


Fall 2017

¿Dónde está Santiago Maldonado? El uso del retrato y el activismo artístico para exigir la 'aparición con vida' de los desaparecidos forzados en Argentina / ¿Dónde está Santiago Maldonado? The use of portraiture and artistic activism to demand for the 'aparición con vida' of the forcibly disappeared in Argentina

Emily Gresham Beamer
SIT Study Abroad

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcollections.sit.edu/isp_collection

 Part of the [Arts and Humanities Commons](#), [Civic and Community Engagement Commons](#), [Inequality and Stratification Commons](#), [Latin American Studies Commons](#), and the [Politics and Social Change Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Gresham Beamer, Emily, "¿Dónde está Santiago Maldonado? El uso del retrato y el activismo artístico para exigir la 'aparición con vida' de los desaparecidos forzados en Argentina / ¿Dónde está Santiago Maldonado? The use of portraiture and artistic activism to demand for the 'aparición con vida' of the forcibly disappeared in Argentina" (2017). *Independent Study Project (ISP) Collection*. 2658. https://digitalcollections.sit.edu/isp_collection/2658

This Unpublished Paper is brought to you for free and open access by the SIT Study Abroad at SIT Digital Collections. It has been accepted for inclusion in Independent Study Project (ISP) Collection by an authorized administrator of SIT Digital Collections. For more information, please contact digitalcollections@sit.edu.

**¿Dónde está Santiago Maldonado? El uso del retrato y el activismo artístico para exigir la
'aparición con vida' de los desapariciones forzadas
en Argentina**

**¿Dónde está Santiago Maldonado? The use of portraiture and artistic activism to demand
for the 'aparición con vida' of the forcibly disappeared in Argentina**

Emily Gresham Beamer

Advisor: Julia Risler

SIT Social Movements and Human Rights

Buenos Aires

Second Semester 2017

Acknowledgements

First, a world of thanks to my advisor, Julia Risler, for her steadfast direction, encouragement, and enthusiasm for my investigation's realization. Julia guided my interest and inspiration to explore this topic in a way that allowed its ciphering onto paper in a manner that fully reflects my passion for the subject. Thank you Julia, for both your time and imagination.

I would also like to thank the program coordinators Eliana, Mauge, and Valeria for their continued support throughout both the semester and the independent study process. A big thank you to director Ana Laura Lobo; your many insightful course corrections through my project's development were crucial to its full realization.

Finally, I would like to thank Maria Rosa Gómez, Cora Gamarnik, and Gabriel Orge for their willingness to give my research the depth each one of their perspectives provided, especially the times when my Spanish was lacking. Thank you for your patience, time, and interest in my project.

Abstract

The dissemination of portraiture of the forcibly disappeared in Argentina represents a key strategy of visual protest within Argentina's human rights movement, and an effective tool for 'collective memory construction' of the forcibly disappeared. Its history of use spans from the last dictatorship, to protests of forced disappearances in modern Argentina's democracy.

Following the disappearance of a young artisan, Santiago Maldonado, from a 'route cut' he participated in on August 1st, 2017, alongside the Mapuche community of Pu Lof, in protest of the Italian multinational clothing manufacturer Benetton's control of their ancestral lands, a massive dissemination of his portrait was realized, filling much of Argentina's public space with his gaze. This intervention of artistic activism was one of the largest in Argentina's recent history, and focused international attention on the persistence of state violence in modern Argentina. The disappearance of Maldonado catalyzed the circulation of his image worldwide alongside the question: ¿Dónde está Santiago Maldonado?

Keywords:

Transitional Justice, State Violence, Artistic Activism, Collective Memory

Index

- I. Introduction**
- II. Theoretical Framework**
- III. Methodology**
- III. Historical Framework**
 - 1. The roots of protest: the use of faces of the disappeared under the last dictatorship**
 - 2. Facing disappearances within democracy**
- IV. Analisis**
 - 1. The dissemination and production of Santiago Maldonado's face as an example of Artistic Activism**
 - 2. Continuities in the use of portraiture of the forcibly disappeared as symbols in protest, evaluated as a repertoire of action**
 - 3. The creation of collective memory through the dissemination of portraiture in protest: Donde Está Santiago Maldonado**
- V. Conclusions**
- V1. Referencia**
 - 1. Bibliography**
 - 2. News Article Bibliography**
 - 3. Photo bibliography**
 - 4. Photo Appendix**
 - 5. Interview appendix**
 - 6. Interview bibliography**

I) Introducci3n

The military regime that ruled Argentina during the last civil-military dictatorship (1976-1983) disappeared¹ over 30,000 people as part of its project to "reorganize the Argentine nation" (Rock 2006). This reorganization and introduction of state control of every strata of Argentine society was conducted largely through the use of institutionalized state terror, accompanied by the implementation of neoliberal economic policies, social control², and the deliberate elimination of the "internal, subversive enemy" (Ministry of Education, 2010). The restructuring of Argentine society under the dictatorship was conducted through according to the postulates of the National Security Doctrine, which maintained a strong influence in all the military regimes of Latin America, as part of the larger C3ndor Plan³ across the Southern cone (Rock, 2006).

While the 30,000 disappeared spanned from every strata of Argentine society, the majority of those disappeared, six of every ten, were involved in some capacity with labour movements (La Capital, 2016) .

Those forcibly disappeared, or ‘detenidos-desaparecidos’ were held within the 550 clandestine centers that dotted the country, weaving a network within Argentina which allowed the state to conduct its campaign of erasure (both of the lives of those they targeted and ideas they represented) on a systematic level (Ministry of Education, 2010). The state was able, with

¹ ‘Desaparecido’, a person detained and disappeared, and presumed killed or held indefinitely by members of the armed services or the police.

² Members of the Junta military force seized most positions within civilian government, mediums of media were controlled tightly, and traditional values espoused.

³ Operation Condor refers to the political repression and state terror involving intelligence operations and assassination of opponents, the worst politicide in the history of modern South America, which was officially implemented in 1975 by the right-wing dictatorships of the Southern Cone of South America.

some degree, to suppress knowledge within society of the the systematic state terror campaign being conducted, through the proliferation of misinformation, the censure of alternative sources beyond state sponsored media, the deliberate denouncement of the existence of the disappeared, and the manipulation of the constructed paradigm of a war between the state and internal forces of subversion/terrorism in place of the actualized systematic disappearance of citizens (Rock , 2006).

In the year 1977, a group of mothers of those forcibly disappeared by the state began to march in the Plaza de Mayo to demand the return of their children. During the dictatorship, these mothers, who came to be known as the Mothers of Plaza de Mayo, were expelled, repressed, imprisoned and at times arrested and disappeared, but they never stopped demanding for the ‘*aparición con vida*’⁴ of their forcibly disappeared children. The image of their weekly march around the Plaza de Mayo in Buenos Aires, photos of their disappeared family members pinned to their shirts, pañuelos, or banners, has come to be a lightning rod for human rights movements in Argentina both before and after the dictatorship (Gamarnik, 2010).

Santiago Maldonado was a young artisan, participating in and supporting the recovery of Mapuche⁵ lands from the Italian multinational Benetton⁶ alongside the Mapuche community Pu Lof⁷ of Esquel, in the Chubut province of Argentina. On August 1, 2017, during a roadblock created to protest of the detention of Longko Facundo Jones Huala, he was persecuted and disappeared by the Argentine National Gendarmerie⁸ according to accounts from multiple witnesses of the raid. He appeared dead in the Chubut river 77 days later.

⁴ ‘appearance alive’

⁵ Largest First Nation in Argentina

⁶ The multinational Italian company Benetton is the largest private landowner in Argentina.

⁷ Lof: Community, tribe: basic social organizations of the Mapuche nation

⁸ Argentine National Military Border Police



Figure 1. Photograph by Ceci García.

His disappearance generated a wave of solidarity and protest in Argentine society, at times garnering the participation of over 200 thousand people. Through various national and international protests, which directly followed his disappearance and maintained until the discovery of his body in the Chubut river, we can see a modern manifestation of the use of the portraits of those disappeared through institutionalized state violence. The massive dissemination of Santiago Maldonado's face in protest represents a direct example of the inherited action of portraiture dissemination for the reclamation of life for those disappeared in Argentina, functioning as part of a legacy of a protest developed during the last dictatorship in Argentina by the human rights movement demanding the appearance of the detained-disappeared. Through my research, I will try to answer: In Argentina, how have the faces of the disappeared been used to demand for their appearance alive? Do these modes of intervention constitute a

form of artistic activism, with respect to their manifestations following the disappearance of Santiago Maldonado, and why? How has this visual method of protest built a "repertoire of action" through legacies of collective action, and a concrete symbol behind the face of a disappeared person? Through what means and with what resources has the dissemination of portraiture contributed to the construction of a collective memory of the forcibly disappeared?

II. Theoretical Framework

To investigate my research problem, I will first explore the historical context in regard to the use of portraiture of the disappeared in protest during the last dictatorship, then exploring its use in protests demanding the '*aparición con vida*' of the forcibly disappeared in Argentina's restored democracy, informing this historical survey with the history of portraiture use according to the writing of Argentinean Photojournalism expert Cora Gamarnik (2010) , and Argentinian visual politics expert Ana Longoni (2010), (2010b).

I will evaluate the use of portraiture within the protests following the disappearance of Santiago Maldonado, to determine if and how it constitutes a manifestation of Marcelo Expósito's (2012) theory of artistic activism, using his framework to examine the manifestation through this lens of evaluation, additionally informing my analysis with theories of visual politics developed by Ana Longoni (2012).

The legacy of portraiture use in protests of disappearances in Argentina will be evaluated through Charles Tilly's (1998) social movement theory of 'repertoires of contentious actions' to identify if this legacy of action contains a demonstrated repertoire of contentious action.

I will explore if and how the dissemination of portraiture contributes to a construction of a collective memory for the forcibly disappeared, specifically in relation to the portraiture dissemination which followed the disappearance of Santiago Maldonado, through Ana Longoni's (2012) theories of portraits collective memory construction.

III) Metodology

To conduct my research on the use of portraiture and artistic activism to demand for the '*aparición con vida*' of the forcibly disappeared in Argentina, I will use a qualitative strategy of analysis, utilizing primary interviews with experts of these themes, María Rosa Gómez, and Cora Gamarnik, both professors and researchers at the University of Buenos Aires (UBA), and the Cordoba based projection artist Gabriel Orge. María Rosa Gómez is an expert on memory construction of the disappeared, and Cora Gamarnik is an expert of the history of photojournalism in Argentina. My interviews with these experts, listed in my Appendix, will explore themes of portraiture role in collective memory construction, as well as its history of use in Argentina. Projection artist Gabriel Orge has conducted 'interventions' through projection following multiple forced disappearances, and most recently created a projection of Santiago Maldonado's face on multiple buildings in this city of Córdoba, an action which was viralized across Argentina and the world. My interview with Gabriel Orge seeks to explore the massive portraiture dissemination which occurred in the *¿Dónde está Santiago Maldonado?* protests, in terms of the action's objectives and realization⁹.

⁹ Argentina based artist activist groups MAFIA (Movimiento Argentino de Fotógrafxs Independientes Autoconvocadxs) and SUBCOOP (Sub cooperativa de fotógrafos, Buenos Aires) were contacted for this investigation, but were unable to comment.

All interviews were conducted with written permission of use in my research, and those interviewed were asked permission for their name to be included. Names of individual Artist activists who participated in various interventions, found via secondary sources, are represented by pseudonyms or group titles.

These interviews will inform my determination if the dissemination of Santiago Maldonado's portrait following his initial disappearance constitutes a manifestation of social theorist Marcelo Expósito's (2012) definition of artistic activism, second, if this legacy of portraiture in protest within Argentina's human rights movement constitutes an example of Charles Tilly's (1998) theory of repertoires of action, "a central analytical tool for identifying and making sense of specific routines of claim making that are selected and acted out by people in their pursuit of shared interests" (Alimi, 2015:1), and third, how portraiture functions to help build a collective memory of the disappeared, understood through Latin American art and politics theorist Ana Longoni's (2012) discourse on visual politics in the human rights movement of Argentina.

Articles from national Argentinian news media sources are used to understand the narratives offered by the state following the disappearance of Maldonado, of both his actual disappearance, and the of the protest he was participating in at the time of his disappearance alongside a Mapuche community.

Articles from International news media were evaluated and included to illustrate the international response to Santiago Maldonado's disappearance and the framing of the protests that brought its occurrence to the international spotlight.

IV. Historical Context



Figure 2. April 28, 1983. Marcha de Madres de Plaza de Mayo bajo la lluvia. Buenos Aires. Photographer Daniel García.

1. The roots of protest: the use of faces of the disappeared under the last dictatorship

The appearance of the faces of the forcibly disappeared within protests in Argentina as a demand for human rights and their '*aparición con vida*' first materialized during the dictatorship, in the year 1979, as a method used by the parents of the disappeared, and have since been incorporated as a central method of protests of disappearances within the larger demand for human rights in Argentina: "the Mothers inaugurated a prolific genealogy: the photos of the disappeared have become one of the most usual and powerful ways to remember them" Longoni (2010).

This form of protest created a legacy of use that can be seen as the nucleus of protests demanding the same resolutions in respect to disappearances occurring within the restored democracy in Argentina.

The original role of portraiture in protest during the last dictatorship was in form a visual tether between the memory of a disappeared son or daughter, and the parent seeking their reappearance by claiming their existence (Gamarnik, 2010). This relationship has since expanded, following reproductions and vast disseminations of the portraits of the disappeared, and the continuation of forced disappearances in Argentina's democracy. The proliferation of this form of protest has effectively collectivized the memorialization of the forcibly disappeared, expanding alongside each new iteration of manifestation.

The inception of the collective use of faces of the forcibly disappeared in protest as an organized and institutionalized strategy may specifically be traced to the actions undertaken by a group of parents of the forcibly disappeared, in April of 1983, four years after the first instances of portraiture's wide demonstration in protest began, in 1979.

“an initiative of the parents of a missing young woman took place, 10 active militants for human rights....they made and financed the titanic task of gathering all the photographs available from the disappeared, enlarging them to a good size (70 x 50 cm.), and then assembling them in cardboard a "T" made of wood. That simple procedure converted each photo into a banner” (Longoni, 2010)

Before this initiative, the photos of the disappeared were many times single copies pinned, sewed, or printed on clothing, or carried in hand, by the Mothers of the disappeared who would march each thursday in the Plaza de Mayo of Buenos Aires. They came to be known as the

Mothers of the Plaza de Mayo. (Gamarnik 2010).



Figure 3. Photo via Midia Colectiva

The standardization of form and size of the photos of the faces of the forcibly disappeared may be seen as part of the evolution to what is used in protests utilizing portraiture in Argentina today; an evolution of an individual protest and action to a more collective and systematized manner of protest in Argentina.

March 8th, 1984, was the first international day of the woman following the restoration of democracy in Argentina. On this day, GASTA (Grupo de Artistas Socialistas-Taller de Arte Revolucionario) wallpapered the march route through Buenos Aires with the faces of the women and girls forcibly disappeared during the dictatorship, using their photos with permission of the Mothers of the Plaza de Mayo, moving the state of use on the spectrum (individual

protest-collective protest) closer to its collective formation, a legacy which has been fully realized within protests of the disappeared in the restored democracy (Gamarnik, 2010).

2. Facing disappearances within democracy



Figure 4. Photo: Reuters

A series of manifestations of protest centered on the reproduction of Santiago Maldonado's face followed his initial disappearance on August 1st consistently until the discovery of his body, 77 days later. These protests, which materialized both across Argentina and internationally, were unrivaled in Argentina's recent history in respect to the manifestation of protest against forced disappearances. The collective demand for the appearance of Maldonado was conducted powerfully and unavoidable through the reproduction of his face, pasted, posted, printed, and painted on a scale that filled public spaces across Argentina, both digitally and physically: "Social networks, in a powerful and creative way, shared his face (...) with resources that technology and digital art allow, his face was reproduced, achieving a high social impact (...)

also posters, pamphlets, flags, banners, graffiti. All visual tools.” (M.R. Gómez, via email interview, 2 of December 2017).

The state steadfastly denied any culpability for his disappearance, instead offering up theories ranging from the claim that his disappearance was a politically calculated move, at the hands of the indigenous Mapuche community he was protesting alongside on the day of his disappearance in Pu Lof, a theory that lent itself neatly to the stigmatization of the community as ‘terrorists’¹⁰ which has been advanced by the government of Macri and various government backed media sources, to the theory that Santiago was making his way through Mapuche controlled lands spanning across the Chilean border (La Nacion, 13 Sept. 2017)

The appearance of Maldonado’s face in varying forms and and spaces, centered the call for his appearance alive between his gaze and the public caught within it. Across Argentina his face could be found projected on buildings, made into masks, attached to clothing, held in hand



Figure 5. Photo: Courtesy of Mafia

at protests, stenciled onto sidewalks and buildings , represented within street murals, posted within social media feeds, and represented widely on posters, many of which were provided

¹⁰ Perfil: “Minister of Chubut called the group of Mapuche ‘terrorists’” <https://goo.gl/1F3m6j>

centrally for printing and posting by the Argentine artist activist group M.A.F.I.A. (Mafia 2017). The persistence of his appearance, which emerged consistently to an extent that was unavoidable within most common spaces, insisted a response not only from the apparatuses of the state, but also from the public. The question demanded within his outward gaze “where is he?” (Dónde Está Santiago Maldonado?), demands an additional answer, an answer to the questions why is he missing, and who is responsible.



Figure 6. Unknown stencil artist, photo by author

While the question implored through Santiago’s face inspires further investigation into why he disappeared, the manifestations of his face reach back further still, harkening to previous legacies that can be found both in the reproductions of the faces of those 30,000 disappeared during the last dictatorship, to the disappearance of those after the reestablishment of democracy in Argentina after its fall in 1983, where faces alongside names rang within protests imploring a response to the same question.



Figure 7. Photo courtesy of El Diario

Within Argentina, 200 (documented) disappearances suspected to be forced have occurred since the return of democracy in 1983, according to CORREPI¹¹. The strategy of using portraiture in protest followed many of these forced disappearances, but may be observed particularly following the disappearances of Luciano Arruga¹² in 2009, a teenager from the impoverished neighborhood of La Matanza in Buenos Aires who refused to do the bidding of police officers stationed in his neighborhood, and Jorge Julio Lopez, who was arrested and disappeared during the dictatorship in 1976, (he was later freed in 79') and disappeared again on July 18th, 2006, hours after testifying as a key witness in the trials against the repressor Miguel Etchecolatz, who acted as Chief of Investigations of the police of the Province of Buenos Aires during the military dictatorship (La Primera Piedra, Oct. 2017). Following his second disappearance, now in a

¹¹Coordinator Against Police and Institutional Repression, or Correpi, is a Human Rights organisation founded in Argentina in 1992 that aims to combat repressive policies of the State by investigating and publishing statistics related to deaths and disappearances <https://correpi.lahaine.org/quienes-somos/>

¹² Luciano's remains were found in an unmarked grave in Chacarita Cemetery on October 17, 2014, five years after his disappearance.

restored democracy, his face was then disseminated throughout public spaces in Argentina, and, according to Maria Rosa Gomez's discussion of the manifestations of his face that followed his disappearance, it was "represented in different ways by artists, who accompanied human rights organizations" (M.R. Gómez, via email interview, 2 of December 2017).



Figure 8. Photo by author

Within this framework, Santiago's case appearing as a forced disappearance within democracy is less a spark in the dark, and more an example of the persisting state violence systems from the dictatorship, with respect to the vast precedent of disappearances that have spanned multiple governments since the restoration of democracy. In the same turn, the resulting protests have been created in the context of a clear precedent regarding continuities of use with the faces of the forcibly disappeared, both in form and in participation.

The reproduction and dissemination of Luciano Arruga's face, which entered public spaces in varied manifestations alongside calls for his appearance alive (*'aparición con vida'*) across Argentina, stood as a collective formation of action which also included individual contributions from artist activist groups and individuals, many of whom previously contributed to the widely circulated reproductions of Jorge Julio López's face in the years following his second disappearance, and later contributed reproductions of Santiago's face in the protests following

his disappearance. An example of this can be seen in the work of the stencil artist-activist known as Nazza Stencil, in his stenciled works representing both Santiago (figure 10) and Luciano (Figure 9).



Figure 9. (Enadec, Facebook 2017)



Figure 10. (Enadec, Facebook 2017)

The faces of the disappeared have been central to manifestations of protest following the many forced disappearances that have occurred within Argentina's democracy, umbilically attached to their legacy of use in protests against the the systemized forced disappearances that occurred during the last dictatorship, but also existing as a modern mode of artistic activism for human rights in Argentina. “When we say ‘artistic activism’ it has to be considered as the practical synthesis of a multiplicity: it is not a style, nor a current, nor a movement” (Expósito, 2012). In short, the faces that appear alongside these manifestations of protest following disappearances are not simply auxiliary protest aesthetics; they exist as a form of intervention as well, manifested through various practices such as photography, stencil, chalk, flyposting, painting, etc. This particular form of public intervention used still focuses on the reproduction of the faces of the disappeared, but the modern variation constructs protests aesthetically as a correspondence between the face of an *individual* victim, and the society in which they were forcibly disappeared (in all portraits an outward gaze exists).

Dually through and alongside this constructed aesthetic, pressure is exerted on both the state and society in which the face appears; the gazes of their faces dare the denial of their existence or humanity, pushing the Argentine public to divine the way this continued form of protest signals a persistence of the state terror systems it first manifested itself against.

V. Análisis

The dissemination and production of Santiago Maldonado's face as Artistic Activism



Figure 11. Photo courtesy of MAFIA

The dissemination of portraits of Santiago Maldonado in public spaces across the nation of Argentina following his disappearance will be evaluated as an example of artistic activism, as defined by Marcelo Expósito (2010), which denominates artistic activism as relational in form, a vehicle for social action in place of its traditional, strictly autonomous designation. Through this definition, in place of art being described by a thematic idea of activism, art is instead understood as the form of action, of activism. The art, or aesthetic utilized in artistic activism, is not created to exist as a standalone autonomous object or idea; it exists instead as a tool of aesthetic production to advance the objectives of the intervention in society, which are held above art's autonomy of existence. According to Expósito (2010), "The art consists then, for artistic activism, in a historical reservoir not only of 'Aesthetic representations' in a restrictive sense, but also of tools, techniques or material, conceptual, symbolic strategies" Thus, the art of artistic

activism is then understood within the realized intervention practice as the aesthetic tool to execute it; ‘artistic’ functions as the description of the intervention practice form.

The objectives sought within the dissemination of Santiago’s face, manifested in public spaces which followed his disappearance, were unwaveringly confrontational in nature, fitting neatly within the framework discussed by Expósito (2012) which expresses a crucial function of artistic activism as “..to produce antagonism and confrontation (especially under conditions of severe repression)”. Alongside Santiago’s portrait, the state was usually addressed in some way, an example of which can be seen below. Within the demands for Santiago’s *‘aparición con vida’*,



Figure 12. Photo courtesy of Agência de Notícias Anarquistas (A.N.A.)

whether directed towards the state explicitly *‘el estado es responsable’* or implicitly, *‘Dónde está Santiago Maldonado?’*, the appearance of his face in public spaces was then framed as an intervention of artistic activism through its confrontational character, which is then, according to Expósito (2012), magnified within conditions of severe repression; the confrontational

¹³ Patricia Bulrich: Minister of Security, direct superior to National Gendarmerie forces
Mauricio Macri: current President of Argentina

environment of the intervention escalates the closer the threat of repercussions are. The creation of a confrontational context of artistic activism intervention can then be understood as both catalyzed through the manifestation of Santiago's face, which carried both explicit and implicit claims that he was a victim of a forced disappearance by the state, and the context of documented state repression in which the intervention occurred. On September 1st, 2017, exactly one month after the disappearance of Santiago Maldonado, this threat was indeed realized by the state, when thirty people, seemingly pulled at random from a massive protest of Santiago's disappearance, were loaded into an unmarked van by police and held for three days. This group also included several journalists; documented within this night of protest was open intimidation of the press by police, who were seen filming journalists covering the protest. In a more general sense, the existence of an environment of severe repression the intervention occurred under may also be read from the persistence of forced disappearances in the restored Argentine democracy.

Thus, the intervention may be seen as conforming to the crucial function of Artistic Activism as a confrontational force, and further, the intervention occurred under an environment of repression in Argentina, magnifying its character as a force distinctly confrontational in nature.

Within the protests demanding Santiago Maldonado's '*aparición con vida*', Santiago's portrait may be seen as the aesthetic of the manifestation of artistic activism, which was formed through various modes of reproduction (painting, flyposting, stenciling, projecting, etc.), and its realized action as an intervention as its wide dissemination in public spaces across Argentina.

Expósito (2010), affirms that "The subjects involved in the practices of artistic activism are endowed with their own criteria (extra-institutional) at the time of taking the decisions

concerning the articulation between aesthetic forms and social-political relationality.” This intervention, following the reasoning of Expósito, then, if understood as a manifestation of artistic activism, must be held to certain social-political objectives. Through this understanding of those involved in the production of the aesthetic of artistic activism, the choice of a portrait, of his portrait, must be deliberate, and meet criteria in regard to its representation of specific social-political objectives of protest, as articulated by those involved in the dissemination, including those individually producing the various forms of manifestation; the activist artists.

The existence of an articulation of objective was confirmed by projection artist-activist Gabriel Orge¹⁴, who discussed his choice to project Santiago’s face onto various buildings in Córdoba during the months following his disappearance:

“In the projection of Santiago Maldonado there is a time of present, an urgency that imposes reality before the evolution of events, and the need for a solution. The intervention becomes a way for *a claim of justice*, and tries to drive away the ghosts of the past and give visibility to the claim.....It is a project through light, which propagates an image on a surface during a period of time, it is a fragile and ephemeral gesture that makes reference to the spectral, and that expresses a personal desire and of a certain sector of society, the appearance of those who are not here, those that were disappeared.” (G. Orge, via email interview, 15 of November 2017)

Here we can see two objectives defined in his intervention, first, its existence as part of the larger dissemination of Santiago’s face in public spaces, which reflects the objective of protest

¹⁴ Gabriel Orge is a projection artist based in Córdoba, Argentina. Orge's work has been featured internationally; his project 'Apareciendo' projects images of those disappeared in Argentina's restored democracy on both natural and urban surfaces. His projection of Jorge Julio Lopez's face on the river Citalamochita can be found in Photo Appendix part C.

through his definition of its purpose as a demand for justice in respect to Santiago's disappearance, for his '*aparición con vida*', and second, his specific intention to further this objective tendered through the specific use of projection; the specific medium of propagating the aesthetic of Santiago's face. While his reason for choosing the use of projection is personal and may be evaluated as distinct from the general objectives of the aesthetic's use, this is in line with



Figure 13. Photograph Courtesy of Gabriel Orge

the definition of artistic activism as defined by Expósito (2012), which allows individual participants an 'extra institutional' articulation of their contributions; contributions must reflect the central objective and aesthetic, but may also add to the chorus an iteration of varied form and significance. Individual contributions may also act to further personalize objectives, creating variants that may function to expand the effects of the manifestation of artistic activism through the specialization of the medium used to manifest the aesthetic, the face of Santiago, which again was discussed by Orge: "the political power of the action is given by the ability to seduce and bring closer, sensitize those who are ideologically in another position (this is a supposition). The

action builds a metaphor about the fragility of existence and the power of memory, light on the landscape.” (G. Orge, via email interview, 15 of November 2017) The metaphoric power that is conjured through the use of light to manifest Santiago’s face is then a function specific to this medium, a filter for emotional reaction layered upon the objectives and bounds of the aesthetic, still acting “to expand the margins of the possible (unlock common sense about what is considered art, extend the use of creative tools, build sociability and politics, etc.) beyond the institutions of art” Expósito (2012). Each iteration then functions as different filters of sensitization, in this case through illumination, with the same objective: to claim his ‘*aparición con vida*’ through the dissemination of his portrait’s gaze.

While this articulation of objective is central to the criteria of evaluating this manifestation as artistic activism, the subjects working within manifestations of artistic activism vary beyond simply those creating original manifestations or producing the art; its dissemination is key to its power, and is realized beyond original productions or aesthetics. According to Longoni (2010) , “Interpellation to a crowd (casual pedestrians or protesters) to become a performer or active participant in the works: sometimes hundreds of people arrive to participate and become a collective art producer, in a bid to give emergency of a transformed subjectivity”. Thus, reproductions of original manifestations may be equally dynamic within the intervention, especially when urgent. This function of participation with manifestations occurred both during and following the various projections of Santiago’s portrait by Gabriel Orge onto buildings, and could be described as a third objective realized within this manifestation of artistic activism:

I think the action was effective, there were many people who passed through and "appropriated" it through the spontaneous gesture of registering with the phone the

projection and sharing it on the networks, it was viralized, it was shared thousands of times, there was even an effect of replication (people and groups projected the face of Santiago, appropriated the resource, the gesture) in different cities of the country and even abroad, as I could see in the networks. It also happened that it was published as news in different media in the country” (G. Orge, via email interview, 15 of November 2017)

Within this quote, he hinges the success of his production of Santiago’s face through projection (as part of the larger intervention), on its ability to act as a tool for the dissemination of his face; while earlier objectives defined his vision of the intervention in terms of its dynamism and power to induce results in line with the general objectives of the demand for Santiago’s *‘aparición con vida’*, this objective concerns itself with the magnification of the intervention structure through reproduction. Individual contributions by artist activists or establishments of new mediums for disseminating his portrait then act as aesthetic catalysts for reproduction and participation.

The general Argentine public’s participation in the dissemination of Santiago Maldonado’s portrait can be understood as key to this artistic activism intervention's full realization; Expósito (2012) explains artistic activism’s central component of public participation, as the way in which aesthetics of interventions move beyond artist activists, to the general public, to “socialize knowledge and put (at their disposition) resources for many, moving both inside and outside the artistic circuit”; this function was executed widely in the protest manifestations, through a plethora of forms, such as the disseminations of masks representing Santiago’s face, which were worn by general participants (Photo Appendix E), or the creation of

collaborative murals of Sabtiago's face, many times coordinated between artists and participants from the public (photo Appendix D).

A particularly effective example of this deliberate objective of intervention magnification and its realization, may be seen in the disbursement of artistic-activist photographer collective MAFIA's (Movimiento Argentino de Fotógrafxs Independientes Autoconvocadxs) poster designs, which incorporate various forms of portraits of Santiago Maldonado, and are provided free on their website for download and printing. Following the massive undertaking of portraiture dissemination executed by, and sourced from, MAFIA, the collective represented one of the most important artist activist groups involved in the protests following Santiago Maldonado's disappearance. Their form of action was undertaken as a method of transcending metaphysical digital networks of communication, through the creation of a digital source of dissemination that could manifests physically in the street: in their interview with Info Baires (29th of August, 2017), they explained their objective for providing Santiago's portrait online as "to have it taken out into the street, that is our intention". Examples of the various designs and the page for their central dissemination may be found on their website¹⁵, and can be seen seen in figure 14., being physically disseminated and realized in a public spaces¹⁶. (More examples of their posters in public spaces around Argentina, and their dissemination in action, can be found in Photo Appendix A and B.)

¹⁵ <http://dondestasantiagomaldonado.tumblr.com/archivos%20pegatinas>

¹⁶ More examples oof MAFIA designed posters and their dissemination in public spaces may be found in the Appendix under section A



Figure 14. Photo Courtesy of MAFIA

**Continuities in the use of portraiture of the forcibly disappeared as symbols in protest,
evaluated as a repertoire of action**

Starting with the mothers of the Plaza de mayo, a vanguard of protest developed in Argentina, which has now become institutionalized; the dissemination of portraiture of the forcibly disappeared, as a central strategy of Argentina's human rights movement ¹⁷. For this legacy of portraiture in protest to be understood as adhering to the conditions of the theory of 'repertoires of contentious actions' in collective actions, developed by Charles Tilly, which defines these actions as "claims making routines that apply to the same claimant-object pairs" (Tilly & Tarrow 2006: 16), the legacy of the institutionalized use of portraiture in protest will be analyzed according to its adherence to the main conditions of this theory: "the institutionalization of disruptive forms of contention, innovation at the margins of inherited forms, tactical interaction with police and other actors, and paradigmatic change" (Tarrow 1998 p. 101). Through this framework, the dissemination of portraiture of the forcibly disappeared in Argentina will be evaluated through these characteristics, which illustrate a repertoire of contentious action.

¹⁷Social movement: Collective challenge based on a common purpose and and social solidarity, in a sustained interaction with elites, opponents, and authorities" Tarrow (1998)

The institutionalization of portraiture use in protest occurred following its inception in 1979, and continues to manifest after forced disappearances in the current Argentine state. The legacy of use discussed in part III, which explored documented cases of its manifestations in protests of forced disappearances, may be understood as evidence for the institutionalization of portraiture dissemination as an intervention action, as it has become a repeatedly replicated response of the human rights movement in Argentina to instances of state violence.

For institutionalized forms of protest to represent a repertoire of contention, according to Tilly (1998), innovations must be demonstrated in the new manifestations of the contentious action. Within the legacy of protest of portraiture dissemination, these innovations may be represented through four established shifts of use in the dissemination of portraiture of the disappeared.

The first innovation of action can be seen following a physical transformation of portraits of the disappeared in protest, which were previously many times single copies or portraits, or integrated into this use from various origins (soccer ids, drivers licenses, personal photographs), to their appearance in protest as formulaic enlargements of portraits, first seen in 1983, and discussed at length in part III (Gamarnik 2010). This innovation was followed by an innovation of action; portraitures' normative dissemination by family members evolved to their mass dissemination by those involved in the larger human rights movement, dually collectivizing and expanding the action of portraiture dissemination, most notably appearing with the portraiture dissemination of disappeared women that occurred on the 1983 International Day of the Woman, shown in figure 14, the first Day of the Woman celebrated after the dictatorship's fall. This photo represents an interesting confluence of protest innovations, as it is visually representative of both

the old and new developments in the protest method of portraiture dissemination which came to pass in 1983. (Gamarnik 2010)

According to Maria Gómez, “in 1977, during a march of the Virgin of Luján the Mothers hung large photos around their necks and put them on their white handkerchiefs (...) The handkerchiefs were cloth diapers (...) it was a badge that represented their search” (M.R. Gómez, via email interview, 2 of December 2017). The woman viewing the portraits in figure 15 wears this symbolic *pañuelo*, or diaper cloth, with the individual photo of her disappeared daughter attached. As she views the trail of other forcibly disappeared women with her *pañuelo* tied around her head, communicating through the photograph the intimate search she carries as a mother for her disappeared daughter, she faces a new phase in the fight she first undertook individually, a fight in this moment collectivized beyond the intimate nature of family ties.



Figure 15. Madre con pañuelo, observando fotocopias con imágenes de mujeres desaparecidas sobre muro urbano.

Photo courtesy of CeDInCi (Centro de Documentación en Investigación de la Cultura de Izquierdas en Argentina)

The next shift of action that occurred during the transition of the last dictatorship to a restored civilian government was possibly the most transformative innovation, as manifestations of portraiture dissemination shifted in collective actions to focus on individual forced disappearances in the restored democracy, in place of its previous manifestation in response to, and as a representation of, the large body of portraits of the 30,000 forcibly disappeared during the dictatorship. This focus shift was also paralleled by an additional reformation in regard to the form of portraiture, transitioning from a strict dissemination of photographic reproductions of the disappeared, to the dissemination of portraiture through an abundance of artistic forms. These innovations have occurred over a span of nearly four decades, transforming the action while still preserving its central characteristic; the faces of the forcibly disappeared.

A current representation of these innovations in action is possible to be seen within the massive dissemination of Santiago Maldonado's portraiture following his disappearance on August 1st, 2017 (Photo Appendix A). First, the representations of his face existed far beyond original, physical artifacts; his portrait was reproduced a countless number of times. In addition, this dissemination existed as a collectivized action which was realized far beyond the hands of his family. As the disseminated portraits' representation of an individual face, Santiago's, it can be understood specifically as a reaction manifested in response to his disappearance. Further, far from his face's strict representation through photographs, its aesthetic appeared through a diversity of forms, often represented in a stylized manner (Appendix B). These innovations mark the modern status of this protest, but if understood as a repertoire of contentious action, innovations will surely follow if disappearances continue to happen in modern Argentina.

As a tactical interaction with state actors, the repeated collective action of portraiture dissemination in protest carries a consistent engagement of the Argentine state through direct and deliberate claims of state violence, sustained specifically through its use as an institutionalized reaction to forced disappearances that appear state sponsored, or state condoned. The sustained interaction is then realized as the labeling of a disappearance as forced', or a product of state terrorism, by claiming the disappearance of an individual life. According to Maria Rosa Gomez it plays a specific role as "a forceful way to respond to the denial of State Terrorism", (M.R. Gómez, via email interview, 2 of December 2017) thus crafting a tactical interaction in its manifestation as a response to a state action of violence.

As a disruptive intervention which induces a tactical interaction by filling public spaces (often state controlled spaces)¹⁸, with both the portraits of the disappeared person(s), and protests manifested alongside them, the active intervention of portraiture creates an environment where the state must engage with the action's claim as a result of its public nature. Many times this tactical interaction has been brought into the physical realm, occurring when those publicly sharing portraits of the forcibly disappeared clash in protest with state police or military mechanisms seeking to silence them. Examples of this were previously discussed in section III, and began with the clashes with police and military experienced by the Mothers of the Plaza de Mayo during the dictatorship, but most recently can be seen on the September 1st manifestation of protest in which a massive dissemination of Santiago Maldonado's portraiture took place in public spaces, interactions that were widely violent and confrontational in nature.¹⁹

¹⁸ A recent example of this occurred on October 4th, 2017, when without a warrant, members of the Gendarmerie entered the University of Rosario while students and professors took part in a protest urging Santiago Maldonado's 'aparacion con vida', filling the university with his image. The dean of the Political Sciences and International Relations Department of UNR, Franco Bartolacci, issued a statement which said the action of the Gendermarie "was an act of intimidatory character and provocation". (Minuto 2017)

¹⁹ Argentina Police Detains Protesters in Santiago Maldonado Rally

This repetition of tactical interaction can also be seen as holding examples of "collective action frames", a function within Tilly's theory of contentious actions which involves the understanding of a repertoire of contentious action as holding certain symbols which inspire action. The replication of a tactical interaction, in this case the dissemination of portraiture, is then understood as catalyzed through this framing; protests of alleged forced disappearances follow an inherited significance found in the symbology of the institutionalized action of portrait dissemination which frames the action. It then acts as a signal for the tactical action's execution to the public, an indicator for the need of a collective action which is in turn magnified by its own dissemination. Thus, the tactical relationship between this specific form of action, the wide dissemination of portraiture, and the state, is realized through the agency of symbology that is attached to representations of faces of disappeared persons. This catalyzes action, which then creates the tactical interaction both physically in protest, and symbolically, through its existence as a claim of state violence and human rights abuses. In sum, within the framework of tactical interaction, portraiture dissemination replicates tactical interactions with the state through its frame of the collective action, signaling a new instance of state violence (a forced disappearance) which catalyzes a response of collective action through protest and portraiture dissemination, recreating an environment in which the government is forced to act to respond to the claim.

Paradigmatic change has resulted repeatedly following utilizations of portraiture in protests of forcible disappearances in Argentina. Pressure has been put on various governments to acknowledge the disappeared, pressure cultivated through the international sphere following massive disseminations claiming individuals or groups of forced disappearances. This pressure

may be seen as catalyzed specifically by the action of portraiture dissemination in protests of forced disappearances. This international attention then garners condemnation from international institutions and human rights organizations, creating an environment in which the government must acknowledge a previously ignored (or actively covered up) forced disappearance.

The use of portraiture then functions as a magnifying force for the visibility of disappearances, drawing attention powerfully to human rights abuses through the faces of the disappeared. The ability for their use to result in paradigmatic change is then their function to draw visibility through their documentation in collective actions and public spaces, forcing government acknowledgement as international and regional institutions demand accountability. The repeated use of portraiture following disappearances has demonstrated a consistent ability to garner international pressure on the Argentine state, resulting in forms of paradigmatic change through government acknowledgement of the disappeared.

This paradigm change manifested through government acknowledgement under outside pressure was first created following the civilian government's acknowledgement of the disappeared during the dictatorship, under both domestic and international pressure by human rights groups. Although the constant recurrence of use of this action results from the Argentine state's return to tactics found in forced disappearances, its replication still consistently stimulates a response of international pressure and a resulting paradigm change. The international pressure for Argentina's adherence to human rights that occurred as Mothers began circling the Plaza de Mayo, circling with photos of their disappeared children, may be seen as closely connected: although many international institutions knew about the existence of forced disappearances in Argentina, the public display of them in this manner brought their existence to

light publicly, notably through international media, garnering international recognition of forced disappearances and expected accountability. This creation of international visibility of human rights abuses indeed, according to Sikkik (2012: 98) stimulated paradigmatic change concerning the human rights abuses conducted in the 550 clandestine detention centers during the dictatorship, as part of a human rights “justice cascade”: “Argentina’s responses to international human rights pressure...was moving along a continuum, from denial....to eventual change in domestic repressive tactics.” This transition is then the first example of paradigmatic changes occurring as a result of portraiture’s use in protest, in the form of government acknowledgement after initial denials of disappearances. This can be seen most recently through a possible start of a replication of this continuum after the dissemination of Santiago Maldonado’s portrait following his disappearance, with the government’s base acknowledgement of his disappearance after an initial denial of his disappearance, and an at least attempted search for him (genuine or not) following the international condemnation of his disappearance.

In my interview with Maria Rosa Gomez, stated in her discussion of the massive dissemination of Maldonado's portrait was the claim that "The spread of the Maldonado case through social networks... managed to install the issue in the mainstream media, because before, except for a few, no one spoke of the case.", (M.R. Gómez, via email interview, 2 of December 2017) designating the utilization of portraiture as a strategic method to raise visibility of new cases of state violence via forced disappearance. This claim, upon further exploration, may directly tie the method of portrait dissemination to the international pressure on the Argentine government that ensued in the months following its manifestation.

The international coverage which followed the massive dissemination of Maldonado's face, especially in the protests which occurred on the month anniversary of his disappearance, came from nearly every international news agency; Univision²⁰, the Guardian²¹, BBC²², Telesur²³, The New York Times²⁴, to name a few; and all contained statements mirroring this one from Al Jazeera (7 October, 2017) which constructed the context of coverage of Santiago's disappearance as a result of his face's dissemination in the September 1 protests: : "On Friday, protesters held photos of Santiago Maldonado's face, who was last seen when border police evicted a group of Mapuche from lands in Patagonia owned by Italian company Benetton." This framing of coverage then corroborates Gómez's claim, as the international acknowledgement of his disappearance by news media resulted from coverage of his portrait's wide dissemination; most descriptions of his disappearance in the news media included a representation of his face, usually accompanied by a photo of this portraiture in action within protest.

International condemnation closely followed this worldwide coverage, most notably by human rights groups like Amnesty International²⁵, Human Rights Watch, and the Inter-American Commission on Human rights. In addition, the United Nations High Commissioner on Human Rights Southern Cone representative, Amerigo Incalcaterra, issued a statement on expressing extreme concern about the state's involvement in the disappearance: "It is urgent to clarify the participation of the Gendarmerie in the events, and if demonstrated, to establish its responsibilities and to punish duly both the perpetrators and supporters" (7 October, 2017).

²⁰ In Argentina, protesters ask: "Where is Santiago Maldonado?" <https://goo.gl/5L3siU> (Sep. 15, 2017)

²¹ Argentina activist missing <https://goo.gl/M5LdDx> (Aug. 8, 2017)

²² Santiago Maldonado: Thousands march for missing activist <https://goo.gl/PLeiA2> (Sep. 2, 2017)

²³ Argentina Unites to Demand Return of Santiago Maldonado <https://goo.gl/rHhJBZ> (Aug. 13, 2017)

²⁴ Body Found in Argentine River <https://goo.gl/hjqE1t> (Oct. 19, 2017)

²⁵ "In these tragic moments we stand hand in hand with Santiago's family and will not rest until justice is done and all those responsible are brought to justice" Mariela Belski, Director at Amnesty International Argentina. Amnesty International (Oct. 20, 2017)

While open condemnations of disappearances like this one from international institutions and human rights groups may be seen as the central force demanding government accountability for disappearances and adherence to human rights in Argentina, in this case the government of Macri, the source of the paradigmatic change created is conceivably traced to repeated collective efforts to put the faces of the disappeared on the center stage through their dissemination in protest and the public space.



Figure 16. (Victor R. Caivano /AP)

The creation of collective memory through the dissemination of portraiture in protest:

¿Donde Está Santiago Maldonado?

The creation of a collective memory of the forcibly disappeared through the dissemination of their faces, which share visual claims of their existence throughout society, is at both times a public and an active claim for their existence through portraiture.

According to Longoni (2010), “The strongest emphasis of the photographs has to do with that question; their biography prior to the kidnapping” for the disappeared, their photographs can exist as a public claim of life within society, a claim of life discussed powerfully by Maria Rosa Gómez while she evaluated the power of portraits during the dictatorship: “While the Junta de Comandantes denied the existence of the disappeared, the Mothers, carrying their photos, their images, counteracted that argument wielded from the repressive power. The photo tells of specific person, someone existing, someone who was born, studied and has a family, integrates a family lineage that can not be denied.” (M.R. Gómez, via email interview, 2nd of December 2017). Those forcibly disappeared then become more than their vacancy within society, noticed or unnoticed; the presence of an individual life is claimed and shared through their photos, their memory persisting within these manifestations (whether in photos or other reproductions of their portrait) , they testify “the visual certainty of a past objectified, (...) the objective sign of an existence actually verified by a register” (Déotte, 2004). This public sharing of existence is active in form; it is a public, deliberate claim of existence, the construction of a memory of an individual the state attempted to erase, to censure from society through their disappearance.

The photo of the disappeared person may also exist as a device to *elaborate* a collective memory previously or presently constructed by the state, through the promotion of narrow labels that may attempt to explain, or even justify their disappearance. According to The International Center for Transitional Justice²⁶, this may also function to combat the creation of false narratives by the state or dominant forces in society: “Regimes often deliberately rewrite history and deny atrocities in order to legitimize themselves, fuel mistrust, and even instigate new cycles of

²⁶ The ICTJ is an international non-profit organization that specializes in transitional justice.

violence. Truth seeking contributes to the creation of a historical record that prevents this kind of manipulation” (Truth Seeking, Memory, and Memorials, 2017). In the case of Santiago, the confluence of the state’s promotion of various conflicting theories²⁷ concerning the context of his disappearance constructed an identity based on labels; he was a terrorist, a robber, a fugitive, a foreign agent.

The dissemination of his photograph, his portrait, alongside his name thus creates a humanized biography of life, provided in place of the representation given of him by the state as a removed faceless confluence of various immaterial and dehumanizing labels. In Sylvia Karl’s (2016: 2), research on the creation of memory spaces for the disappeared in Mexico during the 1960s and 70s, which included photographs of the disappeared, this process was labeled as a ‘*rehumanization*’ of the forcibly disappeared in society: “Therein, the processes of *dehumanization* by state actors... are responded to by processes of *rehumanization*....practices and discourses of memory”. The memory constructed through the dissemination of Santiago’s portrait then not only elaborates on, but in addition exists to resist the state’s construction of collective memory of his identity, of his biography; he then, as Maria Gómez puts it, becomes the “vanished young craftsman” with a gaze and and portrait the public has internalized; his identity is then shared and remembered as humanized, existing beyond the state’s chosen representation (M.R. Gómez, via email interview, 2 of December 2017).

Collective memory may be created in some respect through the sheer public recognition of the individual face of a disappeared person within society, an inherent function of portraiture

²⁷La Nación: “La desaparición de Santiago Maldonado: las tres hipótesis que plantean los investigadores” <https://goo.gl/2EC3As> SEPTEMBER 13, 2017
Clarín: “Dos hipótesis del Gobierno en el caso Maldonado: o se ahogó o no estuvo en la protesta” <https://goo.gl/8zXezD> OCTOBER 1, 2017

dissemination. This function within portraiture's collective memory creation has been particularly active within the '*aparición con vida*' protests that have followed individual cases of forced disappearances during Argentina's restored democracy, as seen in the demonstrations following Santiago's initial disappearance. While the question *Dónde está Santiago Maldonado* demands both his return and an explanation of his whereabouts, the dissemination of his photo was also then a way of circulating who he was, through reproductions of his face. "The function photography has been fulfilling for more than a century...using a common resource in the spontaneous search of any lost person" (Longoni, 2010). While this characteristic of modern protests of individual disappearances function in place of the construction of collective memory through more collectivized representations of those disappeared during the last dictatorship, this more individualized construction of collective memory carries with it still,



Figure 17. Photo Courtesy of MAFIA

the legacy of memory of those disappeared under the dictatorship, a legacy, according to Longoni (2010), that contains layers of duality in its form; the photo is both a personal effect and a collective device, both a representation of an individual and a symbol of all the missing:

“These images thus pass from an intimate use to their massive installation in the public space. In this transit...photos of the faces of the disappeared become a collective unequivocal sign. Each one of them traces a life in the singular, and represents metonymically all the missing.” It is to say, in respect to the appearance of Santiago’s face throughout Argentina’s public spaces following his disappearance, that the collective memory society holds through his face, is layered in form, beyond its transition from intimate to public. According to Cora Gamarnik, in the reproductions of Santiago’s portrait, “The power of the photo comes through the gaze, the power is in the eyes of Santiago”: ciphered within his gaze is the memory of portraits of the disappeared under the dictatorship, and the lives and actions they represented, alongside the individual life of Santiago represented through the reproductions of his face. (C. Gamarnik, via phone interview, 19th of November 2017).

Additionally, while a transformed practice, the disseminations of photos in response to an individual disappearance by the public may represent a collectivized version of the personal campaigns waged by the mothers of the disappeared during the dictatorships, who sought to locate disappeared children through the sharing of their photographs. Maria Gómez, explains further that "In search of their missing children, the Mothers took their photos with them, to show them in places they sought and denounced: police stations, hospitals, barracks, morgues, juzgados, and also showed those photos to other relatives to exchange information or news" (M.R. Gómez, via email interview, 2 of December 2017) In this sense, the mother's personal campaigns may be seen as now replicated to a societal scale, the function of this sharing of portraiture still acting out many of the same functions; the transmission of a biography, an active

search, an interaction with state mechanisms, and a fight to retain a memory of an individual disappeared from society.

The creation of a collective memory within society of Santiago Maldonado through the circulation of his face in public spaces, functions dually as a way to channel the memory of the 30,000 forcibly disappeared under the dictatorship (in form, as a widely circulated portrait, and context, as a portrait of a disappeared person), and as a method for creating a collective memory within society through the collective representation of an individual: a member of society whose gaze represents another forced disappeared under a democracy. Maria Rosa Gomez (12/2/2017 interview) states "the Mothers have always had the intuition and creativity to make visible the claim for their loved ones" if the depth of response from Argentine society which was seen following the disappearance of Santiago Maldonado is any indication, this 'mother's' intuition and creativity has been adopted into the strategy of greater society's collective memory building for the disappeared in democracy.



Figure 18. Juan Mabromata / Agence France-Presse -- Getty Images

VI. Conclusions

The massive dissemination of Santiago Maldonado's portrait following his disappearance during a raid by the Gendarmerie, represented a manifestation of protest unrivaled in both size in coverage in Argentina's recent history. Rather than existing as a chance response manifested after an instance of state violence, it should be seen as an example of an institutionalized method of protest within the human rights movement of Argentina, with vast precedent and significance as a visual protest form.

The fact that this method of protest persists in Argentina also leads to an unavoidable conclusion; forced disappearances still occur in the restored democracy. This persistence of

disappearances has led the use of portraiture of the disappeared to undergo many innovations and transformations during its four decades of its existence, but its use as a method to fight for Argentina's adherence to human rights, and the ending of forced disappearances, has persisted through every iteration of use.

Portraiture's manifestations following instances of state violence or terror have also become prime examples of Artistic Activism's realization on a large scale in Argentina. The vast reaches of Maldonado's face in public spaces across Argentina represents clearly the size of its networks of dissemination, a product of both the large level of participation by activist artists, and the large number of general participants in the intervention of Artistic Activism through his portrait's dissemination.

With the Argentine state's demonstrated and deliberate construction of narratives within society relating to victims of state violence, alongside the continued militarization of Argentina's society, Santiago Maldonado's death's occurrence during his participation in the Mapuche peoples' struggle against the multinational Benetton²⁸ exposes persisting mechanisms of state violence, first institutionalized during the dictatorship, as well as the length in which the state attempts to discredit those who are victims of these mechanisms. The dissemination of portraiture of the disappeared represents a modern legacies form of memory construction, but also through this function of memory construction, they combat manufactured state narratives about victims of state violence. The specific power of portraiture allows an emotional

²⁸ This is a struggle currently being fought between states and indigenous groups all over the world, from Standing Rock to Patagonia, as states attempt to overrule indigenous self determination for natural resources. "We are fighting for the dignity of our people, to recuperate our lands and to put a stop to the continued destruction of the earth." Isabel Huala, Pu Lof en Resistencia Departamento Cushmanen (The Communities in Resistance of Cushmanen Department)

connection to be built between society and the the victim of state violence, created through the bond of their gaze.

Portraiture of the disappeared, utilized as an institutionalized method of intervention, represents an instance of artistic activism that follows clear repertoires of contention as a replicated action, and helps construct a collective memory of the disappeared through the dissemination of their portraiture in public spaces, a non violent intervention that represents a crucial tool in the human rights movement of Argentina.

VII. Referencia

Bibliography

Alimi, E. (Nov. 2015) “Repertoires of Contention.” *The Oxford Handbook of Social Movements*.

[1.www.oxfordhandbooks.com/view/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199678402.001.0001/oxfordhb-9780199678402-e-42](http://www.oxfordhandbooks.com/view/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199678402.001.0001/oxfordhb-9780199678402-e-42).

Expósito, M. (2012). *Red Conceptualismos del Sur, 'Perder la forma humana. Una imagen sísmica de los años ochenta en América Latina'*. Madrid: Museo Reina Sofía

Fischer, S. (4 Feb. 2017) Mapuche vs Benetton: Un-Settling the Land. *OpenDemocracy*, OpenDemocracy. www.opendemocracy.net/democraciaabierta/saskia-fischer/mapuche-vs-benetton-un-un-settling-land.

Fischer, S. (5 Oct. 2017) Lof Cushamen y La Desaparición De Santiago Maldonado. *OpenDemocracy*, Open Democracy. www.opendemocracy.net/democraciaabierta/saskia-fischer/lof-cushamen-y-la-desaparicion-de-santiago-maldonado.

Gamarnik, C. (Nov. 2010) *La Construcción De La Imagen De Las Madres De Plaza De Mayo a Través De La Fotografía De Prensa*. Revista Afuera. www.revistaafuera.com/articulo.php?id=129.

Gustavo, B. , y Longoni, A. (2008) eds. *El siluetazo*. Buenos Aires: Adriana Hidalgo Editora.

Grüner, E. (2008) La invisibilidad estratégica, o la redención política de los vivos. *Violencia política y representación estética en el siglo de las desapariciones*. En Longoni, Ana y Bruzzone, Gustavo (comps.) *El Siluetazo*. Buenos Aires: Adriana Hidalgo. 285-308.

(20 Mar. 2016) La Clase Obrera, El Principal Enemigo Para El Plan Ejecutado Por Las FFAA. La Capital. www.lacapital.com.ar/economia/la-clase-obrera-el-principal-enemigo-el-plan-ejecutado-las-ffaa-n497322.html

(28 Aug. 2017) El Rostro De Santiago Maldonado Apareció En Un Edificio De Cofico. *Noticias Al Instante Desde LAVOZ.com.ar | La Voz*, La Voz. www.lavoz.com.ar/politica/el-rostro-de-santiago-maldonado-aparecio-en-un-edificio-de-cofico.

Karl, S. (2014) Rehumanizing the Disappeared: Spaces of Memory in Mexico and the Liminality of Transitional Justice. *American Quarterly*, vol. 66 no. 3, pp. 727-748. *Project MUSE*

Longoni, A. (2010.) Fotos y siluetas: Políticas visuales en el movimiento de derechos humanos en Argentina” Afterall Journal. no. 25: 1–3.

Longoni, A. Arte y Política. (2010b). *Políticas Visuales Del Movimiento De Derechos Humanos Desde La Última Dictadura: Fotos, Siluetas y Escraches*. Aletheia: Cuadernos Críticos Del Derecho.

(29 Aug 2017). M.A.F.I.A. Inició Una Acción Colectiva Por Santiago Maldonado. InfoBaires. Retrieved November 30, 2017,

Melendo, M. J. (2008) Formas De La Memoria En El Arte Postdictatorial Gestos Anti Monumentales Que Desafían La Irrepresentabilidad De La Memoria. Revista Ramona n° 78 .
<http://70.32.114.117/cgi-bin/library?e=q-01000-00---off-0revista--00-1--0-10-0---0---0prompt-10-TX--4-----0-11--11-es-150---30-about-melendo--00-1-1-00-0-0-11-1-0utfZz-8-00&a=d&c=revista&srp=0&srn=0&cl=search&d=HASH0152fc9095dda3933efba545>

Ministry of Education. Education and Memory Program. (2010). *Pensar la dictadura: Terrorismo de Estado en Argentina, preguntas, respuestas y propuestas para su enseñanza* . Buenos Aires: Ministry of Education of the Argentine Nation.

Olzak, S. (1989). Analysis Of Events in the Study of Collective Action. *Annual Review of Sociology* no. 15: 119-141.

Richard, N. (2007) Estudios visuales, políticas de la mirada y crítica de las imágenes. *Fracturas de la memoria. Arte y pensamiento crítico*. Buenos Aires: Siglo XXI., 95-106.

Rancière, J. (2010) *The emancipated spectator*. Buenos Aires: Spring.

Rock, D. (2006). *Argentina 1516-1987: from Spanish Colonization to Alfonsín*. Univ. of California Press.

Rubinich, L. (2007) Apuntes sobre la politicidad del arte. *Ramona* N° 73. Buenos Aires. 10-12

Schindel, E. (2008) Silhouettes, faces, escraches, memory and performance around the human rights movement. Longoni, A. and Bruzzone, G. (comps.) *The Siluetazo*. Buenos Aires: Adriana Hidalgo. 411-425.

Sikkink, K. (2012) *Justice Cascade: How Human Rights Prosecutions Are Changing World Politics*. W W Norton. P. 68-85

Sordo, G. 15 (Aug. 2017) Santiago Maldonado, El Último De Una Larga Lista De Desaparecidos En Democracia. *La Primera Piedra*.
www.laprimerpiedra.com.ar/2017/08/santiago-maldonado-ultimo-desaparecidos-en-democracia/.

Tarrow, S. (2009). *Acciones colectivas y movimientos sociales* Madrid: Alianza.
 Tarrow, S. (1998). *Power in movement*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
 Tilly, C. (1998) *From Mobilization to Revolution*. McGraw-Hill.
 Tilly, C. (2002). [Stories, identities, and political change](#). Rowman & Littlefield.
 Tilly, C. (2003). [The politics of collective violence](#). Cambridge University Press.
 (2017) Truth-Seeking, Memory, and Memorials | ICTJ. *International Center for Transitional Justice*. www.ictj.org/our-work/transitional-justice-issues/truth-and-memory

Bibliography of News Articles

(1 Sept. 2017) Argentina Police Detain Protesters in Santiago Maldonado Rally. TeleSur. Accessed 2 Nov. 2017.
www.telesur.tv/english/news/Argentina-Rallies-Call-for-Return-of-Santiago-Maldonado-One-Month-He-Disappeared-20170901-0005.html

(Sep. 2 2017) Thousands March for Missing Activist Santiago Maldonado., Al Jazeera. <https://goo.gl/xaqGkg>

(Sept 13,. 2017) La Desaparición De Santiago Maldonado: Las Tres Hipótesis Que Plantean Los Investigadores. La Nación.
www.lanacion.com.ar/2062433-caso-maldonado-los-tres-escenarios-que-plantean-los-investigadores

(Oct. 4, 2017) Gendarmerie Interrupted an Act For Maldonado in a University. Minuto Uno. www.minutouno.com/notas/3043188-gendarmeria-interrumpio-un-acto-maldonado-una-universidad.

(Oct. 20, 2017). Argentina: Authorities must guarantee justice for Santiago Maldonado. Amnesty international. <https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2017/10/argentina-las-autoridades-deben-garantizar-justicia-para-santiago-maldonado/>

Bertoia, L. (7 October, 2017) UN, IACHR Press Govt over Maldonado. *Buenos Aires Times*, batimes.com.ar/news/argentina/un-iachr-press-govt-over-maldonado.phtml.

Bibliography of photos

Figure 1

Zabala, M. (Aug. 15, 2017). *Santiago Maldonado, el último de una larga lista de desaparecidos en democracia.*
www.laprimera piedra.com.ar/2017/08/santiago-maldonado-ultimo-desaparecidos-en-democracia

Figure 2

Garcia, D. (Apr. 4, 1983) *Marcha de Madres de Plaza de Mayo bajo la lluvia*
http://archivosenuso.org/ddhh/archivo#viewer=/viewer/586%3Fas_overlay%3Dtrue&js=

Figure 3

http://archivosenuso.org/ddhh/archivo#viewer=/viewer/586%3Fas_overlay%3Dtrue&js=

Figure 4

Brindicci, M. (Sep. 1, 2017). *Un hombre mira su teléfono celular frente a un retrato de Santiago Maldonado* <https://lta.reuters.com/article/topNews/idLTAKBN1CP2RX-OUHLT>

Figure 5

M.A.F.I.A. (Sep. 15, 2017) *¿Dónde está Santiago Maldonado?*
<http://www.univision.com/noticias/america-latina/en-argentina-preguntan-donde-esta-santiago-maldonado>

Figure 6

Photo taken by author. (Sep. 8, 2017)

Figure 7

(Sep. 18, 2017). *A diez años de su desaparición, realizan una nueva movilización por Jorge Julio López.* El Diario.
<https://www.eldiario24.com/nota/desaparecido/383890/a-diez-anos-desaparicion-realizan-nueva-movilizacion-jorge-julio-lopez.html>

Figure 8

Photo taken by author. (Sep. 8, 2017)

Figure 9

Nazza Plantilla. (Jan. 31, 2014). *Aparición con Vida de Luciano Arruga*
https://www.flickr.com/photos/nazza_stncl/12240216196

Figure 10

Nazza Plantilla. (Sep. 30, 2017). *Santiago Maldonado*.
https://www.flickr.com/photos/nazza_stncl/37901475506/

Figure 11

M.A.F.I.A. (Sep. 15, 2017) *¿Dónde está Santiago Maldonado?*
<http://www.univision.com/noticias/america-latina/en-argentina-preguntan-donde-esta-santiago-maldonado>

Figure 12

A.N.A. (Oct. 19, 2017)
<https://noticiasanarquistas.noblogs.org/post/2017/10/19/argentina-comunicado-da-familia-de-santiago-maldonado-1810-20hs/>

Figure 13

Orge, G. (Aug. 29, 2017). *El rostro de Santiago Maldonado seguirá apareciendo en distintos edificios de Córdoba*
<https://www.google.com.ar/amp/m.lavoz.com.ar/amp/politica/el-rostro-de-santiago-maldonado-seguira-apareciendo-en-distintos-edificios-de-cordoba>

Figure 14

M.A.F.I.A. (Sep. 15, 2017) *¿Dónde está Santiago Maldonado?*
<http://www.univision.com/noticias/america-latina/en-argentina-preguntan-donde-esta-santiago-maldonado>

Figure 15

Shaw, E. (Aug. 3, 1983). *Madre con pañuelo*.
http://archivosenuso.org/ddhh/archivo#viewer=/viewer/586%3Fas_overlay%3Dtrue&js=

Figure 16

Caivano, V. (Aug. 29, 2017) *Manifestación en la Plaza de Mayo*
<http://www.lavanguardia.com/internacional/20170829/43901243768/donde-esta-santiago-maldonado-pregunta-se-ha-hecho-viral-en-argentina-por-que.html>

Figure 17

M.A.F.I.A. (Sep. 15, 2017) *¿Dónde está Santiago Maldonado?*
<http://www.univision.com/noticias/america-latina/en-argentina-preguntan-donde-esta-santiago-maldonado>

Figure 18

AFP. (Oct.18, 2017). *Santiago Maldonado*.

<https://www.eluniverso.com/noticias/2017/10/18/nota/6437812/hallan-documento-santiago-maldonado-cuerpo-encontrado-rio-argentina?device=mobile>

Photo Appendix part A.

(Sep. 3, 2017). *Mural por Santiago Maldonado*.

<http://rayaalmedio.com/mural-santiago-maldonado>

Photo Appendix part B.

M.A.F.I.A. (Sep. 15, 2017) *¿Dónde está Santiago Maldonado?*

<http://www.univision.com/noticias/america-latina/en-argentina-preguntan-donde-esta-santiago-maldonado>

Photo Appendix part C.

Zout, H. (2004). *El retrato de Julio López retomado por Gabriel Orge*. Río

Ctalamochita. <https://www.google.com.ar/amp/s/cursobasicodefotografia.wordpress.com/2015/04/30/ganadores-salon-nacional-2015-categoria-fotografia/amp/>

Photo Appendix part D.

(Sep. 17, 2017). *Mural De Santiago Maldonado. Obra de Daniel Murlo*. Río Negro.

<http://www.eldiarioderauch.com.ar/general/13162-artista-rauchense-pinto-mural-por-santiago-maldonado.html>

Photo Appendix part E.

Sosa, C. (2017). *Donde esta...Santiago Maldonado?*

<http://www.revistarupturas.com/donde-mierda-esta-santiago-maldonado.html>

Photo Appendix

Appendix A. Process of wheat pasting posters sourced from Mafia's downloadable documents



figure a.



figure b.



Figure c.

Appendix B. MAFIA posters in public spaces

figure d. Courtesy of mafia



figure e. Courtesy of Mafia



figure d. Photo courtesy of Mafia



figure e. Photo courtesy of Mafia

Appendix C.



Zout, H. (2004). *El retrato de Julio López retomado por Gabriel Orge*. Río Ctalamochita.

Appendix D.
Mural Collaboration with muralist Daniel Merlo



Photo courtesy of El Diario

Appendix E.
Disseminated masks and flyers representing Santiago Maldonado's face in protest.



Photo courtesy of Revista Rupturas

Interview Appendix

Transcript of Interview (11/10/2017) with Gabriel Orge, conducted over email:

- Con la acción visual concreta realizaste en relación a la desaparición de Santiago

Maldonado, ¿cuales son tus objetivos? ¿qué resultados tuviste, cómo funcionó la

acción, tuvo repercusiones?

En la proyección de Santiago Maldonado hay un tiempo presente, una urgencia que impone la realidad ante el devenir de los acontecimientos y la necesidad de una solución. La intervención se vuelve una vía para un reclamo de justicia, e intenta ahuyentar los fantasmas del pasado y darle visibilidad al reclamo.

Creo que la acción fue eficaz, hubo mucha gente que pasaba por el lugar y se "apropió" a través del gesto espontáneo de registrar con su teléfono la proyección y compartirla en las redes, se viralizó, fue compartida miles de veces, incluso se produjo un efecto de réplica (personas y

colectivos proyectaron el rostro de Santiago, se apropiaron del recurso, del gesto) en distintas ciudades del país y hasta en el extranjero, según pude ver en las redes. También sucedió que fue publicada como noticia en distintos medios del país.

- ¿qué potencia política tiene la utilización de un rostro en un reclamo ante una desaparición forzada por las fuerzas represivas del Estado?

¿Cuál es su potencia particular en relación a otros modos de intervención visual?

La intervención es efímera pero la obra no se agota en esa acción ya que toma otras formas, otras materialidades, la obra continúa en la circulación del registro espontáneo y colectivo, por las redes, por los medios, también por las réplicas de los individuos o colectivos que deciden seguir apareciendo a Santiago a través de proyecciones en distintos puntos del país e incluso del exterior.

Lo que proyecto es luz que propaga una imagen sobre una superficie durante un lapso de tiempo, es un gesto frágil y efímero que hace referencia a lo espectral, y que expresa un deseo personal y de cierto sector de la sociedad, que aparezcan los que no están, los que fueron desaparecidos. Quizás la potencia política de la acción esté dada por la capacidad de seducir y acercar, sensibilizar a quienes ideológicamente estén en otra posición (esto es una suposición). La acción construye una metáfora sobre la fragilidad de la existencia y la potencia del recuerdo, luz sobre el paisaje.

English Translation of Interview transcript with Gabriel Orge, 11/10/2017:

- With the concrete visual action you took in relation to the disappearance of Santiago Maldonado, what were your objectives? What results did you have, how did the action work, and did it have repercussions?

In the projection of Santiago Maldonado there is a time of present, an urgency that imposes reality before the evolution of events, and the need for a solution. The intervention becomes a way for a claim of justice, and tries to drive away the ghosts of the past and give visibility to the claim.

I think the action was effective, there were many people who passed through the place and "appropriated" it through the spontaneous gesture of registering with the phone the projection and sharing it on the networks, it was viralized, it was shared thousands of times, there was even an effect of replication (people and groups projected the face of Santiago, appropriated the resource, the gesture) in different cities of the country and even abroad, as I could see in the networks. It also happened that it was published as news in different media in the country.

- What political power does the use of a face have in a claim against an enforced disappearance by the repressive forces of the State?

What is its particular power in relation to other modes of visual intervention?

The intervention is ephemeral but the work is not exhausted in that action as it takes other forms, other materialities, the work continues in the circulation of the spontaneous and collective record, by the networks, by the means, also by the replicas of the individuals or groups that decide to continue appearing in Santiago through projections in different parts of the country and even from abroad.

It is a project through light, which propagates an image on a surface during a period of time, it is a fragile and ephemeral gesture that makes reference to the spectral, and that expresses a personal desire and of a certain sector of society, that appears those that are not here, those that were disappeared. Perhaps the political power of the action is given by the ability to seduce and bring closer, sensitize those who are ideologically in another position (this is a supposition). The action builds a metaphor about the fragility of existence and the power of memory, light on the landscape.

Transcript of interview (12/217) conducted over email with Maria Rosa Gómez.

Acerca de la representación de las figuras de los desaparecidos.

*La autora es periodista, investigadora y docente de Comunicación de las Universidades Nacionales de Buenos Aires y del Centro. Tiene a su cargo la materia Derechos humanos, Comunicación, Cultura y Medios de la Maestría en Comunicación y DD.HH de la Facultad de Periodismo de la Universidad Nacional de la Plata. Trabaja en el área de Investigación de la Secretaría de DD.HH de la Nación. Es Doctoranda de la Facultad de Ciencias Sociales de la Universidad de Buenos Aires.

- En qué momento (año) las madres y los organismos de derechos humanos comienzan a utilizar los rostros de los desaparecidos para reclamar su “*aparición con vida*”?

En búsqueda de sus hijos desaparecidos, las Madres llevaban con ellas sus fotos, para mostrarla en los lugares donde iban a buscar y denunciar: comisarías, hospitales, cuarteles, morgues, juzgados. También para mostrar esas fotos a otros familiares e intercambiar datos o información. Pero en 1977, en ocasión de una marcha que los fieles de la Virgen de Luján realizan a la Basílica, las Madres se colgaron del cuello fotos mas grandes y se pusieron los pañuelos blancos como forma de identificación. Los pañuelos, eran pañales de tela, que en ese momento se usaban para cambiar a los bebés, a ellas les pareció que ese era un distintivo que representaba su búsqueda. Más tarde bordaron los nombres de sus hijos en los pañuelos blancos. Hacia 1979 las Abuelas de Plaza de Mayo colocan fotos de sus nietos secuestrados en banderas y afiches. A fines de 1982 las Madres comienzan a portar pancartas con fotos grandes de sus desaparecidos. Era una forma contundente de responder al negacionismo del Terrorismo de Estado. Mientras la Junta de Comandantes negaba la existencia de los desaparecidos, las Madres, portando sus fotos, sus imágenes, contrarrestaban esa argumentación esgrimida desde el poder represivo. La foto, da cuenta de una persona concreta, alguien existente, alguien que nació, estudió y tiene una familia, integra un linaje familiar que no puede ser negado. En 1983, por iniciativa de un grupo de artistas plásticos que llevaron la idea a Madres y al Servicio de Paz y Justicia, en la Segunda Marcha de la Resistencia se trazaron miles de siluetas representando a los desaparecidos. Esas siluetas se pegaron en las paredes y edificios a lo largo de Avenida de May y rodeando la emblemática Plaza de Mayo. Aun estábamos bajo dictadura, la Plaza estaba rodeada de personal militar armado. Las siluetas que no alcanzamos a pegar, las llevamos nosotros

mismos en la gran marcha de cierre. En otros años las Madres lanzaron la campaña Una mano por los desaparecidos, con el trazo de la silueta de las manos de todos los que se acercaban a las mesas donde se juntaban. Esas manos luego se colgaron en toda la Plaza de Mayo. En síntesis, las Madres han tenido siempre la intuición y la creatividad para visibilizar el reclamo por su seres queridos, esas acciones las considero actos de resistencia política y simbólica.

- ¿Cuáles son los casos que más recuerdes de la utilización del rostro de un desaparecido durante la democracia?

Otro caso conmovedor y paradigmático fue el caso de la segunda desaparición de Jorge Julio López. López había sido víctima de desaparición forzada el 27 de octubre de 1976, estuvo secuestrado en los Centros Clandestinos de Detención Cuatrerismo de Arana, Pozo de Arana, Comisaría 5 y Comisaría 8 de La Plata, hasta que 6 meses después fue puesto a disposición del PEN en la Unidad 9 de La Plata. Recobró su libertad el 24 de junio de 1979. Fue testigo fundamental en el juicio contra el represor Miguel Osvaldo Etchecolatz, Jefe de Investigaciones de la policía de la Provincia de Buenos Aires durante la dictadura militar. El 18 de julio de 2006 en plena democracia y a escasas horas de dictarse la sentencia que enviaría a la cárcel a Etchecolatz, López fue secuestrado. Desde entonces permanece desaparecido. Su rostro fue representado de distintas maneras por artistas plásticos que acompañaron a los organismos de derechos humanos. Te adjuntaré una de las representaciones que hizo Oscar Flores para las publicaciones del Instituto Espacio para la Memoria.

- ¿Cómo te parece que funcionó a nivel social (empatía) o comunicacional (difusión en redes y medios de comunicación) la utilización del rostro de Santiago Maldonado para reclamar al Estado su aparición y generar visibilidad sobre su desaparición forzada?

La difusión del caso Maldonado a través de las redes sociales en principio logró instalar el tema en los grandes medios, ya que salvo unos pocos, nadie hablaba del caso. Las redes sociales activaron de forma impactante y creativa el rostro del joven artesano desaparecido, y con recursos que permite la tecnología y el arte digital, ese rostro se reprodujo -hasta el día de hoy- logrando un alto impacto social. Pero no sólo se usaron las redes, sino también afiches,

panfletos, banderas, pancartas, grafitis. Todas las herramientas visuales convencionales, articuladas con nuevos recursos, instalaron el rostro de Santiago en amplias capas de la sociedad

B) Translated interview with Maria Rosa Gómez exploring the representations of the disappeared.

* The author is a journalist, researcher and teacher of Communication of the National Universities of Buenos Aires and the Center. She is responsible for the subject Human Rights, Communication, Culture and Media of the Master's Degree in Communication and Human Rights at the Faculty of Journalism of the National University of La Plata. She works in the Research area of the Human Rights Secretariat of the Nation. She is a PhD candidate at the Faculty of Social Sciences of the University of Buenos Aires.

- In what era (year) did the mothers and human rights organizations begin to use the faces of the disappeared to claim their "appearance alive?"

In search of their missing children, the Mothers took their photos with them, to show them in the places they sought and denounced: police stations, hospitals, barracks, morgues, ‘juzgados’, also to show those photos to other relatives and exchange information or news, but in 1977, during a march that the faithful of the Virgin of Luján carried out At the Basilica, the Mothers hung larger photos of their necks and put on their white handkerchiefs as a form of identification. The handkerchiefs were cloth diapers, which at that time were used to change the babies, to them it seemed that It was a badge that represented his search, and later they embroidered the names of their children in white scarves, and by 1979 the Grandmothers of

Plaza de Mayo placed photos of their grandchildren. os in flags and posters. At the end of 1982 the Mothers began to carry banners with large photos of their disappeared. It was a forceful way to respond to the denial of State Terrorism. While the Junta de Comandantes denied the existence of the disappeared, the Mothers, carrying their photos, their images, counteracted that argument wielded from the repressive power. The photo, tells of a specific person, someone existing, someone who was born, studied and has a family, integrates a family lineage that can not be denied. In 1983, at the initiative of a group of artists who brought the idea to Mothers and the Peace and Justice Service, in the Second March of Resistance, thousands of silhouettes representing the disappeared were drawn. Those silhouettes stuck on the walls and buildings along Avenida de May and surrounding the emblematic Plaza de Mayo. We were still under dictatorship, the Plaza was surrounded by armed military personnel. The silhouettes that we can not hit, we take them ourselves in the big closing march. In other years, the Mothers launched the campaign A Hand for the Disappeared, with the stroke of the silhouette of the hands of all those who approached the tables where they met. Those hands were then hung throughout the Plaza de Mayo. In short, the Mothers have always had the intuition and creativity to make visible the claim for their loved ones, those actions I consider acts of political and symbolic resistance.

- What are the most remembered cases of the use of the face of a disappeared person during democracy?

Another moving and paradigmatic case was the case of the second disappearance of Jorge Julio López. López had been a victim of enforced disappearance on October 27, 1976, he was kidnapped in the Clandestine Detention Centers Cuatrismo de Arana, Pozo de Arana,

Comisaría 5 and Comisaría 8 de La Plata, until 6 months later he was placed at the disposal of the PEN in Unit 9 of La Plata. He regained his freedom on June 24, 1979. He was a fundamental witness in the trial against the repressor Miguel Osvaldo Etchecolatz, Chief of Investigations of the police of the Province of Buenos Aires during the military dictatorship. On July 18, 2006, in full democracy and a few hours after sentencing to send Etchecolatz to jail, López was kidnapped. Since then he has disappeared. His face was represented in different ways by plastic artists who accompanied the human rights organizations. I will attach one of the representations made by Oscar Flores for the publications of the Space for Memory Institute.

- How do you think it worked at the social (empathetic) or communicational level (diffusion in networks and media), the use of the face of Santiago Maldonado, to demand the State its appearance and generate visibility about its forced disappearance?

The spread of the Maldonado case through social networks in principle managed to install the issue in the mainstream media, because except for a few, no one spoke of the case. Social networks activated in a powerful and creative way the face of the vanished young craftsman, and with resources that technology and digital art allows, that face was reproduced -until today- achieving a high social impact. But not only the networks were used, but also posters, pamphlets, flags, banners, graffiti. All visual tools.

Interview bibliography

Gamarnik, Cora. (11/19/2017). Conducted over telephone.

Gómez, Maria Rosa. (12/2/2017). Conducted over email.

Orge, Gabriel. (11/10/2017). Conducted over email.