jesus comes back.” Because, overall, they see no benefits of joining the ANC, or any other party, they are unable to reap any of the emotional, political, or financial benefits of joining one of these organizations.

For many students, attending tertiary education was a necessary part of their plan to achieve success, but many lacked necessary pieces of knowledge on what they needed to do to

---

<sup>70</sup> Interview 9, Interview, November 5, 2014.

<sup>71</sup> Interview 6, Interview, November 3, 2014.

<sup>72</sup> Focus group, November 21, 2014.

<sup>73</sup> Focus group, November 21, 2014. They specifically said that they would have trouble accessing bursaries if you were not ANC, because those students who were ANC got priority. They specifically noted the “Zuma Bursary,” or the Jacob Zuma Foundation, which does provide bursaries, as the students indicated, but does not officially discriminate based on ANC membership. This is not to say that in reality, ANC membership impacts the decision.

achieve their educational dreams. Students knew that they needed to achieve good marks in school in order to get into university and that if they wanted to get a bursary that they needed exceptionally good marks, but many of them only realized the real-life implications of their grades late in their school years. This meant that some of them had unfortunate realizations that they would be unable to bring up their grades, or catch up, in time to apply to universities. For some, this meant that they would have to change career goals because their scores were not up to par. One student had long had the dream to be an ophthalmologist, but once he found out about the scores he needed to get into college for that degree, came to the realization that he, instead, would need to try to become a teacher at university.<sup>74</sup>

For many, there exists an information gap in knowledge on higher education because of a serious lack of higher education informants in their community. Only half of the students I interviewed had someone in their lives that they believed they could go to in order to get more information about attending university or college, or a “higher education informant,” as I defined them. For three of the students, their higher education informant was someone involved with the Umkhumbane Schools Project, who specifically works to help in provide university mentors for students.

Interestingly, all but one student who had a higher education informant had chosen to take the Math, Chemistry, and Physics, the classes that are stigmatized to be harder. This data brings up the thought that perhaps students who have higher education informants have more support and information in relation to their choice of classes in school and what classes they need in order to go to university for certain fields. Evidently, the involvement of a higher education informant in a student’s life greatly impacts their ability to prepare for their future and achieve

---

<sup>74</sup> Interview 8, Interview, November 5, 2014.

their dreams. Unfortunately, the reality for many students was that “Google” was the best way they could learn more about their career.

### *When “Working Hard” Isn’t Enough*

Even if students are able to concretely define their dreams of how they can become successful, sometimes they are still held back by other extenuating circumstances. There is an incredible variety of situations that can limit a students’ dream realization, including: health problems, economics, violence, psychological obstacles, community expectations, pregnancy, failure in school, family dynamic, lack of access, which, is enough to merit its own project. As referenced in the last section, many students lack someone who could provide them with a comprehensive understanding of higher education and how it can be attained. This gap is manifested through the “work hard” narrative, a story that was referenced by all of the students I spoke to which explains that hard work, in some capacity, will lead to success. Students use this narrative in two ways. First, it is used as a motivational narrative that encourages them, no matter the circumstances: if they “work hard,” that they will achieve their dreams. Secondly, it is used to legitimize wealth and success: hard work is the reason that someone has achieved their dreams. The narrative is problematic in both situations.

When the students use “working hard” to describe the process by which they will find success, the narrative is used in place of a tangible plan for the future, which would require and include details about action items. The “work hard” narrative ignores future roadblocks and once working hard proves not to be enough, I predict that students will have an easier time giving up on their dreams because the dreams were commonly abstract. Students also mentioned that their parents used the “work hard” narrative in a similar way, encouraging their children by telling them repeatedly that “hard work” is the way they can achieve mobility. Based on information I

gathered on the students' backgrounds, I believe that parents may use this phrase continually to encourage their children because they are unsure of how else to help their students succeed, academically and elsewhere.

When the “work hard” narrative is used by the students to explicate the wealthy and successful, the narrative again becomes problematic. For example, a student said of wealthy black South Africans that, “they have worked hard and they are living their dreams.”<sup>75</sup> Explaining success this way ignores the many other factors that may go into it: education, privilege, economics, role models, opportunities, scholarships, government support, connections, and more. Because these students do not know that these other factors can be necessary and also do not have access to them, it is unfair and unproductive for them to think that purely working hard can bring them the same kind of success. If the students had better access to adults from similar backgrounds who had achieved success, they would be able to better tangibly understand success and what they need to do to achieve it.

---

<sup>75</sup> Interview 11, Interview, November 6, 2014.

## **Conclusion**

Using a qualitative research design, this study was able to investigate the aspirations and understandings of success of young adults at Wiggins Secondary School and how their dreams are impacted by their perceptions of black wealth as well as their social environment and experiences.

Students at Wiggins Secondary School aspire to success. While each of their histories differ, a common narrative of struggle unites these students and pushes them to aim towards social mobility. There is no shortage of dreams, but for many, there is a shortage of reality. It is clear that students at Wiggins aspire to many things, but because of their circumstances and disconnect from success, they have blurred visions of what success means in a modern South Africa. They are willing to give everything they have in order to achieve, but the absence of higher education informants and role models who can be strategic in their planning process makes dream realization difficult.

Students are disconnected from the success to which they aspire because of their position, geographically and socially; this gap impacts the way in which they hope and plan for success. Like those before them, they dream of becoming productive members of society who cannot only provide for themselves, but also for those who have supported them to this point: family, friends, and community. These impulses to give back are positive and kind – originating from either their past, where they benefitted from the kindness of others, or from a past where someone's help could have made all of the difference.

Because of the community's disconnect from opportunities, resources, and motivation, many of the students in this school will not be able to accomplish their dreams, but that dismal fact is not the end of the story. According to both my analysis and the students themselves, the



missing factor is a positive role model who can provide inspiration, donate practical advice, and demonstrate that success is possible, no matter the circumstances.

It is not impossible to connect these needs. Many young black elites are not as involved, financially, in giving back to their home communities because the pressure to provide remittances for their extended family overrules their wish to more widely give back. However, young black students need motivation, support, and inspiration more than they need money. The joining of these groups has the potential to uplift and improve South Africa beyond belief. These young people have the ability to reconcile class imbalances and create development opportunities for their community and beyond.

These students see their dream realization as undeniable – and this positive and unrelenting passion and ambition is something that could benefit every young member of this society. They are willing to work until they achieve, and that is the kind of ambition that will allow them to ascend towards their dreams, no matter the obstacles they encounter.

The underprivileged youth of South Africa must not be ignored because their inspirations and potential contributions, motivated by the strongest of ambitions, are unbounded.

## Recommendations for Further Study

The opportunities for further study on this topic seem endless. First of all, further qualitative research with the students would absolutely advance and inform the topic. After the success of my informal focus group, I believe that conducting either additional rounds of interviews or focus groups with the students would be beneficial in gathering information. As I spent more time with the students, they trusted me more and were more willing to be increasingly more open and honest with me.

Furthermore, there are an overabundance of topics that relate and inform underprivileged youths' aspiration formation, perceptions of wealth and success, role models, and plans for the future. These topics include but are not limited to: the influence of school expectations, the rise of the EFF and other political parties, the obstacle of psychological and health problems, social and geographical barriers, the impact of violence and *thuggery*, community and family expectations, the impact of family structure and living far from home, and more – which each, on their own, merit an entire research project.

Finally, I must encourage anyone who is looking for inspiration and motivation to work with these amazing students. Speaking to them, learning about their dreams, and hearing about their opinions was incredibly worthwhile. Not only will additional researchers never have a shortage of data, but they also will find so much personal satisfaction and enjoyment from working with the Umkhumbane Schools Project and at Wiggins School.

## Bibliography

### *Primary Sources:*

- Interview 1. Interview. October 20, 2014.  
Interview 2. Interview. October 30, 2014.  
Interview 3. Interview. October 30, 2014.  
Interview 4. Interview. October 31, 2014.  
Interview 5. Interview. October 31, 2014.  
Interview 6. Interview. November 3, 2014.  
Interview 7. Interview. November 3, 2014.  
Interview 8. Interview. November 5, 2014.  
Interview 9. Interview. November 5, 2014.  
Interview 10. Interview. November 6, 2014.  
Interview 11. Interview. November 6, 2014.  
Interview 12. Interview. November 6, 2014.  
Interview 13. Interview. November 11, 2014.  
Focus Group. Focus Group. November 21, 2014.

### *Secondary Sources:*

- African Development Bank. "The middle of the pyramid: Dynamics of the middle class in Africa." *Market Brief* 20 (April, 2001): in Ballard. "Geographies of development: without the poor." (2012).
- Andrews, Matthew. "Is Black Economic Empowerment a South African Growth Catalyst? (Or Could it Be...)." Unpublished working paper for *Center for International Growth Panel Initiative*. Kennedy School. Harvard University. (2007).
- Amoateng, Acheampong. "The South African Family: Continuity or Change?" HSRC ten years of democracy seminar series, 2004. Available at: [www.hsrc.ac.za/Document-53.phtml](http://www.hsrc.ac.za/Document-53.phtml).
- Arulmani, G. and De Perez, M Mays. "Rethinking observation form method to context." (2001). in Buthelezi, et al, "Adolescents' Perceived Career Challenges and Needs in a Disadvantaged Context in South Africa from a Social Cognitive Career Theoretical Perspective" (2009).
- Ballard, Richard. 'Black diamonds (South Africa's black middle class).' (forthcoming 2015). in Stone, John. Rutledge, Rizova, Smith, and Hou. (eds) *Encyclopedia of Race Ethnicity and Nationalism*. Wiley-Blackwell.
- Ballard, Richard. "Geographies of development: without the poor." *Progress in Human Geography* 36: 563 (2012).
- Buthelezi, et al. "Adolescents' Perceived Career Challenges and Needs in a Disadvantaged Context in South Africa from a Social Cognitive Career Theoretical Perspective." *South African Journal of Higher Education* 23, no. 3, (2009).
- Carter, Michael. And May, Julian. "Poverty, Livelihood and Class in Rural South Africa." *World Development* 27(1), 1999.

- “Cato Manor.” *The Official Page of the eThekweni Municipality*. eThekweni Municipality. 2011. Accessed November 20, 2014. Accessible at [www.durban.gov.za](http://www.durban.gov.za).
- “Cato Manor Area Based Management and Development Programme.” *Municipal Institute of Learning*. eThekweni Municipality & European Union. 2011. Accessed November 24, 2014. Accessible at [www.mile.org.co.za](http://www.mile.org.co.za).
- Dass-Bralisford, Priscilla. “Exploring resiliency: Academic achievement among disadvantaged black youth in South Africa.” *South African Journal of Psychology* 35 (no. 3): 2005.
- Donaldson, Ronnie, Mehlomakhulu, Thobeka. et al. “Relocation: to be or not to be a black diamond in a South African township.” *Habitat International* 39 (2013).
- Fabricant, N. Performative politics: The Camba countermovement in eastern Bolivia. *American Ethnologist* 36: (2009). In Ballard, Richard, “Geographies of development: without the poor,” (2012).
- Freidman, Steven. Hudson, Judi. and Mackay, Shaun. “The colour of giving: racial identity and corporate social investment” in Habib, Maharaj, *Giving & Solidarity*, 207-241.
- Gibbs, Andrew. et al. “Mismatches between youth aspirations and participatory HIV/AIDS programmes in South Africa.” *African Journal of AIDS Research* 9, (no. 2): 2010.
- Habib, Adam. Maharaj, Brij. *Giving & Solidarity*. HSRC Press: Cape Town (2008).
- Ka-Manzi, Faith. “Murder in Cato Manor.” *Murcury (first edition)*. July 1, 2013. Accessed November 15, 2014.
- Lu, Yao. And Treiman, Donald. “Migration, Remittances, and Educational Stratification among Blacks in Apartheid and post-Apartheid South Africa.” *Social Forces* 89, no. 4 (2011). *Mail and Guardian*. “Townships still home to many, but emigration beckons.” (2009). Accessed 25 October 2014 in Donaldson et al, “Relocation: to be or not to be a black diamond in a South African township.” (2013).
- Maira. “Missing: Youth, Citizenship, and empire after 9/11.” (2009). and Weller. “Teach us something useful: contested spaces of teenagers’ citizenship.” (2003). in Staeheli, Hammett. “For the future of the nation!: Citizenship, nation, and education in South Africa.” (2013).
- Mitchell, Carolyn. “Perceptions of grade 11 pupils with regards to career choice and career information.” Unpublished Masters of Arts Thesis (2011).
- Naicker, A. “The psycho-social context of career counseling in South African schools.” *South African Journal of Psychology* 24 (1994).
- Posel, Deborah. “Races to Consume.” *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 33, no. 2 (2010).
- Posel, Dorrit. “How Do Households Work? Migration, the Household and Remittance Behaviour in South Africa,” *Social Dynamics* 27(1), 2001.
- Posel, Dorrit. Casale, Daniela. “International labour migration and household poverty in post-apartheid South Africa” in: Kanbur, R. and Borat, H. (eds) *Poverty and Policy in Post-Apartheid South Africa*, Pretoria: HSRC Press.
- Seekings and Natrass. *Class, Race, and Inequality in South Africa*. University of KwaZulu Natal Press. (2006).

- Sifunda, Charity Thobile. "An exploration of focus groups as a means of investigation career thinking and exploration in a sample." Unpublished Thesis for Master of Educational Psychology. University of Natal (2001).
- Spaull, Nicholas. "Poverty & Privilege: Primary School Inequality in South Africa." Unpublished working paper for Stellenbosch University and Bureau for Economic Research. Stellenbosch University, (July 2012).
- Staeheli, Lynn. and Hammett, Daniel. "For the future of a nation: Citizenship, nation, and education in South Africa." *Political Geography* 32: (2013).
- The Times. "ANC taught Sam manners." 6 March 2009. in Posel. "Races to Consume." (2010).
- UCT Unilever Institute. [www.unileverinstitute.co.za](http://www.unileverinstitute.co.za). (2007). in Donaldson, et al. "Relocation: to be or not to be a black diamond in a South African township." 115.
- "The Umkhumbane Schools Project- Education for South Africa's Future." *The Umkhumbane Schools Project*. 2014. Accessed November 10, 2014. Accessible at [www.umkhumbane.org](http://www.umkhumbane.org) .

Appendix A:

Interviewee	Age	M/F	Languages <i>E- English</i> <i>Z- isiZulu</i> <i>X- Xhosa</i> <i>S- Sutu</i> First language listed first	Grade	Guardian	Age of Other Children in House	Family Occupations	Connections to Higher Education	Umkhumbane Schools Project Members	Role Model	House Description	Dream Job	“Work Hard”	Failed a Grade
1	17	F	X, S, Z, E	11	Aunt, Uncle Mother (Eastern Cape)	Cousins (3)	Aunt (unclear), Uncle (drives staff car for children)	-	N	Therry Pheto	-	Actress	Y	-
2	16	F	Z, E	11	Mother	16,9,7	Mother- clothing factory	Cousin Sister (UKZN-law)	N	Teacher in Primary	4 room	Teacher	Y	-
3	17	M	Z, E	11	Sister, 29 (Mother, Pretoria)	10,6	Sister- Grocery Store Mother- Ambiguous well-paid job (Jo-berg)	-	N	Previous Boss (White Entrepreneur), US Fashion Designer	-	Entrepreneur	Y	-
4	16	F	Z, E	11	Mother, Sister (23)	-	Mother- Cell C Call Centre (occupation unclear) Sister- (Ushaka)	-	N	Uncle (teacher), Senzo Meyiwa	A “good place”	Social Worker, Soccer Player	Y	-
5	17	M	Z, X, E	11	Mom, Step-father	10, 6	Father- Self-employed plumber Mother (supervisor, hotel)	-	N	DJ Sbu, Looking for Businessman	Simple, Family Home	Entrepreneur	Y	-
6	16	M	Z, E	11	Mother	24, 23, 22	Brother (piece jobs, renovates houses)	-	N	Nelson Mandela, Teachers	Looks like Other Houses	Teacher	Y	-

7	18	F	F	Z, E	11	Parents (non-biological in Mayville) and Parents (in rural)	Cousin Siblings in Mayville (2)	Father -Toyota Mother- cares for kids Father (rural)- Construction	-	N	Mother's Auntie (nurse), Pearl Modiadie	"Flats"	Nurse (in another country)	Y	Y
8	16	M	M	Z, E	11	Mother, Father (foster parents)	19	Mother- cleaner Father- Car Attendant, BP	Sister (Dental Durgeon), Ms. Bishai	Y	Ms. Bishai	7 rooms	Teacher, Optometrist, Pedestrian	Y	-
9	16	F	F	Z, E	11	Dad, Gran, Aunt (Mother in another home)	27,24	Dad- car dealership Aunt- domestic worker Cousin- bakery Cousin- Pep store manager	Mother	Y	Mother, "Haven't seen Any," Bonang Matheba	7 rooms	Captain, Nurse	Y	-
10	19	M	M	Z, E	11	Mother	Older Brothers (2)	Piece Jobs	Umkhumbane School Project	Y	Albert Einstein, Dmitri Mendeleev, Isaac Newton	Small 2 Room	Scientist	Y	Y
11	18	F	F	X, Z, E	11	Mother, Stepdad, (Auntie, lives far away)	13, 10	Father- Security guard, on and off	Engineering Teacher	Y	Geina Mhlopho	Renting 1 room	Poet, Civil Engineer	Y	-
12	17	M	M	Z, X, E	11	Mother	22, 3	Mother- KFC	Brother – UKZN (teacher)	Y	Brother, Teacher, Wiggins (physical science)	4 rooms	Doctor	Y	-
13	17	F	F	Z/X, E	11	Sister (31)	15, 11, 7	All don't work	Sister	Y	Sister (UKZN-teaching)	5 rooms	Doctor	Y	-

## Appendix B: Interview Guideline

Can you tell me your full name and age?

What languages do you speak?

What is the address at which you currently live? How long have you lived there?

Can you tell me all of the people who also currently live at that address and how they relate to you, if they do? Can you describe your home for me?

Who looks after you in your home? How does your family support themselves financially?

If someone asked you the question, “who are you” what would you say?

Where do you attend school? Which classes in school do you like the best? Why?

Are you proud of your work at school? Is school difficult for you?

Do your parents support you in your school-work? Friend/classmates?

Do you think your school is preparing you to follow your dreams?

What is your biggest dream?

How would you rank these different kinds of achievements in importance to you: job, home, money, family, material belongings?

How are you working to achieve that now and in the future?

Who supports you in your dream? Have you told anyone?

Do you know anyone who has ever achieved \_\_\_\_\_ the dream they said above \_\_\_? (If no, do you have another role model?)

What is their story? Would you want that to be their story? What about their story would you want for your own life?

Do you have someone from popular culture who is your role model?

Tell me about when you feel discouraged?

Tell me about when you feel optimistic about your future?

How do those things make you feel?

What do you do when you feel like that?

If I say “wealthy,” what comes to mind for you? How do you know if someone is wealthy or “has money?” Are there different kinds of wealth? (When you look around, do all people with wealth act the same?)

Have you heard of BEE? Can you tell me what it is?

Do you know the term “black diamond”?

What do you think of black people in this country who are very wealthy?

What do you think people who are really wealthy?

Are there any wealthy people in your community?

Who in this country do you think has the most wealth? What neighborhoods?

Do you know anyone who is very wealthy? How do you know them?

If you had a lot of money, how would you spend it?

Do you think anything is preventing you from getting to that position?