Fall 2017

Language, Race, and Integration: A Comparative Exploration of the Sub-Saharan Migrant Experience in Morocco

Madeline Davison

Language, Race, and Integration:

A Comparative Exploration of the Sub-Saharan Migrant Experience in Morocco

Madeline Davison

SIT Morocco: Migration

and Transnational Identity

Rabat, Morocco

Madeline Davison, Cognitive and Linguistic Sciences, Wellesley College.

This research was conducted in affiliation with the Migration and Transnational Identity Study

Abroad Program at SIT, under the advisement of Dr. Said Bennis, Mohammed V University,

Rabat, Morocco.

Contact: mdavison@wellesley.edu

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements

Abstract

This paper uses a qualitative approach to explain the divide between local and migrant populations in the Moroccan context. This divide is primarily influenced by "feelings of otherness" and is triggered first and foremost by differences in physical appearance—easily identifiable differences upon first impression. Though inspired by a nearly instantaneous arrangement, this divide is fueled further by an inconsistency of language usage between groups. Because there is a wide variety of migrant experiences in this context, it is important to identify some of the differences between these lived experiences. Upon observation, the question, "What are the fundamental differences between migrants' lived experiences?" can help answer "What mechanisms are facilitating the divide between sub-Saharan migrants and local Moroccans?"

Language, Race, and Integration:

A comparative exploration of the sub-Saharan migrant experience

Introduction

Morocco is a nation of unique diversity: a multilingual society with an extraordinary influx of migratory populations. These interconnected factors led to the exploration of language and integration as the primary focus of this study. The process of integration is a complicated one. In order to address the issue more precisely, the decision was made to define *integration* for the purposes of this paper as the following: the inclusion of a once-foreign member of a community to the extent that he or she is self-sufficiently a member, without the reliance of others in order to participate in and receive the benefits of the community. This definition is used to address the integrative status of different types of migrants within Morocco. Special attention is drawn in particular to migrants from sub-Saharan regions due to the added discrimination that they face. Thus, the question, "What are the fundamental differences between migrants' lived experiences?" helps address the overarching issue of "What mechanisms are facilitating the divide between sub-Saharan migrants and local Moroccans?"

Background

Historic and Geographic Context

Arab conquest in the 8th century led to the widely used forms of Arabic language and Islamic beliefs that dominate Morocco today, particularly in large, urbanized communities throughout the country, while the older still Amazigh people continue to populate rural areas throughout the North African country. (Ennaji, 2005, p. 10) European interest as early as the 14th century and French colonization in the 20th century led to the usage of French in urban regions

and more specifically, professional and governmental ties between Morocco and Europe that are still maintained today, even post-independence.

Morocco is, in effect, a gateway between the African and European continents. This is both a geographic and symbolic observation. Geographically, the Strait of Gibraltar separates the continents by a mere 8.9 miles. Over time, this geographical link has fostered a cultural interplay that has contributed to Morocco's cosmopolitan identity, while the proximity to the Middle East unites this North African country with its Arab-Islamic roots.

Migration Definitions and Demographics

Due to both the geographic and social components of the link between Morocco and Europe, migration is not only common, but to be expected. Migration can take many forms, as it is chiefly the movement of people. The further back in history that we stray from today's interpretations of the term *migrant*, the murkier the definitions become. That said, for the purposes of this paper, migrant may refer to any individual who moves with the intent of changing their own life, not the lives of those within the destination community. This excludes travel for the sake of implementing foreign rule or structure onto the population of the destination (e.g. colonialism). The specification should also be made that a migrant in this context relocates to establish their place of residence, thereby excluding tourists and temporarily visiting students. Though it is important to note that the intent of international students may, in some cases, be to stay in the destination country beyond the foreseeable future, in which case, they may qualify as migrants. *Transit migration* and *internal migration* are also deemed migration within the context of this paper. The former refers to migrants passing through—or intending to pass through—multiple countries before reaching their destinations. The latter, to migration that occurs within national borders.

Morocco has migrants from many different regions and for various different reasons. These reasons include but are not limited to economic migration, education, family reunification, refuge from warfare and conflicts, and transit to another destination. In 2012, the number of individuals holding residence permits included 29,650 migrants from other African countries and 31,483 migrants from European countries. (De Bel-Air, 2016) These numbers include authorized migrants, as well as *refugees*. The UNHCR defines a refugee as "someone who has been forced to flee his or her country because of persecution, war, or violence. A refugee has a well-founded fear of persecution for reasons of race, religion, nationality, political opinion or membership in a particular social group." (UNHCR) This statistic does not include the particularly large number of clandestine migrants that reach and inhabit Morocco. It is incredibly difficult to find a trustworthy statistic of this information, though in 2014, it was estimated that 25,000 sub-Saharan migrants inhabit Morocco. (al-Mousawi, 2014) Two years later, approximately 14,000 sub-Saharan migrants held residence permits in the country. (De Bel-Air, 2016) According to the Ministry in Charge of Moroccans Living Abroad and Migration Affairs, 16,000 regularization requests were received from undocumented migrants living in-country this year. (Morocco World News, 2017)

Racism and Discrimination

"While both African and European immigrants in Morocco often lack legal status, migrants and refugees from sub-Saharan Africa are the regular target of violent racist attacks and discrimination in Morocco." (de Haas, 2014) This racism extends to publication and media as well, with little attempt to be discrete. Publications like al-Shamal and Maroc Hebdo have openly published articles revealing racist sentiments with headlines such as "'Black locusts' are taking over Morocco!" (Goldschmidt, 2006) and "the Black Danger." (de Haas, 2014)

As a side effect of the large number of clandestine migrants and of the ways that they are portrayed in the media, gross generalizations are made against sub-Saharan migrants, resulting in a sometimes blatant exclusion and thus, an apparent divide between those that have the appearance of being from a sub-Saharan country and those who do not. It is for this reason that this study intends to observe the effects of *otherness* in the Moroccan context.

Otherness is a divisive sentiment felt between communities or individuals upon interaction, instigated by an assumed difference in identity, and often leading to isolation on one or both sides. For the sake of this paper, a distinction should be made between otherness and *racism*. While racism operates on the notion that one community, as identified by race, is inherently superior than the other, otherness is the distinction between the self and an "other"— either in the form of an individual or a community—based on identifiers of the "other" and an inherent and comprehensive self-identity. While all displays of racism fall under the domain of— and are inspired by—feelings of otherness, racism is not, in this context, a blanket statement for all sentiments and/or acts inspired by feelings of otherness. This distinction is made for a few reasons. Firstly, so as not to dilute the term "racism" of its poignancy and thus, cloud the severity of racist encounters. Secondly, to argue that the racism inspired by feelings of otherness is due to an element that can be addressed, rather than being inherent within individuals. Thirdly, to recognize the notion of identity as inclusive of both *primary* and *secondary identifiers*.

A primary identifier is an element of one's identity that can be observed instantaneously, such as physical appearance. The argument can be made that in terms of facilitating feelings of otherness, physical appearance can be seen as a type of catalyst in determining an individual as an "other." In contrast, a secondary identifier is an element of one's identity that cannot be observed instantaneously, such as language, religion, even likes and dislikes. Both primary and

secondary identifiers can be reasons that someone might associate an "other" with a particular community. It is also the case these identifiers might be reasons for one to associate themselves with a particular community.

As these factors of one's identity can appear to have a be-all, end-all determinacy in terms of one's place in the community, it is important to maintain the concept of a mixed identity within the scope of this argument.

> [Hamers and Blanc (1989, p. 124)] argue that "the harmonious integration of two cultures into [a person's] identity calls for a social setting that allows dual cultural or ethnic membership", and that the development of what has been called "additive binguality" is "dependent on social factors that lead to the valorization of both languages and cultures". That is, if members of a society which is mixed, culturally and linguistically, are to acquire dual membership of the two cultures, "the society in which [they live] must not present these two cultures as conflictual and mutually exclusive…" The two languages must be esteemed, and neither of the two language groups can be exclusivist, if immigrants are to acquire a mixed identity. (Adams, 2003, p. 366)

Here, Adams is referring to bilingualism being a form of mixed identity. As language is a type of secondary identifier, the physical appearance of the bilingual individual in question acts as a primary identifier, potentially standing in the way of that individual's path to integration. If the surrounding community is mentally blocked by the differences they *see*, this could prove difficult for them to accept the person in question into their community.

Linguistic Dynamics in Morocco

Multilingualism is a commonality in Morocco. This is a result of historical factors, of present day migration, and of an effort on the part of the government to keep step with global

progressive patterns. (Ennaji, 2005) The three dialects of Tamazight are native to Amazigh

communities predominantly located in the rural areas of Morocco. In 2011, Tamazight was

recognized as an official language in addition to Arabic, which is used more commonly in urban

areas throughout Morocco. (Pulitzer Center, 2017) Within Arabic, the distinction should be made

between *Fus'ha* and *Darija*. Fus'ha is otherwise known as Modern Standard Arabic and is used

strictly in academic environments. Students are taught Fus'ha upon entering primary school and

use it throughout a typical public education. Fus'ha is also the language of the Quran and many

other literary texts referenced in academia. Darija is Moroccan dialectical Arabic, with

derivatives from Fus'ha, French, and Tamazight. In this study, Darija is labeled as a *vernacular*

language, referring to the fact that Darija-speakers learn the language as a mother tongue, speak

it casually, and do not use it professionally.

European languages are also common among the Moroccan population. Many people

speak French fluently, which can be attributed to the fairly recent French colonization of

Morocco, in the 20th century. Spanish is spoken in the northern regions of the country for a

similar reason, and there is often a general understanding of English throughout urban areas

primarily because of tourism and pop-culture. In addition to all of these languages, the effects of

migration provide an interspersed array of foreign languages throughout Morocco. "The

sociolinguistic situation in Morocco today is characterized by widespread multilingualism since

many languages serve different purposes. For that reason, many Moroccans have a knowledge of

at least two languages, … However, monolingualism, either in [Tamazight] or in Moroccan

Arabic, is still important for about half of the population is illiterate." (Ennaji, 2005, p. 15) It

should be noted that as of 2015, the illiteracy rate in Morocco dropped from 42% in 2005 to

32%. (Morocco World News, 2015)

There is a strong correlation between the French colonization of Morocco and the current relationship that the two countries have. "Despite the challenge posed by [the spread of] English, French remains a medium for modernity in North Africa." (Alalou, 2009, p. 573) French is omnipresent in urban communities, sometimes without Arabic at all. Another significant example of the push for the usage of French is in the education system. "There is a strong competition between Classical Arabic and French, for they are interchangeably used to fulfill grossly similar functions. However, while French prevails as a language of science, Classical Arabic is regarded, by officials and non-officials alike, as a language of religion and ancient literature." (Ennaji, 2005, p. 102) While public schools teach French as a second language, many private schools opt for French as the primary language of instruction. It could be argued that *Arabization* is the catalyst for this difference in language.

After independence from France in 1956, Morocco engaged in an Arabization process. Arabization in the current, Moroccan context is the structural replacement of French with Arabic in the public sphere, post-independence. Though the intent was to establish a consistent Moroccan identity, independent of European influence, the failure to divorce from all European ties enables the influence to persist, this time, within a more exclusive community, rather than nation-wide. (Pulitzer Center, 2017)

Arabization efforts immediately affect public—government enforced—signs and postings. By nature, public resources are more accessible, whereas private resources—which continue to use French—are more prestigious, accessed and utilized only by an elite community. Thus, Arabization, though principally implemented as an effort to establish a unified Moroccan identity, has instead created a divide between Moroccans who have access to private resources and those who do not. As an example of the effect that this divide has on the Moroccan

community, the Pulitzer Center identifies "The site of a former 'free school' in Meknes from 1915 to 1945. Prior to independence, these private Arabic-oriented schools emerged as a way for parents to resist French education. The rapidly expanding private school market now serves the opposite purpose, helping children have earlier access to French and avoid 'Arabized' school." (2017)

The difference in language instruction between private and public resources and schools only increases the alienation of the public sphere from high-paying, prestigious jobs. "French, which is obligatory in schools, is the medium of teaching scientific and technical disciplines in higher education. As such, French is considered an important tool for socio-economic development and an invaluable window on modern culture and technology, and an important means of communication with the rest of the world." (Ennaji, 2005, p. 101) Additionally, the usage of French is heavily correlated with affluent populations, which is consistent with the expensive costs of private French education. "French is essentially used by middle and upper social classes, educated people, and by a few individuals in the working class who happen to have contacts with French-speaking people." (Ennaji, 2005, p. 106)

Literature Review

Three pieces of literature are used as pivotal resources for this paper. The first, Ziad Bentahar's "Continental Drift- The Disjunction of North and sub-Saharan Africa," speaks to the puzzling observation that North Africa is seldom referred to as the same 'Africa' as sub-Saharan Africa, thereby touching on some of the elements of identity that inexplicably separate Morocco and its lateral neighbors from the rest of the continent. The second, the ninth chapter of Moha Ennaji's *Multilingualism, Cultural Identity, and Education in Morocco*, is entitled "Language Use and Language Attitudes"—and is quite self-explanatory. For the purpose of this literature

review, Darija and French will be addressed within this context. The third, Johara Berriane's study, "Sub-Saharan students in Morocco: determinants, everyday life, and future plans of a high skilled migrant group," is potentially the most closely related to this paper. This study surrounds the experiences, struggles, and expectations several sub-Saharan international students have while studying in Morocco and interacting with Moroccans.

Continental Drift- The Disjunction of North and sub-Saharan Africa

It is not uncommon to hear a Moroccan refer to Africa as being a separate entity from where it is that they stand. The Moroccan identity is multifaceted and is often linked to Morocco's connections and proximity with Europe, its shared values and traditions with the Middle East, and somewhat haphazardly with its continental ties to Africa. For the purpose of this study, the question of why North and sub-Saharan Africa maintain a disconnect is vital in understanding the attitudes surrounding migration between the two regions.

The issue of the separation between North and sub-Saharan Africa is not a new one. As Bentahar points out, "there were also distinctions made between North and sub-Saharan Africa predating the beginning of European colonialism, and going back much earlier. However, it is in the twentieth century that the study of African literature emerged as an academic discipline, and cemented the general marginalization of North Africa in that field." (2011, p. 2)

Upon his rise to power following the Egyptian revolution in 1952, Gamal Abdul Nasser wrote via *Egypt's Liberation: The Philosophy of the Revolution*, "'I may say without exaggeration that we cannot, under any circumstance, however much we may desire it, remain aloof from the terrible, the sanguinary conflict going on between five million white and 200 million Africans. We cannot do so for an important and obvious reason: we are *in* Africa.' (109)"

(Bentahar, 2011, p. 5) This quote is significant due to the observation of dissonance between two African communities at a time when the divide was not as significant as it is today.

In the late 20th and early 21st centuries, there have been many political issues that have caused African countries to take opposing sides. Often times, these sides are decided based on the countries' affiliations with Middle Eastern countries. "Therefore, in spite of a series of attempts by Libyan president Muammar Qaddafi to lead movements of African unity, and an enduring strand of pan-Africanism that rejects the separation between North and sub-Saharan Africa… trans-Saharan political ties never became as strong as the solidarity between countries on either side of the Sahara during the period of decolonization." (Bentahar, 2011, p. 6) It could be assumed that the primary reason for North Africa's stance on some of these issues lies behind Islamic values and stronger ties to the Arab world than to Africa.

Bentahar concludes on the note that "the fundamental issue is not to discover whether North Africa is essentially African and belongs in that continent instead of the Arab World, or if it has more affinities with the Middle East instead. Rather, it is a question of the extent to which "African" and "Arab" are not mutually exclusive labels." (2011, p. 11) With this argument in mind, it is important to consider the elements of self-identity that Moroccans, or North Africans, have and by what means they are associated with any given community outside of their own.

Multilingualism, Cultural Identity, and Education in Morocco

Chapter 9: Language Use and Language Attitudes

The purpose of addressing language and language use in this literature review is to gain a better perspective of the context of language use in Morocco. For the sake of simplicity and relevance, this review is limited to the perceptions of Darija and French, only.

In the beginning of the chapter, Ennaji gives a simple, yet true statement about the way language should be studied. "The languages chosen for communication are generally those that people favour. The more a language is liked or appreciated, the more it is used in different domains. Similarly, a language that is disliked by speakers will be used less frequently. Language attitudes are crucial as they represent important aspects that are helpful in the sociolinguistic description of the language profile of the multilingual individual." (2005, p. 157)

Ennaji elaborates on the opinions of Darija and French through two different groups of people. These people can best be identified with their consistent attitudes toward the value and role of language. First there are the conservative Arabists, who, according to Ennaji, "view Moroccan Arabic as a degenerate variety which is not worth describing or studying linguistically." This view is held by the majority and operates chiefly on the notion that the benefits of language lie in the ability to study it. As Moroccan Arabic has no historic literary texts or significance within the context of religion, they conclude that there is no significant value in learning it. (2005, p. 169)

The second, less significant opinion is held by progressive intellectuals, "who argue that Moroccan Arabic reflects Moroccan authenticity and cultural identity." The value that they see in Darija and vernacular language is one of contextualizing the lived experiences of Moroccan individuals. They see Darija as a means of communicating the un-curated realities of the general public. (Ennaji, 2005, p. 169)

French, on the other hand, provides a more complex discussion of the importance of language. By Ennaji's accounts, it seems that most Moroccans view the importance of French as a way to keep up with modernity and have a chance at relating to the rest of the world thanks to the added benefit of bilingualism. "Most Moroccan people favour the use of French hand in hand

with Standard Arabic. They are for a balanced type of bilingualism, for they are aware of the importance of French for achieving a modern education, social promotion, and economic success…For most Moroccans, French is synonymous with the Western way of life and modernity." (2005, p. 193)

Additionally, there are still three more motivations for and against the use of French in Moroccan society. The modernist discourse sees benefit in the use of French due to the argument that "access to the modern world is possible mainly through French." Modernists believe that the importance of language lies in its evolutionary role and its ability to integrate a country into the world economy and the international community. Arab-Islamic discourse quite simply argues that the implementation of French after independence "is an anachronism and a humiliation to Moroccan society." Finally, those in support of the cultural anthropological discourse, argue that "a foreign language like French is necessary for the individual's and nation's development." They are less concerned with the specification of the language itself but rather with the notion of languages coexisting via balanced domains of use. (Ennaji, 2005, p. 193)

Sub-Saharan Students in Morocco: determinants, everyday life, and future plans of a high skilled migrant group.

As implied by the name of this study, the sub-Saharan student interviews focus predominantly on their experiences leading up to, during, and after their academic pursuits in Morocco. This study involved many parts, including a reconnection with the interviewees after a period of six years in order to compare their expectations of the course of that time with reality.

The study opens with the exploration of what Morocco means to a transit migrant and how this role shapes the internal identity of Morocco as a transit country. "Although [sub-Saharan transit] migrants aimed to reach Europe, they would stop in North African countries,

including Morocco, sometimes for a considerable period of time. The kingdom's new awareness

of its African identity can therefore also be seen as a result of its role as a transit and destination

area for sub-Saharan migrants." (Berriane, 2016, p. 72)

Additionally, the role of Morocco as a stop for transit migration is amplified by the use of

European languages in-country and the potential of France or Spain as a destination country.

"For students originating from non-French-speaking West African countries, learning French

also played a major role in the choice of the country." (Berriane, 2016, p. 76) In this way, the

potential language barrier becomes an incentive for migration, in particular, with future plans to

migrate to Europe.

This observation brings attention to Moroccan's self-determined African identity, or lack

thereof. "There's a sentence that shocks every sub-Saharan student who arrives. It's when a

Moroccan intellectual says to them: 'You Africans'. These representations are perceived as

humiliation by sub-Saharan students since their professor's image of Africa is mainly influenced

by negative stereotypes." (Berriane, 2016, p. 81) The feelings of otherness are so strong here that

the identity of the student seems so far removed in the eyes of the professor that it is deemed

mutually exclusive to the subject's own identity. This experience relates back to Bentahar's

Continental Drift—the issue of the separation between North and sub-Saharan Africa is one that

exists with the academic sphere.

Berriane goes on to distinguish between the types of interactions the students have with

Moroccans in different scenarios. One example of these interactions is encounters had on the

street: "In addition to being seen as foreigners, [sub-Saharan students] often find themselves

treated like illegal immigrants." (2016, p. 80) The street provides a significant distance between

the parties involved. This provides an opportunity for Moroccans to rely solely on physical

appearance as an identifier, placing the student in the distant category of "other," thereby, in their minds, rationalizing the racist generalization that all black people in Morocco are illegal immigrants.

Encounters like these "lead to the development of a collective consciousness, or even a common identity in response to similar experiences. Given that the hostile, at times racist, behavior of many Moroccans is associated with their dark skin, this same aspect becomes an identifying factor among sub-Saharan students." In this instance, the primary identifier becomes a type of survival mechanism of sorts, in spite of a lack of true integration with the surrounding society. "Thus, the phenotype, origin of their stigmatization, becomes the reference point of their self-identification. (Berriane, 2016, p. 81)

Another scenario involves interactions in the working class neighborhoods of the students' residences: "They tend to enjoy warm friendships with neighboring families, who welcome them and adopt them into their own families." (Berriane, 2016, p. 80) Even though these neighborhoods may be in the same area as the streets where the students encountered racist treatment, the element of human contact allows the individuals involved to move past primary identifiers. Once physical appearance is no longer used to categorize otherness, the opportunity is allowed for the individuals to find commonalities or compatibility in their identities via secondary identifiers. It follows that even in the same areas that may perpetuate racist discrimination, human contact can eliminate the feelings of otherness that distance potentially compatible people with physical differences.

An example of human interaction surpassing primary identifiers and allowing for connections to be made via secondary identifiers is portrayed in the following excerpt:

Christine's account also illustrates the reciprocity of this distancing and how it is

reflected in the spatial organization of classes: "I had compatriots in the same class who,

hum, let's say were black, who had already formed a clan; and when I got there I saw the

blacks; well, I thought, I could go with the blacks, but that wasn't very good; I don't like

this clan business; so with that I thought no, I'm going to try to integrate; so I just

decided to sit anywhere in the class and that's how I came to speak to my neighbor in

class who became my first friend; her name is Mounia." (Berriane, 2016, p. 81)

There is, however, one type of secondary identifier that can sometimes become a barrier

to the rest: language. If communication becomes an issue as a result of language being too

significant a barrier, this could prove difficult for "others" to integrate. For example, "sub-

Saharan students are often more at ease speaking French, While Moroccan students prefer to

speak Arabic among themselves." (Berriane, 2016, p. 81)

Another type of secondary identifier that Berriane mentions is that of personal

experiences. "According to sub-Saharan students, the "ignorance" of their Moroccan classmates

also explains their behavior towards sub-Saharan students. By the act of coming to Morocco,

sub-Saharan students have had an experience of travel to a foreign country, which most of their

Moroccan classmates were lacking. (2016, p. 81)

In many cases, the sub-Saharan students had preconceptions of Morocco pre-migration

that were not consistent with what they encountered. "Despite this partial familiarity of Morocco

as a country, the actual migration is experienced as a break in the students' lives, given that their

stay abroad is frequently accompanied by significant obstacles and difficulties that challenge the

image that people in their home community have of Morocco." (Berriane, 2016, p. 77)

The idealistic interpretation of migration paired with the concept moving up in the world is confronted by instances of racism and linguistic challenges as well as other barriers that hinder the migrants' ability to integrate once in their host countries. This brings about the question of what does it mean to migrate successfully?

Berriane reveals that "very often, the experience of otherness during their stay has a profound effect on their worldview and students withdraw into sub-Saharan spaces in Morocco to define new forms of identity and belonging." (2016, p. 78) As a response to this mind-altering realization of reality, the students meet otherness with otherness, making the division reciprocal, as a means of a resolved—potentially false—sense of integration.

Methodology

The purpose of this study is to compile and compare the viewpoints of members of different social groups within the larger Moroccan context. For the purpose of this paper, the participants interviewed are used to represent three different elements of an integrative relationship. First, a sampling of the larger independent factor—that of the general population—is included in the form of the Moroccan university student interviews. Second, the international student interviews act as a control factor. Third, the accounts told by refugees represent the dependent relationship that their experiences have with the way that they are treated by the independent group. This distinction is not made to establish a relationship between this specific data so much as the relationships between the people involved in this study. In no way does this study intend to reinterpret the raw data in a way that does not stay true to the sentiments of those involved.

Qualitative Data Reasoning

From the beginning, the decision was made to focus on gathering qualitative data over quantitative data for a few reasons. Firstly, the time constraint of this project allowed for a more fruitful set of qualitative data than of quantitative data. Secondly, as previously mentioned, it is nearly impossible to find a trustworthy estimate of immigrants that reach Morocco because of the lack of information on clandestine migration. Thus, it seemed unproductive to make an attempt to include specific statistics within an unspecific context. Thirdly, the use of qualitative data was an attempt to remind the reader of the very human elements of this issue, something that quantitative data would not address.

Using a qualitative approach to frame this paper caters to the argument of interdependency between individuals, and by extension, between social groups. For the purpose of this study, the research seeks to incorporate and understand the interpretations members of the communities involved have of themselves and of others in order to address the heterogeneous and multifaceted issue of integration.

It is important to consider the opinions of all groups involved, so as to better consider feasible ways to address a lack of integration. For the purposes of this study, three different communities will be represented qualitatively: Moroccan university students, international university students studying in Morocco, and refugees living in Morocco. Though there are many other communities concerned and involved with the process of integration, this study makes an attempt to draw from the experiences of members of these communities to gain a better and clearer image of what integration looks like in the context of Morocco. The Moroccan university students were selected for this study primarily as a sub-community within the Moroccan population—this is not to say that the students' opinions are in any way representative of a

majority consensus across Morocco, but rather to identify sentiments that are present within the larger community. The international students and refugees were selected in order to present two potentially differing experiences of integration in Morocco. It is important to recognize that within the larger populations where integration is concerned, there are many different sub-communities with potentially very many different opinions and experiences.

Data Collection Details and Precautions

Due to the vulnerable populations involved in this study, consent was something that was deemed imperative from the very beginning. All of the interviewees included in this paper gave their consent for their direct quotes and ideas to be used for this study. There are two different types of consent that were obtained for this data. Interviewees of non-vulnerable populations gave their consent verbally while interviewees of vulnerable populations read and signed consent forms. In addition, the precaution of anonymity was included for interviewees of vulnerable populations.

Precautions were also made in the delivery of interview questions, particularly when there was reasonable concern for a guarded response, even if unconscious. An effort was made to make these interview questions as unbiased and non-leading as possible.

There is also the added complication of this study's own language barriers. An effort is made throughout this study to justify the sentiments behind quotes translated from French to English. For this reason, much of the data collected will not be presented in the form of direct quotations, but instead as a translation. It is the duty of both the researcher and the reader to consider the potential for miscommunication through translation and to recognize the difficulty of conveying and giving justice to the original quotations and opinions of the interviewees.

Mohammed V University

The Mohammed V University is located within Morocco's capital city of Rabat and was founded in 1957 under a royal decree. Sourcing of Moroccan university students was made possible thanks to sociolinguist, Dr. Said Bennis and his class. Two interviews were conducted, involving three university students, two of which opted to respond in English, and one in French. Due to the limitations of this study, direct quotes will only be presented for English responses and translations of the dialogue will be presented for the interview held in French. Sourcing of international students was made possible thanks to Balkis Sellimi, a Tunisian Mohammed V University student, herself, and by extension, to Professor Said Graiouid for the introduction. For the compilation of international student data, a small focus group was held in an array of languages. Balkis translated the Arabic dialogue.

It should be noted that often when Moroccans refer to Arabic, they mean collectively Darija and Fus'ha. This speaks to the married relationship that the two languages have within the context of Morocco—the former often being a mother tongue and language of casual conversation and the latter being used strictly in formal classroom settings due to being the language of literature and academic resources.

University Student Interviews

The Moroccan university student interviews represent a portion of the general public population of Morocco—the portion that was made available for interviewing—and thus, represent a portion of the independent factor of this study. The questions that follow were asked during audio recordings of the interviews. Responses were selected based on relevance.

What languages do you speak and in what contexts do you use them?

"I speak a lot of languages because my culture is mixed between Arabic and Amazigh

and I'm from Marrakech. So, I speak Arabic and Amazigh and I learned French and a little bit of

English. So, four languages I can speak." (Rashid, personal communication, December 5, 2017)

Sabrine chose to respond in French, saying that she speaks Arabic—her maternal

language, French—because it is the second language of Morocco and because of the academic

opportunities that are made available through the French language, English—mostly through

films and music that she listens to in her spare time, and that she is learning Spanish. (personal

communication, December 5, 2017)

Do you think that vernacular languages like Darija should continue to be used in Morocco?

There's a great debate right now in this issue, but in my opinion, I don't see the

importance of Darija, because it's just a mix between languages—vocabulary from

French, Arabic, Tamazight… it is not a self-dependent language. But, for me, if we

learned Arabic and used it in our daily life, as our ancestors did, we could develop

ourselves, do research in our mother language. But we just learn foreign languages.

Darija is our language but French and English are not helping us to develop ourselves.

(Rashid, personal communication, December 5, 2017)

How frequently do you use Darija at university?

"Every second. When I want to take a pen from my friends or ask the meaning of a

difficult term… I just ask him in Darija. We use it all the time." (Rashid, personal

communication, December 5, 2017)

Do you think that the use of French in the university setting is important/justified?

Mouad chose to respond in terms of the political relationship between Morocco and

France, "Morocco has a political relationship with the French, so the language is stable between

the two. We are not independent from the French. So, the French is necessary in Morocco."

(personal communication, December 5, 2017)

This question prompted Sabrine to talk about the use of French in the professional

community in a way that was unexpected. She spoke of the injustice in regard to the valorization

of individuals based on the languages that they speak. She said that she came to college with the

intent of continuing to study biology, but when she arrived, all of her classes were in French. As

she had previously taken all of her science courses in Arabic, the French biology jargon was not

something that she was familiar with, and thus, impeded her studies so much so that she decided

to change studies. Since then, she has met many different students with varying topics of study

and language backgrounds who have encountered the same issues. Sabrine makes the conclusion

that there are great linguistic flaws with the academic system as it stands. In her opinion, it

should be up to the discretion of the student what language they intend to study. (personal

communication, December 5, 2017)

Do you think that it would be essential for a visiting student to learn Darija?

"To communicate, it could be important. Because if you want to live here for a long time

period, you don't have a choice. You have to learn Darija to integrate and have great relations

with people. Even if you just learn a few words, people will accept it and you will be more

welcome in the society." (Rashid, personal communication, December 5, 2017)

As an example, Sabrine spoke of a friend from Côte d'Ivoire who has chosen to learn

Darija. She said that he gets along better because of this but that in her personal opinion, it does

not matter much whether students choose to learn Darija or not since most students know how to

speak French and often English. She specified that this is his choice and that he has elected to

learn Darija in order to gain a better sense of the community through it.

As a follow-up, the question was asked whether Sabrine thought that among her international friends, those who speak some Darija are better integrated into the community. She responded that in order to understand the community, the traditions, and the insinuations—while the language is key—it is beyond just understanding the words and not the sentiments behind them that truly leads to integration. Thus, she concludes that while Darija is necessary to truly integrate into Moroccan society, a student can get by without learning the language at all. (personal communication, December 5, 2017)

Do you think that it's important for migrants to learn Darija?

"It is very important, but not necessary. It's very interesting when you come to Morocco to make Moroccan friends to help you." (Mouad, personal communication, December 5, 2017) The point Mouad makes here is that though it would be very important for an immigrant to learn Darija, it is not necessary if they have Moroccan friends to help them. This does not satisfy the definition for integration as defined for the purposes of this study.

When the question was specified to address integration and self-sufficiency, Rashid replied with "There are a lot of people, foreign people, French people, who are running great firms or they're working here… they don't speak Arabic, they are integrated well and without any problems." (personal communication, December 5, 2017)

"To be brief, in Morocco, we don't have a language that we respect [more], and everybody must speak Darija. You can speak whatever you want and if you don't speak Arabic or Darija or French or English, people will make an effort to help you, to understand you." (Rashid, personal communication, December 5, 2017)

Sabrine responded to this by saying that if a migrant has the intent to integrate, Darija is very important, chiefly for the purpose of holing his or her own in a situation where they are

confronted with a person that wishes them harm. She adds that in order to understand the mentalities of Moroccans, one needs to know the language. (personal communication, December 5, 2017)

How do you define your identity as a Moroccan?

"It is a mix between multilanguage, religion—we are mostly Muslim, and we are open-minded. Because geographically, we are situated between Europe and the Atlantic, and the Mediterranean, so we have this heritage and we love people from everywhere." (Rashid, personal communication, December 5, 2017)

Sabrine thought about how to carefully answer the question. She first clarified that she is half-Moroccan and half-Egyptian. She then went on to discuss how that she finds it difficult to identify as a woman who wants to work hard and continue on to higher education within her community. She concludes that it is difficult to be a Moroccan but that even through the stubbornness that she encounters, Moroccans are very open, hospitable, and ready to help those who need it. (personal communication, December 5, 2017)

International University Student Interviews

The international university student interviews represent the control factor of this study. The quotes that follow were pulled from an audio recording of the focus group. Quotes were selected based on relevance.

When you find yourself out in Rabat, what language do you turn to for communication?

A Hungarian student, Marcus, responded that he often starts by speaking in Fus'ha and that "it seems like people have all the time in the world, here, but sometimes they just have enough and then switch to French." (personal communication, December 5, 2017)

A Vietnamese student, Ti, noted that the languages vary depending on the location. That in Rabat, people often speak in French as well as Darija but that in the countryside, they just speak Darija. (personal communication, December 5, 2017)

Marcus made the additional comment that "Most people are patient and they look so glad when you tell them that you actually learn their Arabic—even if you speak just a few words." (personal communication, December 5, 2017)

Do you notice any kind of a pattern between French and Darija language usage?

Ti pointed out that when Moroccans speak between themselves, they speak in Darija, but when they go to school, they speak in French." (personal communication, December 5, 2017)

Do you think that Darija would be useful for an international student to learn?

Marcus said that while he did think that Darija would be useful to learn during his time in Morocco, it wouldn't be necessary due to his short anticipated stay. (personal communication, December 5, 2017)

Ti added "If you want to stay here, you can learn to speak Darija. When you want to study real Arabic, you need to study Arabic classes." (personal communication, December 5, 2017)

Fondation Orient Occident

Fondation Orient Occident is a non-governmental organization located on the outskirts of Morocco's capital city, Rabat. Sourcing of refugees was made possible thanks to Sydney Chuen, a fellow student and intern at the foundation. Three interviews were conducted with three refugees, one of which opted to respond in English, and two in French. Due to the limitations of this study, direct quotes will only be presented for English responses and translations of the

dialogue will be presented for the interview held in French. Sydney assisted me in translating the French dialogue.

Refugee Interviews

The refugee interviews represent the dependent factor of this study. The questions that follow were asked during voice recordings of the interviews. Due to precautions of anonymity, the refugees will be referred to as Interviewee A, B, or C. Responses were selected based on relevance.

What languages do you speak and in what contexts do you use them?

Interviewee B responded by saying that he only uses French in Morocco, though he does know a little bit of Darija, which he uses to buy food. (personal communication, December 5, 2017)

Interviewee C said that he speaks his Guinean mother-tongue and a little bit of French, English, and Darija. (personal communication, December 5, 2017)

How comfortable are you learning/speaking Darija?

Interviewee C responded that Darija is not his language, and thus, does not use it often. When he does use Darija, it's because he is obliged to, not voluntarily. (personal communication, December 5, 2017)

Do you think you need Darija to integrate?

Interviewee B said that it is necessary to use Darija in order to integrate. (personal communication, December 5, 2017)

Are you able to find communities that speak your mother tongue?

Interviewee C said that while he has found other people that speak his mother-tongue at the Fondation, most people communicate in French. (personal communication, December 5, 2017)

Can you speak to any experiences you've had regarding language and/or race being a barrier for integration?

Interviewee B responded that when he speaks Darija to Moroccans, they laugh at him because it's bad. (personal communication, December 5, 2017)

Interviewee C said that learning Darija doesn't interest him because the first thing that Moroccans do when they speak to him is insult him. (personal communication, December 5, 2017)

Anonymous Interview A did not hold to a typical interview structure, but instead took the form of a conversation. For this reason, this interviewee's quotes have been separated. Below, are some of the notable quotes from our discussion:

"It's of no use staying in a place where you can't associate with the kind of people that you want to associate with and you can't do the things that you want to do…Without that, I don't think English[-speaking] people have room yet—and we don't feel at home."

"Some Arab people though you speak English to them, they'll tell you 'Oh, I don't speak English' and some of them, they do speak English… they don't want that relationship."

"[Moroccans] cannot really get associated with you when you are not Moroccan and they have the mindset that once you are not here for studying, here for work… you are—they call it "azia"—you are dirty, you are poor."

"It's not that Morocco isn't a developed country, it's a good country, there are good individuals. It's the ones we meet every day in our life; the people we meet every day that

determine if you can be comfortable… I am not going to meet with the governor, I am not going to meet with the king. I'm going to meet with the people, the individuals that live with me every day, that I see every day around me… and in all that I have seen, it's not a welcoming place. It's not a place that I can comfortably say 'OK, I want to stay.'"

"I don't speak [French] because I want to make friends or relate to Moroccans. I only speak it because I always deal with French[-speaking] people. Because Moroccans make it seem like, 'Blacks, you are from Africa.'"

"Moroccans that have traveled outside of Morocco, at least they are a bit better, because now they are out of Morocco, they have seen other people, they have seen other traditions."

"So now we, 'the blacks,' from Nigeria, from Côte d'Ivoire, from Kenya—as long as we are black, even if we are French[-speaking] people—we are together, we are 'Africans.'"… "Even when they try to admit that they are African, they still say that 'you are black and I am white.' So, the color is a barrier and the language is a barrier."

"Not just the color—because the color is one big huge problem in the whole world now… The color is really a problem. But outside the color, language is another thing. So we, English[-speaking] people, we don't feel comfortable, we don't feel happy, we don't feel relieved. And even outside that, there is no job, there is no way to go to school… We are not welcome."

"I wasn't thinking of going to school, I wasn't thinking of anything… I was just thinking of waking up and leaving… But now, that mentality has changed. And I want more. I want to go out to the world and… I want people to know what is happening. Because I have been through so many things."

"I don't want to go to school because I want people to know that I went to school, because I have my masters, no. I don't want to school because I want to have a certificate. I want to go to school so I can be educated."

"I have a lot of experience, I have a lot of things to say, I have a lot of things to share… But it's not going to be possible when I am not even educated. So how do I even go out? Where do I start?"

"Language is a barrier, color is a barrier, but the key to everything is education."

"I want to take advantage of myself now because people have taken advantage of me and I see the way they enjoy it, I see the way they have pleasure with it, so now I want to do something. I want to know myself, take advantage of myself, and have that same pleasure—and more. To be happy when I'm taking advantage of myself, rather than people taking advantage of me."

"So that is just it. It is very terrible, living in a county where you can't feel at home. Somewhere where you are not welcome."

(Anonymous Interviewee A, personal communication, December 5, 2017)

Discussion

One element for comparison is the stark contrast between refugee and international student experiences with Darija. While refugees felt marginalized for using the language, international students felt accepted and celebrated, in some cases, for using Darija. In my personal experience as a student here in Morocco, I was allotted a great deal of patience by taxi drivers, shop owners, and general members of society for the minimal extent of Darija I was familiar with. The general reaction I experienced with the language was surprise and excitement.

By contrast, anonymous interviewee B describes learning Darija for the sake of getting a meal, but being criticized—even by his Moroccan acquaintances—for his usage of the language.

Another issue is that of bilingualism. In the case of refugees who begin to learn Darija, they are forced into doing so because of a lack of acceptance and/or usage of French. This is striking because of the role that French plays in the society of Morocco. While many Moroccans elect to learn French and are granted more opportunities in life because of this, refugees are forced to turn to Darija though many of them are fluent in a language held in very high regard in the surrounding community.

Due to language dynamics in Morocco, the issue of *elite* and *non-elite bilingualism* arises. "Those bilinguals who have attracted most attention among classicists, implicitly at least, might be called in the current jargon 'elite bilinguals', that is members of the educated classes who had freely chosen to become bilingual. I say 'freely chosen' because there are other bilinguals who have no such choice." (Adams, 2003, p. 9) The element of being able to choose freely is an important distinction. The majority of sub-Saharan migrants who make the journey to Morocco are francophone. Due to the dynamics of French and Arabic languages in Morocco, francophone migrants are forced into some level of bilingualism if they intend to truly integrate. This bilingualism is in great contrast to the bilingualism that most bilingual Moroccans share.

This elite form of bilingualism is an extension of *linguistic choice*, or, the active usage of any given language based on the associations that language has within a multilingual society (Adams, 2003, p. 356) "Language practices (including code-switching and language choice in bilingual settings) may be 'bound up in the creation, exercise, maintenance or change of relations of power' (Heller 1995 : 159)." (Adams, 2003, p. 383) Non elite-bilingualism, by definition, does not allow such freedom of choice. With or without the element of choice a *linguistic*

identity is formed. This concept entails the association within a community due to the language(s) used within that community. Because language acts as a barrier to exclusive realms, whether in the form of educated or integrated communities, linguistic identity is formed on both sides of the barrier, thus creating a distal relationship determined by a lack of the secondary identifier, language.

Berriane brings up an interesting observation in Sub-Saharan students in Morocco. She points out that "Very often, the experience of otherness during their stay has a profound effect on their worldview and students withdraw into sub-Saharan spaces in Morocco to define new forms of identity and belonging." (Berriane, 2016, p. 78) This quote exemplifies the effects of structurally-prompted feelings of otherness leading to a response of exclusion from society as a 'solution.' It is important to note that while the exclusion is somewhat self-implemented, it is more largely a response to the inhospitable nature of the surrounding community and perpetuated otherness felt by the host community that push migrant communities away and frame withdrawal as a more prosperous option than integration. These new definitions of identity and belonging further distance the excluded migrant communities from Moroccan citizens and the national identity.

Limitations of This Study

All things considered, this is without a doubt an imperfect study. As the researcher, I experienced many language barriers of my own. Had the plans for this study included more time and resources, it would have been nice to develop a more standard procedure of translating and processing the language presented to me in languages other than English. An additional limitation that I considered from the beginning of the study period, was that of my positionality. It was important to come into the project conscious of my place in this community, not just as a

foreign student, but also as an American. Though it was my intent not to let this affect my research, it would be naïve to assume that hierarchies of power and privilege did not factor into the collection of data.

Throughout the study and data collection, it was important to me to keep in mind the fact that this research would in no way benefit the subjects of my study directly. It is also a naïve and privileged notion to come to a foreign country with the hopes of studying a topic of interest and changing anything about the situation as it stands.

Conclusions and Future Study

In summation, the process of integration confronts barriers that are two-fold. The first is the barrier of that which is instantaneous to the eye: physical appearance. Once this barrier is passed, the less obvious factors of identity come into play. In the Moroccan context, the secondary identifier that provides the most concern is that of language. To quote anonymous interviewee A, "Not just the color—because the color is one big huge problem in the whole world now… The color is really a problem. But outside the color, language is another thing." (personal communication, December 5, 2017)

There are many different elements related to this study that I came across during data collection that could prove to be fruitful avenues for future study. These questions include:

How may the growing ease of maintaining relations with geographically remote communities in origin countries (via social media, cell phones, etc.) affect the linguistic integration of migrants? — This question may address what we can expect migration to look like in the future.

What elements of the development of self-identity are contributing to feelings of otherness? What are the primary and secondary identifiers that contribute most to the exclusion

and inclusion of communities within a society? Though this is in many ways an all-encompassing issue, I believe there are elements within this conversation that may be clarified upon psychological explanation.

How prominent is solidarity across marginalized groups in the Moroccan context? — This question was brought about by a quote from Berriane's study: "However, while sub-Saharan students feel concerned about the situation of their 'irregular' countrymen, they also distance themselves radically from them, although they very often share the same aspirations to emigrate." (2016, p. 82)

Throughout this study, I realize that I have made the assumption that to integrate is to migrate successfully. I would be curious to expand this study to include what it means to migrant communities to migrate successfully, this assumption aside. With all of these directions in mind, it is clear that the topic of integration is especially important at a time when migratory pressures confront individuals and governments in all parts of the world.

Glossary of Terms

Arabization	The structural replacement of French with Arabic in the public sphere of Morocco, post-independence
Darija	Moroccan dialectical Arabic; a vernacular language
Elite bilingualism	Bilingualism as utilized by "members of the educated classes who had freely chosen to become bilingual" (Adams, 2003, p. 9)
Fus'ha	Modern Standard Arabic
Integration	The inclusion of a once-foreign member of a community to the extent that he or she is self-sufficiently a member, without the reliance of others in order to participate in and receive the benefits of the community
Internal migration	Migration that occurs within national borders
Linguistic choice	The active choice to use any given language based on the associations of that language within a multilingual society. (Adams, 2003, p. 356)
Linguistic identity	The association within a community due to the language(s) used within that community.
Migrant	May refer to any individual who moves with the intent of changing his or her own life, not the lives of those within the destination community

Non-elite bilingualism	Bilingualism as utilized by individuals who do not belong to educated classes or classes of high social standing; bilingualism that does not fall under elite-bilingualism (Adams, 2003, p. 14)
Otherness	A divisive sentiment felt between communities or individuals upon interaction, instigated by an assumed difference in identity, and often leading to isolation on one or both sides
Primary identifier	Element of one's identity that can be observed instantaneously (i.e. physical appearance)
Racism	A belief or doctrine that one community, as identified by race, is inherently superior than another
Refugee	"Someone who has been forced to flee his or her country because of persecution, war, or violence. A refugee has a well-founded fear of persecution for reasons of race, religion, nationality, political opinion or membership in a particular social group." (UNHCR)
Secondary identifier	Element of one's identity that cannot be observed instantaneously (e.g. language, religion, likes and dislikes)
Transit migrants	Migrants passing through—or intending to pass through—multiple countries before reaching their destinations
Vernacular language	A language learned as a mother tongue and not utilized with the intent of being professional

Works Cited

Adams, J. N. (2003). *Bilingualism and the Latin Language.* Cambridge University Press.

Alalou, A. (2009). "Francaphonie in the Magreb: A Study of Language Attitudes among Moroccan Teachers of French." *The French Review , 82* (3), 558-579.

al-Mousawi, N. (2014). "Sub-Saharan African migrants invisible in Morocco." al-Monitor .

Bentahar, Z. (2011). "Continental Drift: The Disjunction of North and sub-Saharan Africa." *Research in African Literatures , 42* (1), 1-13.

Berriane, J. (2016). "Sub-Saharan students in Morocco: determinants, everyday life, and future plans of a high-skilled migrant group." In M. Berriane, H. de Haas, & K. Natter (Eds.), *Revisiting Moroccan Migrations* (pp. 71-87). Routledge.

De Bel-Air, F. (2016, April). "Migration Profile: Morocco." Retrieved from European University Institute.

de Haas, H. (2014, March 19). "Morocco: Setting the Stage for Becoming a Migration Transition Country?"

Ennaji, M. (2005). *Multilingualism, Cultural Identity, and Education in Morocco.* Springer Science+Business Media, Inc.

Goldschmidt, E. (2006). "Storming the Fences: Morocco and Europe's Anti-Migration Policy." *Middle East Research , MER239* .

Morocco World News. (2015). "Illiteracy Rate in Morocco Decreases to 32 Percent."

Morocco World News. (2017, February 14). "Undocumented Immigrants: Morocco Recieves 16,000 Regularization Requests."

Pulitzer Center. (2017, August 4). "Morocco Embraces Multilingualism."

UNHCR. (n.d.). What is a Refugee - UNHCR. Retrieved from UNHCR - The UN Refugee Agency: https://www.unrefugees.org/refugee-facts/what-is-a-refugee/