


Fall 2016

Human Rights Education: A Tool for the Cultivation of National Human Rights Culture in Morocco

Page Benoit
SIT Study Abroad

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcollections.sit.edu/isp_collection

 Part of the [African Studies Commons](#), [Education Commons](#), [Other Public Affairs, Public Policy and Public Administration Commons](#), [Other Social and Behavioral Sciences Commons](#), [Politics and Social Change Commons](#), [Race, Ethnicity and Post-Colonial Studies Commons](#), and the [Social Policy Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Benoit, Page, "Human Rights Education: A Tool for the Cultivation of National Human Rights Culture in Morocco" (2016). *Independent Study Project (ISP) Collection*. 2519.
https://digitalcollections.sit.edu/isp_collection/2519

This Unpublished Paper is brought to you for free and open access by the SIT Study Abroad at SIT Digital Collections. It has been accepted for inclusion in Independent Study Project (ISP) Collection by an authorized administrator of SIT Digital Collections. For more information, please contact digitalcollections@sit.edu.

Human Rights Education:

A Tool for the Cultivation of National Human Rights Culture in Morocco

*Benoit, Page
Benghazi, Taieb
Bard College
Human Rights
Africa, Morocco, Rabat*

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirement for MOR, SIT Abroad, Fall 2016

Abstract

Human rights have been taught in Morocco for twenty years. Since the process of Moroccan transitional justice, the aim of this human rights education has been to promote a national human rights culture. This research is a cross-comparison between how human rights education; for the purpose of creating a human rights aware society, is presented and enacted by the the Moroccan government and how it is presented and enacted by non-governmental bodies in a post transitional justice moment of history. The study was conducted through a qualitative data method. It includes interviews with the Inter-Ministerial Delegation of Human Rights and Amnesty International. There is also analysis of United Nations reports on the status of human rights education in Morocco. The paper evaluates the trainings, curriculums and facilitation of human rights education within the Moroccan school system. The study concludes by asserting that though the Moroccan government has taken steps to create a national human rights culture, this is an impossibility for both governmental and nongovernmental organizations until there is transparency and accountability in regard to the human rights abuses of the past.

Key Words:

Education: General, Peace & Social Justice, Human Development

Acknowledgments

I would like to thank my academic director, Taieb Benghazi, for all of his help with my research and for his guidance during my time in Morocco. I would also like to thank my advisor Mohamed Melouk for giving me direction within my research. Thank you to Nawal Chaib the Program Assistant. Lastly, thank you to all my interviewees who were more gracious and informative then I could have ever hoped for.

Table of Contents

Title Page.....	1
Abstract.....	2
Acknowledgments.....	2
Table of Contents.....	3
Introduction.....	4
Literature and Historical Review.....	5
Methods.....	11
Analysis.....	13
• Interview One.....	14
• Interview Two.....	16
• Interview Three.....	19
• United Nations General Assembly United Nations Report.....	25
• Synthesis	26
Conclusion.....	28
Appendix.....	30
• Question Guide Interview One.....	30
• Question Guide Interview Two.....	31
• Question Guide Interview Three.....	32
• Question Guide For Analysis of United Nations General Assembly Report.....	35
• Consent Form.....	36
Bibliography.....	38

Introduction

Human rights education has been promoted in Morocco since the 1990's in an attempt to create a national human rights culture. After coming across this information, I was drawn to the history of twenty years of work towards a human rights inclusive society, in the hopes that I could acquire an understanding of how human rights culture had developed in the last two decades as the country went through radical changes itself. Upon finding out that there had been a process of transitional justice in 2004 and that one of the recommendations of the state was that they revamp human rights education. I knew I wanted to study human rights education within a post transitional justice society. How was human rights culture be achieved within a country that was still reconciling with a past rife with human rights abuses. This lead me to my subject of research; a cross-comparison between how human rights education - for the purpose of creating a human rights aware society - is presented and enacted by the the Moroccan government and how it is presented and enacted by non-governmental bodies in a post transitional justice moment of history.

This paper goes through the history of human rights internationally as well as in Morocco. It touches on human rights education, human rights int as an innately western institution and the theory behind citizens being aware of their rights. It continues with the interviews I conducted with the Moroccan government and the interview conducted with the international nongovernmental organization Amnesty International. I then analyze the United Nations review of human rights education within Morocco. Lastly, I synthesize the information and apply it within the context of human rights culture in a post transitional justice country.

Literature and Historical Review

With the recognition of tragedy comes the responsibility to continue, to remember and move forward: more than anything, however, there is the responsibility to ensure that the past cannot be repeated. In Morocco's case, a long history of human rights abuses can be observed; from the colonial occupation, to the tensions between the Western Sahara today, there has always been room for reevaluation and tolerance. The Moroccan government has taken steps to improve the status of human rights within the country. One of the ways this has been done is by implementing the teaching of human rights within school systems. The historical context of this process as well as its implementation cannot be separated from the reality of human rights in Morocco today.

In 1956, Morocco gained independence from the French. This was after almost 45 years of colonial rule. The transition put King Hassan II in full control of the country. This era; 1956-1999, better known as the Years of Lead, ushered in a profusion of human rights abuses. These mainly being; the unlawful imprisonment of citizens, the disappearance of citizens and the violation of civil liberties. The main targets of these oppressive behaviors were those who spoke out against the monarchy and political dissidents. The abuses did not go unrecognized within the country or on the international stage. In the later years of King Hassan II's reign, it became clear that if the monarchy was going to survive there needed to be a change to the current state of human rights within the country. In 1990, The National Human Rights Council was created. This came hand in hand with a scathing World Bank report on human rights in Morocco. It was published without the support of the state in one of the country's major newspapers. In 1996, there was a commission to integrate the Departments of Education and the Departments of

Human Rights. With Hassan II's health failing his son, Mohammed VI new he had to distance himself from his father. One of the ways he did this, after he became king in 1999, was by creating the Commission of Equity and Reconciliation. The Commission was designed to lead the country through a process of transitional justice. (Moudden, 2016)

Transitional justice is a form of recognition of in country trauma and abuse. The practice became popularized in the 1970's with cases such as Argentina and South Africa. Typically, transitional justice is the peaceful transition from authoritarian governments to democracies. It usually manifests in three ways: Truth Commissions, Documentation of Violence and Reparations. Out of the 40 countries who have participated in transitional justice the case of Morocco had one key difference; there was no transition of power. Morocco was symbolically going through the process of transitional justice with no shift in government. King Mohammed VI remained in power. (Moudden, 2016)

The details of transitional justice in Morocco were just as controversial as their end goal. The country took part in all three typical aspects of transitional justice, but with some stipulations. The documentation of abuses was left to the 17 members of the commission. They reviewed more than 17,000 cases. The commission also participated in public hearings that were televised all over the country. In these hearings, victims of the Years of Lead came forward and told their personal experiences. The main critique of this process was that though victims were aloud to retell what happened to them; they were not allowed to name names. There were no prosecutions as a result of the Moroccan public truth commissions. The philosophy behind this choice was that there is healing in speaking. Also that since it was the Moroccan state itself, as an independent entity, that committed the crimes there were no individuals who could be

punished. Another aspect of the Commission was to come up with a comprehensive strategy for monetary compensation for the victims. This was a difficult task because how does one put a monetary value of human life, the experience of trauma or the experience of rape? In the end, the Moroccan government paid more than \$200 million to about 90% of the victims of the Years of Lead. This choice to put so much money into compensation has been seen as an attempt to make up for the lack of prosecutions. The final act of the Equity and Reconciliation Commission was to write up a final report and present it to King Mohammed VI. It summarized the findings and recommendations of the Commission and presented a plan of how Morocco should move forward as a country. (Moudden, 2016)

The main conclusions of the report were that the country needed to separate power and government. This would happen through the implementation of democracy, checks and balances, reform to the police system, the judiciary system and renewed focus on traditional arts and culture. The recognition of the validity of minority groups was seen as fundamental to the continual development of the country. Lastly, the commission issued that human rights should be taught in schools “so as to consolidate the values of democracy and human rights in society and avoid repetition of the violations of the past (Kingdom of Morocco Equity and Reconciliation Commission 2005, pg. 68). “...with the aim of producing a generation who is conscious of and believe in the values of citizenship, tolerance, pluralism and the right to differ, and providing an environment that facilitates the establishment of relationships on the basis of respect for human dignity, and activating the mind, thinking and creating“ (Kingdom of Morocco Equity and Reconciliation Commission 2005, pg. 68)

Teaching human rights in an attempt to cultivate a society that emulates human rights formally finds its roots in international law. In 1994, the United Nations put renewed focus on article 26 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. Article 26 states:

“ Education shall be directed to the full development of the human personality and to the strengthening of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms. It shall promote understanding, tolerance and friendship among all nations, racial or religious groups, and shall further the activities of the United Nations for the maintenance of peace. (The United Nations, 1948, art. 26)”

This focus took the form of starting the United Nations Decade for Human Rights Education. It was a series of plans, guidelines and initiatives that were enacted throughout the world with the intent of teaching human rights. Overall, the project was a blueprint, created by the General Assembly, that could be applied in almost any nation that showed interest in human rights. The basic tenants of the United Nations plan would provide:

“(a) A definition of human rights education in the school system based on internationally agreed principles; (b) A user-friendly guide to developing and/or improving human rights education in the school system, by proposing concrete actions for implementation at the national level; (c) A flexible guide which can be adapted to different contexts and situations and to different types of education systems.” (World Program for Human Rights Education, 2005).

Human Rights as a concept is vague. It allows for multiple interpretations. This means that the details of the United Nations plan were incredibly important. It was vital that education happen in an all inclusive human rights environment; that the administration, the teachers and the pupils had to always uphold human rights values. There could be no room in a human rights

aware school for authoritarian systems, non inclusive curriculums and environments. However, there also needed to be room for adjustment; in the case of cultural contexts. The United Nations premised that for human rights teaching to be effective there had to be applicability for students. Human Rights could not be taught in the void of international law.

“Human rights education encompasses: (a) Knowledge and skills—learning about human rights and mechanisms for their protection, as well as acquiring skills to apply them in daily life; (b) Values, attitudes and behavior—developing values and reinforcing attitudes and behavior which uphold human rights; (c) Action taking —action to defend and promote human rights.(World Program for Human Rights Education, 2005)

In other words there needed to be historical and cultural contexts involved in the design of human rights aware curriculums.

Morocco is one of the countries who participated in the Decade of Human Rights Education. However, they did so in their own way. The Plan of Action World Program for Human Rights Education suggested that human rights be taught by way of an international guideline. Morocco created its own curriculums. Since the mid-90’s, Morocco has incorporated citizenship training into all aspects of school. Citizenship courses begin in the 11th grade. Sixty minutes a week are dedicated to the class. As stated in A Review of Citizenship Training in Arab Nations, “The majority of the nations studied use the term “national” in their civics courses to emphasize the concepts of patriotism and loyalty to the political regime. (Faour 2013, pg. 8)” “They also do not address the authoritarian nature of political regimes and the prevalence of serious deviations from democracy, such as sectarianism, corruption, and the absence of transparency and public accountability. (Faour 2013, pg.10)” When it comes to human rights,

Morocco teaches just the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. It does not go into the history of human rights within the country. When the Declaration is taught it is always contextualized and mixed in with Arabic Language and Islamic studies. (Faour 2013, pg.13) This can be problematic because of the innate contradictions within the Universal Declaration and Religious Studies. This becomes more complicated because of the Moroccan King's role as Commander of the Faithful. "As Defender of the Faith, he (the king) shall ensure respect for the constitution. He shall be the protector of the rights and liberties of citizens, social groups and organizations" (Faour 2013, pg.20).

The global history of human rights has to be factored into the overall Moroccan human rights experience. The Universal Declaration of Human Rights was created in 1948 post World War II. The Allied forces wanted to create a set of international guidelines that upheld the value of human life and dignity. The Declaration was reactionary to the horrors witnessed in Nazi Germany. It is important to take into account that colonialism was still a major force in 1948. Many countries did not have autonomy. Almost all of Africa and the Middle East were not given a voice in the Declaration. Morocco was one of these countries. It was controlled by France until 1956. Despite not being able to give input into the original document, Morocco has embraced human rights. However, there has been a critique of the Universal Declaration, saying that because of its roots in a colonial world - especially since it's main tenants are based off of philosophical ideas from the American and French revolutions - it (the Declaration) is blind to the cultural realities of some of countries. For instance, Morocco is an Islamic country. 99% of its citizens practice the religion. This tied in with Moroccan, Arab and Imazighen culture create an environment where the collective is valued more than the individual. The community is

paramount. This is in direct contradiction to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights tenets of individualism. (Mcguinness, 2011)

Methods

Going into this research, I understood that I was going to have serious limitations. For one, I am an American student who has not been fully immersed in Moroccan culture. Three months is in no way a sufficient amount of time to understand the complexity of a country and a culture that is thousands of years old. My lived experience was going to be inseparable from my research. It was going to affect it. I had to take into account all personal and environmental variables that would affect the final product of my paper. The three weeks given for research was going to shape my project more than anything else. I had to come up with a methodology that would be succinct and effective within that time period. It would have to be a methodology of qualitative research.

Human rights education is a broad subject. As I did more research I only found this to be more true. Originally, my intent had been to approach the subject through the lens of formal education in public schools within Morocco. After conducting an extensive literature review on; the history of international human rights, human rights in Morocco, both international and national human rights education systems and citizenship training. I came to the conclusion that I needed to narrow my topic. I decided to research how the Moroccan government presents human rights education, in contrast to the reality of other institutions working within the field; all in a post transitional justice society. Going in, I postulated that there would be discrepancies between the realities of modern Morocco and the image put forward by the government. My main assumptions were that the information presented to me would be progressive in writing but

not in practice; that the progressions would only be in certain fields. I expected topics such as LGBTQ rights, race and some aspects of gender to only be promoted in culturally relative terms, rather than on the level of UN conventions. I also thought that any actors or institutions that worked closely with the Moroccan government would be hesitant to criticize it. In the past three months spent in Morocco, I have found that when asked questions concerning rights violations within the country, citizens tend to assert that everything is fine, everything is legal and everything is equal. This seems to be a cultural byproduct of the repressive years of the past.

The next step was to start my qualitative data collection. I conducted three interviews. Two were within the Inter-ministerial Delegation for Human Rights and one was with Amnesty International. All interviews were in English. This put serious strain on the abilities of my interviewees to understand my questions and express themselves in the ways that they wanted to. I speak limited French. It was not enough to conduct an interview, but sometimes, it was used as a clarification tool. If I knew the French equivalent of a word or phrase, I would try to double check the meaning that an interviewee was asserting. French itself is a colonial language so even this attempt at clarification was weighted. All three interviews were initiated through the interdiction of a mutual contact; either a professor or through a previous interviewee. Email, phone and text were used to schedule the details of the interviews. All three meetings took place in the interviewee's respected offices. All interviewees were presented with a consent form that reviewed their rights as interviewees.¹ In the interviews I asked a number of premeditated questions and gave time for the interviewees to ask their own questions, as well as elaborate on any subjects that they thought I should know about. The final step of my research was to gather,

¹ Consent form in the appendix.

read and analyze international and internal reports about human rights and human rights education within Morocco.

Other factors beside my nationality, the short time frame and the language barrier that have affected my research are my small data pool and my personal bias towards the effectiveness of human rights. In an ideal world, I would have liked to interview not just institutions who work with human rights education but also those who experience it. My paper would have been stronger if it had included the lived experiences of teachers and students. However, due to my lack of language skills and the difficulties of interviewing minors, I was not able to make this happen. My research would also have been stronger if it had included people working other departments of the Moroccan government. This is especially true in the cases of CCDH and the Ministry of Education. Attempts at contact were made but none were fruitful. In regard to the final bias mentioned, it needs to acknowledge that I have spent the past three years immersed in a liberal academic human rights environment. Studying human rights at university has ingrained certain opinions about the implementation of human rights. These no doubt affected the questions I asked and my analysis of the answers.

Analysis

The two interviews that I conducted for my research within the Moroccan government encompassed the general state of human rights and the specificities of the promotion of human rights education within Morocco. I thought it was important to understand how human rights culture was being taught, to not just in civil society, but also its implementation in all sectors of Morocco. Both interviews were conducted at the Inter-ministerial Delegation for Human Rights offices in Rabat. The DIDH "...is a governmental authority attached to the chief of the

Government, charged with working out and implementing the government policy related to the defense, respect, protection and promotion of human rights in coordination with the government departments and collaborating organizations. (Souag, 2016)” In other words, DIDH is in charge of making sure that the international human rights standards and those of the county are upheld. It is also important to state that this department is tasked with maintaining the public image of Moroccan human rights. It was created in the wake of the 2011 Arab Spring, when the new constitution was enacted. Up until 2011, many human rights were written but not enforced. The Arab Spring brought renewed attention to the government’s apathy. DIDH was the government's solution for the lack of an accountability system.

Interview One

My first interview was with the Secretary General of DIDH, Abderrazak Rouwane. Secretary General Rouwane has worked at the Inter-delegation of Human Rights since its inception. Our interview was on the general work done by the delegation. It covered the strategic objective of the delegation from 2012-2016. The first role of the DIDH is to monitor other government bodies. This is not just in regard to human rights, but all aspects of governance such as reduction of energy and the implementation of public policy. The second role of DIDH is to develop partnerships with civil society; especially NGOs. DIDH gives money to NGOs to work on human rights projects in Morocco. Just this year, money was given to 15 NGO’s participating in the United Nations conference on climate change, COP 22. The Secretary General stated that NGOs were integral to human rights development within Morocco. He said this is especially the case in regard to human rights education. DIDH also interacts with international organizations that promote Moroccan values and goals.

In 2016, DIDH had three strategic objectives; 1. Supporting the promotion of protection of human rights, 2. Enhancing dialogue and partnerships with Moroccan stakeholders, and 3. Reenforcing interaction with international actors. Since my research is specifically in regard to human rights we focused on that strategic objective. DIDH's work with human rights is on the promotion of the Citizen Platform for the Promotion of the Culture of Human Rights. The Citizen Platform is fundamental to the cultivation of human rights culture in Morocco. It works with educators and professionals to raise awareness about human rights. To truly reach a human rights culture there has to be integration of human rights into all aspects of society. How DIDH does this, is they facilitate classes and seminars on human rights for civil society and governmental factions. DIDH also consults with Ministries within the government on policy and actions that are human rights compatible. Currently, the DIDH is working with media because it has the most impact within the country. The media can resolve problems and tensions more effectively than any other institution. The media as a tool was vital when human rights work was just beginning. This was because there were those within the country who opposed human rights. The opposition did not understand human rights compatibility with Islamic culture. With a good comprehension it is clear the the values are the same. Media helped disseminate this message.

When asked about the most important human rights advances in Morocco, the Secretary General talked about the original human rights advancement. After the fall of the Berlin Wall, late King Hassan II saw that the world was opening up to human rights and it was time for a change in Morocco. This realization sparked a national debate that lead to the creation of CCDH in 1990 (now known as the CNDH) and later changes to the Mudawana code in 2004, lead to the

creation of the Equity and Reconciliation Commission, also in 2004, and its followup to make sure the recommendations from the commission had been implemented in 2006.

The the Secretary General went on to say that Equity and Reconciliation Commission started a new decade of democracy, conversation, tolerance of difference and diversity. He continued by saying that the hardest challenge facing Morocco in the future was making sure that the process of democratization would succeed. The new constitution of 2011 would have to be implemented to its full extent and the judiciary needs to be reformed. Most importantly, the Secretary General asserted that human rights culture can only succeed when all sectors of society have human rights incorporated into them. He went on to say that human rights and education are vital to democracy and democracy was the sure way for Morocco to thrive in the future.²

Interview Two

My second interview was with Ahmed Chakib. He is the Chef de la Division de la Promotion des Droits de l'Homme. This interview was focused on the promotion of human rights education. Mr. Chakib has worked at the DIDH since 2011. Before that, he held a role in the Ministry of Education and from 1993-2004 he worked at a special ministry for human rights. This put him in a unique position to understand not just how human rights had progressed in Morocco, but also the progression of education. Starting chronologically, Mr. Chakib worked his way through the progression of human rights education in the 1990's. He started with the convention that integrated the Ministries of Human Rights and Education in 1996. Then went on to point out that this was before the United Nations Decade of Human Rights Education. The first step of this integration was to change the curriculum so it would meet human rights

² Question guide for Interview One is in appendix.

standards. This included all images and passages in textbooks that were derogatory or demeaning to the “other”. Another vital aspect of creating a human rights friendly environment was to change the mindset of all facets of the school system. Everyone had to become aware of human rights. This included, not just the students, but teachers, the principal and the administration. Mr. Chakib stated that these educators were trained by human rights experts within the government and civil society. The specialists made modules for the teaching of human rights and the incorporation of human rights into other parts of school.

When asked if there was resistance to incorporating human rights into society, Mr. Chakib made it clear that it was not an easy process. There were many obstacles. However, he did say that the atmosphere in the early 1990’s was conducive towards human rights. The steps previously taken by the government towards giving human rights the weight that they needed in Morocco, smoothed the way to incorporating it into all aspects of society. The creation of the CCDH, the promotion of civil society and the media were all building blocks in process of creating a human rights aware society.

The subject of human rights compatibility with Moroccan culture was also brought up. When asked about the implementation of a system like human rights - that is an individualistic system - into a culture such as Morocco - which is a culture built on the collective - Mr. Chakib asserted that the spread of information became critical for the promotion of human rights in regard to the public masses. The media was the government's strongest tool. It allowed human rights education to reach all different types of people.

The biggest pushback the government faced was from the conservatives with in islamic culture. They opposed this new (human rights) culture saying that is went against islamic

principles and ethics. However, with education and information the government was able to show that with a good comprehension of human rights and a good comprehension of the roots of islamic culture, it was clear that they are morally very similar and compatible. With the passing of time since the introduction of human rights in Morocco, the meld of human rights and Muslim Moroccan culture has only grown stronger.

One of the reasons Mr. Chakib accounts for a strong human rights culture is because of the relationship that the Moroccan government has with NGOs. He stated that NGOs have been fundamental to the success of human rights within the country. The work done not just within schools with teachers, students, curriculums and human rights clubs but also with the overall incorporation of human rights into Moroccan culture is commendable. There are very few NGOs within Morocco that do not work with in the human rights sector. Their contributions have been invaluable.

The last topic touched upon in the interview was that of Morocco's human rights culture. It has been twenty years since the initiative began in the early 1990's. When asked what the most important contribution to the promotion of human rights was, Mr Chakib said the process of Transitional Justice. That this pivotal moment of reconciliation within the country allowed for a stable future; where human rights could really be promoted. He continued to postulate that Morocco was in a unique place within it's history to continue to remember the past. That, One; learning about the human rights abuses of the past could help people protect themselves in the future, and Two; reconciliation of the tensions within the country's past had healed old wounds

and now assured no repetitions of those abuses in the future. In summary, that knowledge is critical if one wants to live as an informed and active citizen within a human rights culture.³

Interview Three

The final interview I conducted was at Amnesty International. It was with with Touria Bouabid. She is the coordinator of the Human Rights Education Department. The interview was translated from Arabic to English by Fadoua El Bouamraoui. She is the Mobilization and Growth Coordinator. We started the interview with the mission of Amnesty International and how the Rabat office adapts said mission to the Moroccan context. Amnesty International is an international organization that “Through our (Amnesty International’s) detailed research and determined campaigning, we help fight abuses of human rights worldwide. We bring torturers to justice. Change oppressive laws. And free people jailed just for voicing their opinion. (Amnesty International, 2016)” It functions as an organization by working towards strategic objectives or, simply put, long term goals. Local membership made of educators, lawyer and student groups help with these goals. Logistically, the Moroccan section of Amnesty functions with operational plans created every two years. These plans are drawn from the global movement and the local context and are executed by local activists and members as well as in an integrated approach with Amnesty International staff. Funding comes from the organization itself and outside sources such as the United Nations and the European Union.

Each department of Amnesty International has their own independent projects. Human rights education is one of the oldest projects in the Moroccan branch. It started about 20 years ago. The project originated with Amnesty focusing on education training centers. Training

³ Question Guide for Interview Two is in the appendix.

centers are where teachers go to learn how to teach. Amnesty trained teachers to have a holistic universal view of human rights. Then, when these teachers were certified, Amnesty targeted them again and mobilized them to create human rights clubs within schools. They were elementary, middle and high school teachers. The focus of Amnesty trained human rights clubs were to educate students on what rights are, how to achieve rights and how to bring awareness to others. After the success of the human rights clubs, the organization moved on to the global approach. This was taking schools with human rights clubs and integrating human rights into everyday programs. These programs functioned on four different axes; curriculums, school governments, social environments and extracurricular activities. The long term goal was to adapt these schools into human rights friendly schools.

Human rights friendly schools is currently a project between Amnesty International and the Moroccan Ministry of Education. It is a program that targets schools across the country for human rights capacity building in the long term. Capacity building is when students, educators, staff members, parents and everyone involved in children's education go through continuous human rights training. These trainings are constantly monitored and evaluated by a criteria-checklist to see if the schools, as a whole, are respectful and protective environment for human rights.

Since this program has been active for 20 years, Amnesty has mastered the most effective way to teach human rights. Human rights education is the most effective when taught in an interactive environment. Since the project is not just about awareness and mobilization, but about change in behavior, teaching has to be approached a different way than normal school. A lecture format is not effective. When lectured to, students treat human rights like any other class.

Students learn the theory and textbook answers so they will do well on tests and quizzes but, do not incorporate human rights principles into their lives outside the classroom. To counteract this Amnesty International tries to educate through art, painting, poetry, theater and sports.

Amnesty International also produces pedagogical resources and guidelines for teachers. These resources are on general international human rights but also, specific thematics such as children rights, migrant rights, sexual reproductive rights and torture. Some resources are created at the local level and some by the international movement. Whenever possible, the Moroccan section tries to adapt the global resources to the local context to make facilitation easier for educators. The resources are produced in Arabic, French, Spanish and English. The Moroccan government has also produced pedagogical resources on the national level.

Educators are trained by Amnesty International, other civil society groups and the Moroccan government. When Amnesty does the training they draw upon their national network of educators within Morocco. More specifically, their network of human rights educators. Human rights educators have gone through capacity training on how to facilitate human rights education. They are vetted to make sure that they have the tools and values one needs to educate about universal human rights. All Amnesty International staff go through this training. In the past two years, there has been a focus on peer education of Moroccan youth. Mobilizing students is just as important as mobilizing teachers. This program has been very successful and now peer education workshops run for students, by students, have commenced in several locations around the country.

The Moroccan government's training for educators is in its infant stages. It still follows the patterns of a typical classroom. All information is presented in lecture or seminar form. The

training is hardly a participation approach. This is because education in a lecture form is the easiest to implement and the most cost effective. There are not enough financial resources to truly enact human rights education within the Moroccan school system. This allows for inconsistent human rights education. Impact is lost without consistency. Human rights culture can not thrive if it is not given time to grow. Another issue is universality. In many cases, the educators who are brought in do not fully believe in the universality of human rights. They may teach to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights but some teachers adapt it to the Moroccan context and call for cultural relativism. Educators have been known to assert that Morocco is a religious country that must ascribe to religious values first. This becomes a problem because of some of the content within the curriculum of the Moroccan school system.

One of Amnesty International's other projects has been updating the curriculum within the Moroccan school system. Many of the official textbooks and lesson plans still contain images and discourse that is discriminatory and not reflective of human rights values. The Moroccan government has made major steps in fixing this. Amnesty International was asked to consult when the government originally started updating curriculums. This event, along with being welcomed into the schools to work with human rights clubs, created opportunities for all of civil society to get involved in Moroccan schools. The curriculum has improved tenfold, but there is still work to be done. Some topics that Amnesty International is working to draw attention to in images and texts are equality; acceptance of "the other", fighting the criminalization of consensual relations between adults, the criminalization of consensual same sex adults within the LGBTQI community, cultural and religious roles between men and women such as household roles, inheritance and privacy. Most importantly, Amnesty International is trying to change how

religion is taught. There is a continuation of discussions that bring on radicalism. Teaching children that Islam is “the” religion, teaches them to not value difference. It is important to recognize the diversity of faiths around the world. When negative values are taught, non-acceptance and hate can be rationalized. There are other negative values taught in religious studies such as; ownership of the wife that are reflected in the penal code. This allows for marital rape and abuse without criminalization. Since this is still being educated towards children, it becomes socialized within the culture. This socialization poses a major challenge to changing laws on a national level. However, the Moroccan government has agreed to reevaluate its religious studies and the education curriculum is being completely revamped.

When asked about if human rights in Morocco is being taught to the extent that it needs to be; if it is being contextualized enough, I was told that this is a very hard subject to measure. On one hand, Amnesty International recognizes the efforts made by the Moroccan government in the past couple of decades. The development of human rights, transitional justice, the new constitution 2011, strategies of human rights education in several government bodies and the adoption of several UN conventions related to human rights are not to be ignored. However, it all comes back to the Moroccan experience of Transitional Justice. It lacked in a lot of ways. The Transitional Justice experience did not reach its potential for real reconciliation and this impacts how much human rights can really be taught or practiced within the country. The criteria for real reconciliation did not happen. There was no full disclosure of the abuses. In Moroccan Transitional justice there was no accountability for perpetrators, no names were named and people who were instrumental in human rights abuses profited financially and stayed in power despite committing crimes. There was only symbolic justice for victims and no rehabilitation.

With this lack of transparency and lack of accountability of justice there can be no talk of an actual transparent approach in educating about the history of human rights in Morocco because that history is not known. Development or steps forward towards real human rights achievements and culture in Morocco cannot happen with the current lack of recognition and transparency of the past. The first step, is to truly reconcile with the past so that the future can be properly addressed. This is vital because even though Morocco claims to be a country that is respectful of human rights, there are still no real guarantees in law that prevent returning to the Years of Lead. There is still hardly any accountability in regard to justice for human rights abusers in the country. Along this line, there is no monitoring of the human rights systems in place. There is no national seances of how effective the current human rights agendas are.

When asked if there was anything else I should know about human rights education, I was told that generally human rights education is very tough long process. Nothing can change overnight. It is easy to change laws but to change practices, mentalities and behaviors takes time. It is the hardest thing to achieve. Organizations need to be patient and actually have faith in other actors, like the government and others members of civil society. Most importantly, one always has to innovate and diversify their tools and resources for human rights education. It is vital to have full active participation from stakeholders when talking about human rights education. Human rights education is something that has to happen within all sectors of society. The necessity of a bilateral approach cannot be stressed enough. Right now, Morocco has put its focus on the education system. Human Rights needs to be integrated into the Ministry of Youths, the Ministry of Justice, of Finances the police academy etc. To just give human rights values in schools and have those children go out into the workforce or just everyday real life ,creates a

conflicted personality and a generation of conflicted people. Students who have taken part in human rights education have been taught a value system, but live through a reality where the rights they were taught are not being respected in their everyday lived experience. Human rights education should be in all parts of life; so that the ideal world children are being taught about can become a lived reality.⁴

General Assembly United Nations Report

The last part of my research was to read the 2008 United Nations General Assembly Report: The Promotion and Protection of All Human Rights, Civil, Political, Economic, Social and Cultural, Including the Right to Development: Report of the Special Rapporteur on the Right to Education, submitted by Vernor Muñoz. I analyzed the report through the lens of the questions I had asked my interviewees. The report went over the logistics of how human rights are taught in the Moroccan school systems but also highlighted the need for more comprehensive human rights education in Morocco. Specifically, that the government should adhere to the United Nation Plan of Action: World Program for Human Rights. That human rights have to be incorporated not just into the classroom but into all aspects of academic life. The report goes on to say, “that teachers do not receive sufficient training and that support is limited to references to textbooks. Furthermore, lessons often focus on the notion of citizenship and not on the content of international human rights instruments (Muñoz, 2009).” It continues by stating, that for human rights education to be effective there has to be accountability within the system. Without monitoring, it is impossible to tell what is effective and what is detrimental. Lastly, the report says that human rights education cannot happen within the void of the Moroccan school system.

⁴ Question Guide for Interview Three is in the appendix.

Incorporating human rights to the education system is the first step, but it has to be introduced into all aspects of society for a human rights culture to be built. ⁵

Synthesis

Looking at all the information gathered from my research some patterns appear between all four sources occur. However, major themes seem to run down the lines of governmental and nongovernmental organizations. There are agreements and contradictions within how nongovernmental organizations and the government present human rights education and practice in Morocco's post transitional justice society. This begs the question of; what is the lived experience of Moroccan people and what is the truth of Morocco's human rights culture.

One theme that three of the four sources agreed on was that Islam and human rights are compatible when there is a good understanding of the values of both. Another theme was that there has to be collaboration between the government and civil society. Each has strengths and weaknesses to bring to the table. Along these lines all four sources thought that it was vital that human rights education be promoted, not just within the school system, but within all of Moroccan society. That promotion has to happen over a long period of time because changing behaviors and cultural mentalities is not easy.

This is where the the government and nongovernment begin to divide. The government believes that the textbooks have been updated to be as progressive as they need to be, while the nongovernment organizations disagree. The government sees the human rights education given to teachers to be enough. Nongovernment actors think that it is rarely at an international UN standard; that the training relies to much on cultural relativism. Nongovernmental actors also

⁵ Question Guide for analysis of the United Nations General Assembly Report is in the appendix.

believe that there is not enough resources allotted to human rights education and that there is no accountability within the system.

The final and most complex point of disagreement is when it comes to transitional justice. Both people I talked to within the government, wholeheartedly asserted that the processes of transitional justice was a success. That it reconciled the country with its past and stabilized it as a whole. That this transitional justice process has made it so that the Years of Lead, and the abuses that came along with them, can never be repeated. Repetition will not happen because the people have been educated on the past. Nongovernmental actors do not hold this opinion. They see transitional justice in Morocco as a failure. That it was a symbolic closure to a past filled with abuses, that to this day, affect many people's lives.

This begs the question of what does it mean for a society when the people are still being affected by the abuses of the past, but the government socializes them to believe that everything is up to the standards of international human rights? In other words, what does it mean when the lived experience of everyday citizens does not match the dominant narrative of a country, but still those citizens perpetuate said dominant narrative. It means that Michel Foucault's Panopticon theory has taken effect. (Foucault, 2012)

The theory states that in the face of oppressive authority, people will adjust their behaviors as to not be reprimanded by said authority, even though, they are not sure that said reprimand will happen. Since transitional justice was never dealt with properly in Morocco, there is no accountability system for abuses in place. There is no legal guarantee that the government will not regress back to the Years of Lead. This has created a fear within the country that regression could happen. To avoid this outcome, Moroccan culture has adapted to continually

perpetuate the government's dominant narrative of closure; that there were no problems with Moroccan transitional justice. Citizens do this because there is the fear that if they do not, the government will treat them as it did during the Years of Lead and human rights abuses will become normalized within Morocco once again. In summery, the government puts forward a narrative, the citizens perpetuate said narrative in fear of the past repeating until it becomes not just the dominant narrative but a cultural narrative. This is problematic for human rights education because when the whole system of governance is built on citizens fears that the past might be repeated, there can be no creation of holistic human rights culture. If a symbolic gesture of closure is excepted because of fear, there can only ever be fear culture and not human rights culture.

Conclusion

Non governmental organizations present a human rights education that is based on the lived experiences of citizens, while the Moroccan government's human rights education is based on legislative theory and International laws. Nongovernmental organizations have the freedom to adapt their objectives and goals to fit the needs of individual groups of people. The Moroccan government has to work with bureaucracy and conflicting interest within the government to try to create a human rights culture. Despite these limitations, the Moroccan government presents human rights education as a success, that might not be in it's final stage, but will be one day. This is the vital discrepancy within the promotion of human rights education and human rights culture in Morocco. The government expects the citizens to accept that abuses of the past are dealt with and over; that healing and reconciliation is static and not a long term process. This is in contrast to the narrative the government promotes about human rights education for the creation of

human rights culture. In this case, it is asserted that only after decades of hard work and education, human rights culture will happen. The government is picking and choosing what will be effective for human rights culture as to fit their greater needs.

After 20 years of human rights education, a culture of human rights does not exist in Morocco. Steps have been taken towards a human rights culture, but the current path is flawed. Human rights culture will be an impossibility until there is transparency and accountability in regard to the human rights abuses of the past. Human rights education can only be so effective when it is rooted in fear culture. This is recognized by non governmental organizations and needs to be recognized by the Moroccan government. For human rights education to create true human rights culture; the years of lead need to be revisited, legislation ensuring that the past cannot be repeated needs to be implemented and a more universal view of human rights needs to be accepted within the education system and culture. Without these stipulations incorporated into society, there can be no true human rights culture.

Appendix

Question Guide Interview One

1. What is your job? What is the work you do?
2. What does teaching human rights in schools look like in Morocco?
3. Is there a contradiction between how Moroccan school systems are run and the teaching of human rights?
4. Human rights themselves are vague concepts. This allows for interpretation. Is there a standard training for teachers and if so what does that look like?
5. If yes: who is teaching these trainings? If no: what would standardization look like?
6. What does Moroccan Citizenship training look like as an academic practice?
7. Since Citizenship training is incorporated into all aspects of school is there a contradiction between human rights and said training?
8. When taught are human rights contextualized within the history of the country?
9. Are students taught independently about the years of Lead and the reforms that were suggested by the Equity and Truth Commission?
10. Are the the types of human rights that are being taught applicable to the students everyday lives? Are they plausible in their lived experiences?
11. Should the teaching of human rights be something the state does or something the family does?
12. Which do you think is being taught in the Moroccan school system? A: Learning about human rights to be a good citizen or B: learning about human rights to advocate for personal dignity?
13. Are human rights a western institution? Is this a problem?
14. This focus on human rights has been happening since the 1990's what are the benefits of it? Is there a greater human rights culture in Morocco?
15. What is your opinion on non-Moroccan actors promoting human rights within Morocco? Are they effective?

Question Guide Interview Two

1. What is your job? What is the work you do?
2. What does teaching human rights in schools look like in Morocco?
3. Is there a contradiction between how Moroccan school systems are run and the teaching of human rights?
4. Human rights themselves are vague concepts. This allows for interpretation. Is there a standard training for teachers and if so what does that look like?
5. If yes: who is teaching these trainings? If no: what would standardization look like?
6. What does Moroccan Citizenship training look like as an academic practice?
7. Since Citizenship training is incorporated into all aspects of school is there a contradiction between human rights and said training?
8. When taught are human rights contextualized within the history of the country?
9. Are students taught independently about the years of Lead and the reforms that were suggested by the Equity and Truth Commission?
10. Are the the types of human rights that are being taught applicable to the students everyday lives? Are they plausible in their lived experiences?
11. Should the teaching of human rights be something the state does or something the family does?
12. Which do you think is being taught in the Moroccan school system? A: Learning about human rights to be a good citizen or B: learning about human rights to advocate for personal dignity?
13. Are human rights a western institution? Is this a problem?
14. This focus on human rights has been happening since the 1990's what are the benefits of it? Is there a greater human rights culture in Morocco?
15. What is your opinion on non-Moroccan actors promoting human rights within Morocco? Are they effective?

Question Guide Interview Three

1. What is your Job at Amnesty International?
2. What is Amnesty International's mission in Morocco?
3. Amnesty International is an international NGO. What are the steps it takes to be effective in the Moroccan context?
4. How does Amnesty International teach human rights in Morocco?
 - a. What demographics?
 - b. Are there regional considerations?
 - c. What institutions?
 - d. How long are courses?
 - e. Who does the teaching?
 - f. Are there follow up sessions?
5. The Moroccan government has incorporated the teaching of human rights into the Moroccan school system. Do you know what that looks like?
6. What do you think of the Moroccan government's approach to the promotion of human rights? Specifically human rights education?
7. Which do you think is being taught in the Moroccan school system? A: Learning about human rights to be a good citizen or B: learning about human rights to advocate for personal dignity
8. What is the biggest challenge to human rights in Morocco?
9. Could you tell me more about the article Training young human rights educators in the Middle East and North Africa that was published by Amnesty International in October.
 - a. Who were the people involved?

b. Where did they hope to use their knowledge?

c. In Morocco what were the sessions on?

10. The equity and reconciliation Commission issued that human rights should be taught in schools “so as to consolidate the values of democracy and human rights in society and avoid repetition of the violations of the past”.

a. Is this being done?

b. If so could it be done better?

c. If not, why not?

11. Do you think the history of human rights in Morocco is being taught to the general public? Is it a taboo subject?

12. Is there anything else I should know about this subject?

a. Is there anything you want to ask me?

Question Guide For Analysis of United Nations General Assembly Report

1. What is your job? What is the work you do?
2. What does teaching human rights in schools look like in Morocco?
3. Is there a contradiction between how Moroccan school systems are run and the teaching of human rights?
4. Human rights themselves are vague concepts. This allows for interpretation. Is there a standard training for teachers and if so what does that look like?
5. If yes: who is teaching these trainings? If no: what would standardization look like?
6. What does Moroccan Citizenship training look like as an academic practice?
7. Since Citizenship training is incorporated into all aspects of school is there a contradiction between human rights and said training?
8. When taught are human rights contextualized within the history of the country?
9. Are students taught independently about the years of Lead and the reforms that were suggested by the Equity and Truth Commission?
10. Are the the types of human rights that are being taught applicable to the students everyday lives? Are they plausible in their lived experiences?
11. Should the teaching of human rights be something the state does or something the family does?
12. Which do you think is being taught in the Moroccan school system? A: Learning about human rights to be a good citizen or B: learning about human rights to advocate for personal dignity?
13. Are human rights a western institution? Is this a problem?
14. This focus on human rights has been happening since the 1990's what are the benefits of it? Is there a greater human rights culture in Morocco?
15. What is your opinion on non-Moroccan actors promoting human rights within Morocco? Are they effective?

Consent Form

School for International Training Multiculturalism and Human Rights - Rabat

Consent Form

Project Title : Human Rights Education: A Tool for a Stable Society

Researcher : Page Benoit

Purpose : You are being asked to participate in a research study conducted by Page Benoit from Bard College. The purpose of this study is to learn about how human rights are taught in the Moroccan school system. This study will contribute to my completion of my Independent Study Project.

Research Procedures

Should you decide to participate in this research study, you will be asked to sign this consent form once all your questions have been answered to your satisfaction. This study consists of a interview that will be administered to individual participants in Rabat. You will be asked to provide answers to a series of questions related to human rights in the Moroccan school system. With your permission you will be audio recorded.

Time Required

Participation in this study will require one hour of your time.

Risks

I do not perceive any risks or more than minimal risks from your involvement in this study.

Benefits

From this research there will be greater attention drawn to how human rights are taught in the Moroccan school system. There will be no personal benefits given to participants.

Confidentiality

All requests for confidentiality will be respected. Participants have the right to have partial citation or remain anonymous.

The results of this research will be documented as an ISP paper and presented orally to the SIT MOR students and staff. The results of this project will be coded in such a way that the respondent's identity will not be attached to the final form of this study. The researcher retains

the right to use and publish non-identifiable data. While individual responses are confidential, aggregate data will be presented representing averages or generalizations about the responses as a whole. All data will be stored in a secure location accessible only to the researcher. Upon completion of the study, all information that matches up individual respondents with their answers (including audio – video tapes, if applicable) will be destroyed. (If the data will not be destroyed, please state what will happen to the data upon completion of the study.)

Participation & Withdrawal

Your participation is entirely voluntary. You are free to choose not to participate. Should you choose to participate, you can withdraw at any time without consequences of any kind. You may also refuse to answer any individual question without consequences.

Questions about the Study

If you have questions or concerns during the time of your participation in this study, or after its completion or you would like to receive a copy of the final aggregate results of this study, please contact me at :

Researcher’s Name : Page Benoit

Email Address : pb4857@bard.edu

Giving of Consent

I have read this consent form and I understand what is being requested of me as a participant in this study. I freely consent to participate. I have been given satisfactory answers to my questions. The investigator provided me with a copy of this form. I certify that I am at least 18 years of age.

I give consent to be (video/audio) taped during my interview. _____ (initials)
(If applicable, please include this consent box and statement.)

Name of Participant

Name of Participant (Signed)

Date

Name of Researcher (Signed)

Date

Bibliography

- Amnesty International. (2016) What We Do. (n.d.). Retrieved December 03, 2016, from <https://www.amnesty.org/en/what-we-do/>
- Benoit, P. (23/11/2016) [Interview with Abderrazak Rouwane]
- Benoit, P. (23/11/2016) [Interview with Ahmed Chakib]
- Benoit, P. (23/11/2016) [Interview with Touria Bouabid]
- Faour, M. (2013, May/June). A Review of Citizenship Education in Arab Nations. The Carnegie Papers.
- Fisher, K., & Stewart, R. (2014). Transitional Justice and the Arab Spring. Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge.
- Foucault, M. (2012). Discipline & Punish: The Birth of the Prison. Vintage.
- Kingdom of Morocco Equity and Reconciliation Commission (2005) Final Report: TRUTH, EQUITY AND RECONCILIATION. The Advisory Council on Human Rights Publications.
- McGuinness, M. E. (2011). Peace v. Justice: The Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the Modern Origins of the Debate*. Diplomatic History, 35(5), 749-768. doi:10.1111/j.1467-7709.2011.00982.x
- Moudden, A., Dr. (2016, October 28). Years of Lead. Lecture presented Center for Cross Cultural Learning, Rabat.
- Muñoz, V. (2009). PROMOTION AND PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS, CIVIL, POLITICAL, ECONOMIC, SOCIAL AND CULTURAL RIGHTS, INCLUDING THE RIGHT TO DEVELOPMENT The right to education of persons in detention Report of the Special Rapporteur on the right to education,. Retrieved November 2, 2016, from http://www2.ohchr.org/english/bodies/hrcouncil/docs/11session/A.HRC.11.8_en.
- Plan of Action - UNESCO. (2006). Retrieved November 2, 2016, from <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0014/001478/147853e.pdf>
- SOUAG, F. (2016, May). Inter-ministerial Delegation for Human Rights. Retrieved December 03, 2016, from <http://www.tudert.ma/en/patners/national-institutions/item/154-delegation-interministerielle-aux-droits-de-lhomme-didh>
- The United Nations. (1948). Universal Declaration of Human Rights.

- World Programme for Human Rights Education (2005-ongoing). (n.d.). Retrieved November 02, 2016, from <http://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/Education/Training/Pages/Programme.aspx>